

**AN ANALYSIS OF SERVICE DELIVERY PROTESTS AND THEIR IMPLICATIONS ON THE
ECONOMIC STABILITY OF MUSINA MUNICIPALITY: 2007-2014**

By

**ROFHIWA PHASWANA
Student Number: 11550621**

**Submitted in fulfilment for the Masters of Arts degree in
Political Sciences**

Department of Development Studies

School of Human and Social Sciences

UNIVERSITY OF VENDA

THOHOYANDOU, LIMPOPO

Supervisor : Prof. R.R Molapo

Co-Supervisor : Dr. P Dzimiri

2018

Abstract

The adoption of the constitution in 1996 has opened a new era of establishing a local government system that recommended that municipalities be established for the whole territory of the republic of South Africa. The white paper on “Local Government adopted by Cabinet in March 1998 outlined framework and programmes to guide municipalities to commit to work with citizens and groups within the communities to find sustainable ways to meet their social, economic and material needs to improve the quality of their lives”. Since 2007 epidemic service delivery protests started to be a national problem where 80 percentages of service delivery protests between the periods of 2007-2014 were violent. For instance, Musina Municipality experienced violent service delivery during the period of 2007-2014 where its properties, economy and people’s lives were in stake. Therefore, this study was driven by the need to analyse the implications of service delivery protests on the economy of Musina Municipality.

A qualitative method approach to investigate the problem of service delivery protests implications on stability and economy in Musina Municipality will be used. A case study regarding service delivery effectiveness and violence used by people as a response and expression of a plea to be heard by their municipality will be investigated.

KEY WORDS: Batho Pele principles, communication, economy, non-compliance, service delivery protests.

Declaration

I, **Rofhiwa Phaswana** declare that this full research dissertation titled “**An analysis of service delivery protests and their implications on the economic stability of Musina municipality**” is my own work in design and execution and that all sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

.....

01 March 2018

Rofhiwa Phaswana

Date

Dedication

I dedicate this study to my late grandmother Mrs Munzhedzi Phaswana, Josius Phaswana, Florence Phaswana, my wife Mulalo Ramavhona, my children Ndiene and Roana Phaswana and the community of Musina Municipality.

Acknowledgements

I wish to acknowledge the special people who tirelessly motivated and assisted me throughout my study. My gratitude goes to my supervisor, Professor Molapo Richard and my co-supervisor Dr Dzimiri Patrick who devoted their time to make my study a success.

I would also like to give thanks to all the people who participated in the development of my study throughout.

My family has given me exceptional support that I won't forget in my life time. My children Ndiene and Roana Phaswana gave me strength to work harder.

Above all I thank God who gave me strength and people who were willing to make my study a success story.

Acronyms

ANC	: African National Congress
BRICS	: Brazil, Russia, India, China, South Africa
CEO	: Chief Executive Officer
COGTA	: Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs
COGHSTA	: Cooperative Governance, Human Settlements and Traditional Affairs
COSATU	: Congress of South Africa Trade Union
HSRC	: Human Sciences Research Council
IDP	: Integrated Development Plan
Lt Gen	: Lieutenant General
MEC	: Member of Executive Council
NDP	: National Development Plan
RDP	: Reconstruction and Development Programme
S.A	: South Africa
SALGA	: South Africa Local Government Association
SAMWU	: South Africa Municipal Workers Union
SANCO	: South Africa National Civic Organisation
SAPS	: South African Police Services
SAPA	: South Africa Press Association
SDBIP	: Service Delivery Budget and Implementation Plan
SIU	: Special Investigations Unit
STATS SA	: Statistics South Africa
SMS	: Short Message Service

TABLE OF CONTENTS	PAGE
Abstract	i
Declaration	ii
Dedication	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Acronyms	v

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION TO AN ANALYSIS OF SERVICE DELIVERY PROTESTS AND THEIR IMPLICATIONS ON THE ECONOMIC STABILITY OF MUSINA MUNICIPALITY

1 Introduction	1
1.1 Problem Statement	2
1.2 Research Aims, Objectives and Questions	2
1.3 Literature Review	3
1.4 Research Methodology and Data Collection	10
1.4.1 Qualitative methodology	10
1.4.2 Data analysis and interpretation	11
1.4.3 Ethical considerations	11
1.5 Structure of the study	12

CHAPTER TWO

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND DATA COLLECTION

2.1 Introduction	14
2.2 Data collection techniques	14
2.2.1 Interviews	15
2.2.1.1 Semi-structured open-ended interviews	15
2.2.1.2 Semi-structured in-depth individual interviews	15
2.2.1.3 Analysis of Musina Municipality and government documents	16
2.2.2 Literature sources	17

2.3 Validity and reliability of the instruments exercised	18
2.3.1 Internal validity	18
2.3.2 External validity	18
2.3.3 Reliability	19
2.4 Conclusion	19

CHAPTER THREE

CAUSES OF SERVICE DELIVERY PROTESTS: IMPLICATIONS AND SOLUTIONS

3.1 Introduction	20
3.2 Integrated Development Plans	20
3.3 Communities' structures and ordinary citizens	21
3.4 Communication and negotiations breakdown	21
3.5 Misperceptions as source of uncertainty	23
3.5.1 Sustaining the mistrust complexity	24
3.6 Accountability challenges	26
3.7 Recruitment policies within local government	27
3.8 Non-compliance to regulations	28
3.9 Basic services exclusion	30
3.10 Violent culture inheritance	31
3.11 Economic Policy Transformation	32
3.12 Lack of formal education and awareness campaigns	34
3.13 Corruption Allegations	35
3.14 Solutions to causes of service delivery protests	36
3.15 Conclusion	36

CHAPTER FOUR

A CRITICAL ASSESSMENT OF POVERTY AND UNEMPLOYMENT ON HOW THEY AFFECT MUNICIPAL FINANCIAL AFFAIRS

4.1 Introduction	38
4.2 Democratization of the economy	38
4.3 Intergovernmental logistical arrangements	39
4.4 Reforming the Government tender system	40
4.5 Monopoly domination of economy	41
4.6 Small enterprises support	42
4.7 Failure to grow the economy	43
4.8 Alignment of the IDP and SDBIP	44
4.9 Activism and active citizenry	46
4.10 Impact of unemployment and inequality on the economy	47
4.11 Generational mix enforcement in the work force	49
4.12 Solutions	50
4.13 Conclusion	50

CHAPTER FIVE

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE MUNICIPALITY AND ITS COMMUNITIES

5.1 Introduction	51
5.2 Citizens participation	51
5.3 Accountability of elected and non-elected representatives	52
5.4 Too defensive to accept responsibility	54
5.5 Policy coherence	55

5.6 Brinton's theory of common factors/conditions of revolutions	58
5.7 The intergovernmental problems	58
5.8 The influence of local labour movements	59
5.9 Economic and political challenges	60
5.10 Conclusion	61

CHAPTER 6

DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

6.1 Introduction	62
6.2 Data analysis and interpretation of the results	62
6.2.1 Description of qualitative data collected	62
6.2.1.1 Musina-Nancefield, Madimbo and Tshipise data	62
6.2.1.2 Political analysts	74
6.3 Municipality representatives	77
6.4 The municipality documents	78
6.5 Research ethical consideration	79
6.6 Conclusion	79

CHAPTER 7

GENERAL CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 Introduction	80
7.2 Findings	80
7.2.1 Musina municipality	80
7.2.2. IDP Musina municipality 2011/2012	81
7.2.2.1 Basic service delivery	81
7.2.2.2 Indigent policy	82
7.2.2.3 Priority focus area	82

7.2.3 Community leaders	83
7.2.4 Political analysts	84
7.3 Recommendations for improving service delivery	84
7.3.1 Dealing with non-compliance in communities	85
7.3.2 Improving communication	85
7.3.3 Improving adherence to social contract	86
7.3.4 Improving political inclusion	86
7.3.5 Improving awareness	87
7.4 Limitations of the study	87
7.5 Recommendations for further study	88
7.6 Conclusion	88
References	90
Appendices	97
Appendix 1: Interview Transcripts	97
Appendix 2: List of respondents	118

CHAPTER ONE

1 Introduction

In March 1998 the South African Cabinet outlined a crucial framework to guide local governments on how they should make provisions for basic services and sustainable ways to meet communities' needs such as social, economic and material needs. This was a strategy adopted by the cabinet to have local governments that deliver services to the people. During the apartheid era local governments were racial- based. The democratic government in post-apartheid [South Africa] committed itself to provide basic services to the people such as water, housing, sanitation and etc regardless to race and geographical settings (The White Paper on local government 9 March 1998)

There are processes that local governments follow when rendering services that includes consulting and feasibility. Public participation when formulating Integrated Development Plans is critical for local governments to understand the needs of the people per demarcated wards. Local governments consider various community structures such as church leaders, traditional leaders, civics, ward committee members and others as representatives of the people. The communication between community stakeholders and the local governments employees are of crucial importance to keep each other on the loop when there are developments and challenges to achieve the interests of the citizens. Failures by local governments to render basic services to the citizens cause hostility between the two. Miscommunication between government and the public often leads to frustrations and fractions.

The government backbone document on service delivery, the Batho Pele principles highlight the framework that guides its employees on how they should treat their clients. The principles document states that in order for the government to improve its quality services it should consult its people on services they want and inform its people about the level and quality of the services it should render amongst other core principles.

The assumption of this study is that accountability from both local government and citizens to protect government and non-governmental infrastructures from vandalizing can boost the economy and instils stability. This study makes an assumption that compliance to peaceful protests can bring stability conducive to economic boom in the Musina Municipality jurisdictional

areas. This study also makes an assumption that the commitment to social contract by the municipality to render effective service delivery to the people can end protests that affect economy. Through communication and engagements Musina Municipality can calm unnecessary riots caused by communications breakdown.

1.1 Problem Statement

The non-compliance by the protesters to protect state infrastructures has raised serious questions on the effectiveness of policy framework (Gathering Act 205 of 1993) established by government to govern protests. The right of protesters to protest peacefully and their responsibility to protect public property if not exercised cautiously threaten public order and the economic stability of the municipality.

1.2 Research Aim, Objectives and Questions

1.2.1 Research Aim

The aim of this study is to critically examine service delivery protests implications on the economic stability of Musina Municipality.

1.2.2 Research Objectives

In order to address the specified research questions the study will seek to achieve these objectives:

- To analyse why protesters resort to non compliance mechanisms during protests and the effectiveness of government policy in controlling non-compliance.
- To investigate the municipality commitment to fulfil its social contract to render effective service delivery to the people.
- To find out the state of communication between the municipality and its community.

1.2.3 Research Questions

Significantly this research will answer the following key questions:

- Why is the government protest policy framework not effective in dealing with non-compliance during service delivery protests?
- Did the Musina Municipality fail to fulfil its social contract to render service delivery in an effective mode to the people?
- Why did the community resort to public violence if there was smooth communication between them and the municipality in relation to giving feedbacks about developments and challenges?

The assumption fundamental to this research is that compliance by the protesters to protest peacefully, the commitment of government to tighten its policy to administer protests and instil “Batho Pele” principles to be adhered to by public servants can end the problem.

1.3 Literature review

There are various scholars such as Trevor Ngwane, Azwifaneli Managa and Peter Alexander who have researched about service delivery protests in South Africa and around the globe whose literature reviews will be of high importance in this research. Various scholars have done a remarkable work in investigating the causes of service delivery protests across South African municipalities and around the globe; however the implications of damage caused by violent protests on the stability and economy were not fully explored. This study will bridge the knowledge gaps around the implications of service delivery protests on the stability and the economy of Musina Municipality in particular as the area of focus. Most of the scholars argue that service delivery protests strengthen local government performance; however, they denounce the acts of violence as a solution to frustrations.

Ngidi (2013) has noted the importance of the Batho Pele (People First) principles as they provide a framework about how public services should be provided to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of the Public Service. He argues that “Adherence to the principles guarantee the provision of excellent services that meet the people’s needs and expectations, enhance customer satisfaction, while upholding the government’s promise that access to decent public services is no longer a privilege to be enjoyed by a few, but the rightful expectation of all citizens”. He emphasized the need for government to incorporate the principles of “Consultation, Service standards, Access, Courtesy, Information, Openness and transparency, Redress and Value of money” in the performance contracts of all employees so that they can be assessed

based on them. The 'Batho Pele' principles are the founding charter of government that serves as a social contract between the government and the public. It underlies the commitment of government to serve the public with dedication and respect at all times.

Community challenges that the government fails to address their social needs have made ordinary communities embark on protests demanding better services. Local government's core role is to deliver services to the people as stated in the constitution of the country and that is the reason why municipalities were created. Apartheid system which racially segregates black people from whites has been used by apartheid government to sideline black people in benefiting from the government service delivery programmes. This trend has created inequality in society and 1994, the year of new the democratic South Africa, has been earmarked by ordinary blacks as a path of social and economic transformation to challenge the bondages created by apartheid going forward. "It is tempting to note that the mass protests, demonstrations and violent confrontations that have been taking place are a direct result of the culmination of numerous frustrations often building up over a long period of time" (Atkinson 2007).

In his article "Poor service delivery leads to death" (2011), Ditshego cites service delivery as one of the key mandates of the government and points out that the South African constitution clearly states that every citizen is entitled to a better service. Therefore, it is a legitimate right for every citizen of South Africa to protest if they are dissatisfied with the service that the government is rendering to the people. The government has as well given the SAPS a mandate to protect citizens against any threats or criminal activities against humanity and property as well as the power to maintain order and fight against those who break the law. "The death of one protester in the Free State town in Ficksburg on 13th April 2011, allegedly at the hands of the SAPS, has outraged many people across the country ", Ditshego. The protest was caused by what the protesters regard as poor service delivery and lack of consultation by the government amongst other things (Ditshego 2011).

Christianson (2011) argues in his article "Understanding Service Delivery Protests" that the stability of South Africa resides on the success of the service delivery process. He also argues that "delivery" and its implications have not been effectively explored. He furthermore argued that new delivery in South Africa happens overwhelmingly through clientelist relationships that he described as "a system in which "patrons" or local "big men" appropriated public goods for

“their” local constituency in return for political support. In modern democracies ruling parties are referred as patrons and their supporters or power base referred as their clients” (Christianson 2011). This literally means that clients keep their patrons in power if they deliver services to them. When the patrons fail to intensify the social and material interests of the clientelist this often leads to service delivery protests. The stability of the country is intertwined with service delivery.

According to researcher and an activist Ngwane (2014), he argued in his South African Civil Society Information Service (SACIS) interview that the protests stem from dissatisfaction among those who have been left behind in the new South Africa. He observed that people protest because of the poor quality of service delivery and representation, which means the people are dissatisfied with the way their public representatives are representing their case. He challenged that democracy shouldn't be about sense of electing representatives to represent the people but how they improve the lives of those who elected them. A local activist in Sebokeng Pharks Khaiyane was quoted by Aljazeera Media Network Online saying “When you call a meeting and speak to them (local officials) it's like you are speaking another language. But when you burn tyres, that language is understood.” He furthermore expressed his radical voice by saying “When people protest and burn tyres and blood is shed, that is when you get a response” (Serino 2014).

Researchers Alexander, Runciman and Ngwane (2014) argue that “Protesters come from a tiny minority of the population that is resentful because, unlike everybody around them, they have not benefited from expansion of basic services”. They however argue that genuine and understandable dissatisfaction must not lead to unacceptable behaviour but be channelled into legitimate ways of persuasion. In their study they challenged the notion of categorising community protests as being “about service delivery” because it underestimates the importance of other problems such as representation, corruption, jobs and crime. They also raise a critical point that even where services are major concern people usually complain about the quality of services delivered to them than just absolute failure to deliver. Their study also noted the point that the means of handling problems carry potential of minimising conflict, and stated dishonesty and arrogance by government as one of the issues that fuels disorder. The study also noted that residents dwelling in the informal settlements were more likely to protests as compared to their counterparts because even if they may have basic needs corruption, uncaring councillors and poor quality services affect them most.

Manala (2010) has argued that it is the constitutional right of those who suffer under poor or a lack of services delivery to protest and suggested that “the only way open to them for expression of their grievances, dissatisfaction and demands since they were not afforded opportunity and a hearing”. Manala also argued that some of the protests are reminiscent of the apartheid-era protests that were violent and vandalistic to valuable properties. He furthermore denounced the use of police brutality and militarization trends of dealing with protests because these incite anger and frustrations of communities to resort to violence. However, he concluded that communities’ lack of participation in the local government structures and processes are the causes of community protests and using anger to display their frustrations (Manala 2010).

According to the Institute for Security Studies (ISS) one of the primary reasons for service delivery protest is dissatisfaction with the delivery of basic municipal services such as running water, electricity and toilets provision especially in informal settlements (ISS 2009). The institute also posited that unemployment (officially around 23%) at the time, high level of poverty, poor infrastructure and the lack of houses in other poor communities add to the growing dissatisfaction. The protests are the results of political promises during election period where the democratic government promised that areas of concerns from the public would be addressed post 1994. This claim was further supported by Prof Nico le Roux from the School of Public Management and Administration at the University of Pretoria where he highlighted that the 2004 elections were followed by similar demonstrations in 21 local municipalities in different parts of the country for similar reasons. The institute also provided allegations of corruption and nepotism in local municipalities as reasons that cause public protests. When unqualified workers are offered positions in local governments due to their political affiliations this undermines adequate service delivery provisions.

The Municipal IQ (Municipal Data and Intelligence) on its Press Release: Ghordan’s top 10 priorities (2014) suggested top ten priorities for then Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs (Cogta) Minister Pravin Gordhan in 2014 when he was appointed. The first priority was for Ghordan was to bring decisive leadership to the sector to consolidate authority and leadership to revive local government. The second priority was to address service delivery protests and backlogs notably in rural areas. The third priority was to integrate responses across government especially around human settlements. The fourth priority was for Cogta to address wasteful spending and culture of non-compliance to ensure regulations were adhered

to. The fifth priority was for Cogta to unlock infrastructure to promote dynamic financial avenues for the sector. The sixth priority was for Cogta to improve city development to leverage the well-functioning of the economy that can create jobs and alleviate poverty and inequality. The seventh priority was to integrate the National Development Plan as a strategy of providing oversight to local municipalities to root out corruption and strengthen governance. The eighth priority was to improve audit outcomes and ensuring that qualified financial experts were employed to avoid underperforming by local municipalities. The ninth priority was to tackle debt and ensure that municipalities collect their revenues and strengthen the municipal billing system. The tenth priority was to restructure grants to remove financial constraints that compromise service delivery and governance.

The Chamber of Commerce and Industry Chief Executive Officer (CEO) Neren Rau said “Investors have many countries to choose from, strikes do not help anyone.” Furthermore one of the economists of South Africa complemented the statement thus, “Most industries would be able to make up the lost output within a week, economist Mike Schussler said.” By this he implied that he was mindful of the fact that investors are more concerned about the stability in market and the country more than any other factors. Investors are mindful of their investment profits; any factors that threaten their profits lead them to consider investing elsewhere and this result in job losses and poverty (Anderson 2010).

Communication breakdown between municipalities and the communities is one of the driving factors that lead to protests. If municipalities do not communicate with the communities regarding their plans and updates on all promises to the communities they get frustrated and start creating unrest environment to be heard (Sebugwawo 2012).

Public opinion polls and extensive research on the public perceptions of local government show a consistent and worrying point of view, that the municipalities have not learnt anything with the outbreak of protests and demonstrations across the country (Good Governance Survey Reports, 2007, 2011). Atkinson (2007) observes that “at municipal level, protesters have regularly complained about unresponsiveness of officials and councillors.” This observation clearly outlines that it is not always the case that ordinary people complain recline on water, housing and water taps as many believe but even on the political engagements matters. In the events where there is no direct linkage in the local government between the council and the

constituencies, it is not easy to hold officials accountable for the failures of effective service delivery to the communities (Atkinson 2007).

In his research 'Circling the Square of Protests: Democracy, Development, Delivery and Discontent in Bekkersdal' Fakir (2014) noted that the "Failure in government has led to a contestation for control of the local state as a site of capital accumulation. A real, rather than an imagined crisis of representation, responsiveness and accountability, together with ethical erosion and the deepening cancer of corruption at all level of state management has seen the state emerging as a key site of accumulation". In his view the state is used as subordination to political interests and both the state and political interests are subordinated to economic interest. He furthermore observed that protests are used as disruption to politicians who don't hear the people's plea and government that fails to account. Good governance advocates such as Kimemia (2011) calls the municipal failure to respond to citizens' concerns "the Marie Antoinette's type of arrogance" where the emperor's wife once joked to the poor French masses that if it is hard to find bread people should resort to [eating] cakes.

According to Managa (2012), a research assistant in the Africa Institute of South Africa, "political campaign manifestos has also created discomforts when politicians make temporary promises mostly likely to satisfy voters during and new election campaign. Politicians raise people's expectations when they make false promises that suggest that communities will receive promised services after the elections". Most manifestos from almost all political parties that contest local government elections are coined within the principles of improving service delivery, alleviating poverty and injustices for communities. Politics as a discourse is one of the biggest contributors of service delivery protest. When propagandas used by politicians for canvassing are not met people use protest to voice their disappointment.

This is the reminiscent of what the philosopher Aristotle argues in his philosophy "Causes of revolution in politics" that "revolutions arise from inequalities, numerical or qualitative-from a numerical mass claiming equality denied them, or from a minority claiming superiority denied them". He also argues that oligarchy is less permanent than a democracy, owing to factions within the oligarchy body (Aristotle 350 BCE). Majority rules in a democratic society; the view of the majority usually reigns against of the minority opposed to the views of the majority. In that regard, communities use protest to show their authorities that they are the ones who created

them and they should be given what they want. The arrogance of those in power to ignore the will of the majority who desires equality and prosperity fuels anger to the less privileged to act.

According to researcher Tlou (2014), “the relationship between the state and youth is a delicate matter; one that is a potential threat to peace and security in the Southern Africa”. He argues that understanding the challenges to youth involvement in the political discourse, development and economics is critical to find amicable solutions to protests. He described that ‘The Youth Bulge Theory’ as a concept that identifies young men and women as historically volatile and rapid increasing population. He shared the view that the increasing population of the youth raises the prospect of rebellion and unrest. The unemployment rate in South Africa which affects youth mostly fuels radicalism which results in protests. Moreover, he argues that unanimously it is agreed within political circles that youth are ‘mid-partners’ who are usually misled by excessive and misguided fanaticism that insinuate frustration and disappointment. The politics of entitlement and broken promises of good life by politicians usually towards and after elections fuels protest.

Philosopher Rousseau argues in his famous philosophy (The Social Contract) that “the general will is always in the right and always works for the public good; but it doesn’t follow that the people’s deliberations are always right”. If the populace held its deliberations (on the basis of adequate information) without the citizens communicating with one another, what emerged from all the little particular wills would always be the general will, and the decision would always be good”. Communities that have common goals to achieve view their understanding over certain issues as genuine. Decisions that are taken by the people who have similar understanding represent the majority of the communities (Rousseau 2010).

According to historian Briton (1938), in his book ‘Anatomy of Revolution’ he argues that the revolutions begin with problems in pre-revolutionary regime. These include problems functioning- “government deficits, more than usual complaints taxation, conspicuous government favouring of one set of economic interests over another, administrative entanglements and confusions”. He also argues that the switch away of intellectuals allegiance from government and financial problems contribute to the revolutions. He observed that three of four ‘English, American, French and Russian Revolutions’ started when people were opposed to certain taxes.

1.4 Research Methodology and Data collection

This study has used interview techniques and documents review method to collect data. Therefore each and every method used to collect data is scrutinized as a subtopic under research methodology. The study conducted individual and focus group discussions from selected participants to collect data. The responses attained from participants are used to shape the general conclusions and recommendations based on the research's problem statement. A case study is used to gather information. Musina area is chosen for the purpose of conducting the case study.

Subject matters such as political analysts are useful to provide their understanding views to the problem investigated. Senior officials from Musina Municipality were instrumental in sharing their experiences regarding the implications of service delivery protests on the stability and economy of the municipality. The main aim of targeting relevant people who belong in various community structures, municipality and subject experts is to gather in-depth information on how they understand the implications of service delivery protests in relation to the stability and economy of local governments.

1.4.1 Qualitative Methodology

Since the problem investigated is more of a social science nature qualitative methodology is applied as a most appropriate methodology. This methodology is exploratory in nature as opposed to quantitative one which uses numerical facts as principal approach to gather information (Creswell 1994). Using this methodology the researcher used review techniques to collect available information and ask questions from the participants in a structural approach.

The population of the study comprised of people who occupied positions of authorities and administrative functions such as civic organisations, ward councillors and traditional leaders from Musina and Nancefield Towns, Madimbo and Tshipise villages which all falls under Musina Local Municipality. The population of the study was selected by the researcher with the intention of targeting informed members from the population. The selected population had essential background of service delivery protests that took place between the periods of 2007-2014.

Though the protests occurred mainly in Musina and Nancefield townships the data collection from Madimbo and Tshipise are significant in the study. Tshipise is described as third order settlement because of its function in terms of limited service delivery to the surrounding commercial farming areas, tourism attraction and nature conservation. Madimbo is categorised as the fifth order settlement because of its small population and its functioning as a residential area with no economic base (Musina Municipality IDP 2012-2013. 26:27). The views of participants from these areas are critical in examining how they were affected by protests directed to their municipality.

The purposive sampling techniques employed will remain important to the whole process of this research unlike using random technique which implies that anyone can be interviewed. The purposive samples were used for fieldwork at Musina and Nancefield Towns, Madimbo and Tshipise villages. The views expressed by targeted players in the positions of authorities are representative to ordinary citizens they serve. Here in this methodology the smaller but focused samples are mostly needed compared to large samples.

Qualitative research investigates questions in a descriptive manner which brings answers to the problem statement (Creswell 1994:145). Purposive sampling is not necessarily representative but it seeks to achieve its intended purpose of interviewing informed individuals in the targeted areas. Qualitative methods therefore produces information only on the particular cases studied and more general conclusions are only hypothesis (Informative Guesses/Assumptions).

1.4.2 Data Analysis and Interpretation

The similarities of the information collected in response to research problems stated are treated as important when analyzing and interpreting data. Similar responses in the data collected are grouped and the researcher identified common patterns that derive meaning from what may appear unrelated and scattered responses. The findings of the research are thoroughly analyzed and interpreted on how they respond to the research problems.

1.4.3 Ethical Considerations

All the participants participated in the research project voluntarily or out of their will. All the participants were informed about the procedures pertaining to the research process. The

researcher was mindful about the human rights issues such as dignity, privacy, freedom of speech and right to confidentiality. Participants were informed about the importance of their wilful participation and their right not to participate in the research (Koocher 2014). The importance of participants to participate and how that adds value to knowledge system in our country was discussed.

The researcher made a request to the University of Venda to solicit approval letter to conduct the study for quality purposes. The letter was provided to targeted groups of respondents to identify the researcher and assured them how genuine the project was.

1.5 Structure of the study

CHAPTER 2: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND DATA COLLECTION

This chapter focuses on the research methodology used by the researcher when conducting the study. This chapter includes research design, data collection methods and sampling techniques.

CHAPTER 3: CAUSES OF SERVICE DELIVERY PROTESTS: IMPLICATIONS AND SOLUTIONS

This chapter examine the causes of service delivery protests that happened around Musina Municipality between the periods of 2007-2014. Broken promises on basic service delivery delays and provisions of poor quality services on commodities such as water, housing, sanitation and other basic services as common causes will be examined.

CHAPTER 4: A CRITICAL ASSESSMENT OF POVERTY AND UNEMPLOYMENT AND HOW THEY AFFECT MUNICIPAL FINANCIAL AFFAIRS

This chapter critically assess how poverty and unemployment rates in Musina areas affect the financial affairs of the municipality to render services to the people effectively.

CHAPTER 5: THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE MUNICIPALITY AND ITS COMMUNITIES

Accountability of ward councillors, council members and ward committee members to the communities they were entitled to serve will be critically analyzed in this chapter with the aim of understanding how it affected the relationship.

CHAPTER 6: DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION

This chapter focuses on the results of the data collected through interview and other means. The data collected from various means such as interviews, municipality documents and literature available are analysed and interpreted in this chapter to give an overview response on the problem investigated.

CHAPTER 7: GENERAL CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This chapter provides the summary of how the objectives of the study have been met. The recommendations are made based on the resolutions of the study whilst conclusions are made out of findings

CHAPTER TWO

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND DATA COLLECTION

2.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter focuses on explaining how data were collected using various methods and techniques exercised. The methodology and techniques that this study used were briefly explained in chapter one. Research collection, design and instruments exercised in this study were chosen taking considerations the nature of the problem statement.

Conducive techniques such as observations, interviews and literature were chosen to collect in-depth understanding of the research problem. Validity and reliance were considered when choosing research instruments applicable to get validated and reliable findings.

2.2 DATA COLLECTION TECHNIQUES

Qualitative data were collected in this study to gather descriptive and exploratory information. As mentioned in chapter one of this study the methodology exercised has considered a sample of population where the study was conducted. Interviews were conducted with individuals' representative to community structures of Musina-Nancefield, Madimbo and Tshipise areas. The interviews also included the representatives from Musina Municipality and Political Analysts. The interviews were conducted on the 18, 19, 20, 21 of November and 08, 09 of December 2016 respectively.

Qualitative data were collected using the following instruments:

- Face to face interviews with 09 community leaders representing traditional leaders, civics, ward councillors and municipality officials.
- Municipality IDP documents, annual performance reports, press release and government documents.
- Observations during interviews.
- Telephone interviews with 3 people.

Choosing respondents and available documents as means for data collection was done based on their relevancy to the problem statement of the research. Data attained from selected respondents and municipality through interviews were grouped respectively to give sample techniques principle of population attention it deserved.

Interviews and observations respectively gave the opportunity to seek clarity and observe behaviour of the respondents from targeted groups. All the mentioned above qualitative data collections were treated as primary.

2.2.1 INTERVIEWS

The set of interviews tools were designed to relate to data sources used to meet the desired outcomes of the problems investigated. Tools were also designed with the analysis consideration of population groups selected to responds on the interviews. The researcher took notes of interviewees' responses.

2.2.1.1 SEMI-STRUCTURED OPEN-ENDED INTERVIEW

An interview with municipality officials intended to analyze the feelings of the municipality on the implications of service delivery protests on the economic stability of Musina Municipality was conducted.

The municipality has assigned one of its managers to meet with the researcher for the interview purpose. It was helpful to get a senior official who had more knowledge of service delivery protests. The official displayed satisfactory understanding of how the municipality viewed protests as well as platforms used by the municipality to engage with its stakeholders.

This tool was important because it enabled the researcher to seek clarity from respondents unlike mailed questionnaires that limit engagements. The responses were clear because there were no language barriers experienced using this tool. Both interviewer and interviewee used Tshivenda as their medium of communication. This tool was conducive in minimizing human errors as a result of biasness. The researcher took notes of the respondent's responses. However this tool was expensive because the researcher had to travel and sleep over to meet the respondents in time.

2.2.1.2 SEMI-STRUCTURED IN-DEPTH INDIVIDUAL INTERVIEWS

Semi-structured in-depth individual tool was used to gather information from municipality representative and community leaders such as traditional authorities, civics and ward councillors.

Interviews were conducted with 08 individuals from Musina-Nancefield, Madimbo and Tshipise. Individuals selected were community leaders representing traditional authorities and civics.

Ward councillors representing respective wards were also interviewed. The selected individuals were community representatives in different capacities during the period this study focused on. They were selected because of their understanding of service delivery as community representatives. The dates used to interview the respondents were considerate of Musina Municipality's official working days hence the interviews were conducted during the week. Saturday date was conducive for availability of community leaders from Musina-Nancefield, Madimbo and Tshipise. The researcher took notes of the respondent's responses.

Musina-Nancefield Township was chosen because it experienced service delivery protests during the periods this study focused on. Madimbo as a 'Fifth Order Settlement' was a village representing the feeling of people from villages where service delivery effectiveness is cited as problematic because the area functions as a residential area without economic base. Tshipise was chosen because it falls under the so called 'Third Order Settlement' because of its function in terms of limited service delivery to the surrounding commercial farming areas, tourism attraction and nature conservation.

All the respondents were open about their feelings and an understanding of service delivery protests and their implications on the economic stability of the municipality. All the participants used the Tshivenda language used by the researcher too. There was no language barrier experienced during the course of the interviews. The responses of the respondents shaped the researcher's general conclusion and recommendations because they responded to the problem statement.

Ward councillors shared their views on service delivery protests which happened in Musina and how it impacted on their constituencies. They were however compromised to divulge the weaknesses of municipality because they were deployees of the ANC which is a ruling party in the municipality they were serving.

Local traditional authorities understanding of implications of service delivery protests marred with violence on the economic stability was sounding. Though they denounced the act of vandalism in their view violent protests make the government listen faster.

2.2.1.3 ANALYSIS OF MUSINA MUNICIPALITY AND GOVERNMENT DOCUMENTS.

Several documents such as media releases, Integrated Development Plans and Annual Performance Reports were analyzed on how they explain issues of service delivery protests, communication and compliance in the municipal system acts. The IDP of 2011/12 and

2012/2013 financial years were analyzed in to details because that's the period where protests and municipality properties were at stake. The Annual Performance Report for basic services allocation of 2013/14 was analyzed with specific attention to the financial year periods of 2009/10, 2010/11, 2011/2012, 2012/2013 and 2013/14.

The Cogta annual report of 2008/09 financial year was analyzed to assess the overview of the Musina municipality performance. Media press releases were analyzed to assess how municipality responded to the allegations of corruption, price inflation and nepotism against its senior managers. Government document "Back to Basic" was analyzed to assess how the government was committed to overseeing the performance of local government in rendering services to the people.

The IDP allocations of resources and projects to Musina-Nancefield, Madimbo and Tshipise as well as Annual Performance Reports in the mentioned areas were given serious attention to assess how service delivery was prioritized in those areas. The motive behind was to assess if the protests were mainly about broken promises budgeted for in the IDP or something else considered important by communities. This helped the researcher to draw well informed recommendations and general conclusions knowing if protests were direct responses of broken promises or other influences.

2.2.2 LITERATURE SOURCES

Books used as secondary sources as well as documents were important when conducting research study because they helped the researcher to take into account what other scholars have written on the subject matter. The primary documents from Musina Municipality and government documents were also important because they address issues that related to service delivery.

The following documents were used due to their significance in the research study:

- The IDP of 2011/12 and 2012/2013
- Annual Performance Report 2013/2014
- Cogta annual report of 2008/09
- Musina Media releases

Selected sources such as journal articles, web published contents, books, newspapers and dissertations that talked about service delivery protests and its related matters were used.

2.3 VALIDITY AND RELIABILITY OF THE INSTRUMENTS EXERCISED

Validity in research is an important matter which entails how valid the project conducted was. These include matters such as truthfulness, meaningful, robust and logical (Quitán 2011). This research achieved its reliability principles because it involved participants who understood the problem of service delivery protests. It involved relevant people who were in the community leaderships, municipality officials who are referred to as decision makers and other people with more knowledge of service delivery protests and economics.

The interview techniques set out by the researcher were intended to gather information that respond to the problem statement and objectives of the study. Quitán argues that the measurement of the research reliability can be analyzed through how data collections methods are designed to achieve what they are intended to achieve (Quitán 2011).

2.3.1 INTERNAL VALIDITY

Internal validity argues that validity of inferences is the relationship between the cause and effect between independent and dependent variables (Creswell 2012). The study involved the community leaders affected by the problem of service delivery as well as the municipality regarded as the cause of the problem who equally affected by the protests actions carried out by the communities. The researcher selected people in groups and individually to avoid relying on the information that may have been the output of pressure of fear for retaliation if some people differ with the views of others. Influence during data collection compromises the quality of the findings hence the researcher meet different people one in one as well as in groups to avoid such compromises.

2.3.2 EXTERNAL VALIDITY

Davis argues that external validity is the degree to which the study's results can be generalized across the similar conditions, population and settings (Davis 2000).

The types of respondents have potential of limiting researcher to generalize the findings as a result of selection interaction. When certain people are selected to the researcher by their seniors to participate in the research data collection phase there is no guarantee that the best were selected. The results found in Musina areas may not necessarily be generalized as most appropriate to other areas where they have experienced the same or similar problem of service delivery protests because trends may differ.

2.3.3 RELIABILITY

Quinian argues that the degree to which the research can be repeated and produce consistent results prove the reliability of such research project (Quinian 2011). The researcher tested the interviews to determine if they can produce the same results more than twice to apply the reliability principle.

2.4 CONCLUSION

The study exercised various data collection techniques to gather data from different research sources. The data collection techniques used includes interviews, observation, literature sources and document analysis. The reliability and validity of the data collection techniques applied to the study were discussed. The weaknesses of the research external validity were discussed.

CHAPTER THREE

CAUSES OF SERVICE DELIVERY PROTESTS: IMPLICATIONS AND SOLUTIONS

3.1 INTRODUCTION

The democratic government of South Africa made a significant announcement in its white paper of March 1998 that local government should provide basic, social and material needs to the citizens. This was a result of the adoption of constitution of the Republic in 1996 where government committed itself to serve its people regardless of races like what it used to be in the apartheid regime (The white paper on Local Government 9 March:1998). South Africans, particularly blacks who suffered exclusions from economic and social injustices during apartheid, saw the new democratic government as their solution. In this chapter attention is paid to factors that cause service delivery protests in Musina Municipality. The factors that contribute to local government's backlogs and failure to render services to the citizens will be given attention in this chapter.

Service delivery is a sensitive and complex matter to many people because their lives depend on it. Once the service delivery adequacy is compromised citizens feel being taken for a ride by their government leaders who should protect their interests. Service delivery problems often lead to mistrust and fractions between citizens and local governments that have a primary mandate to serve people on the grassroots.

3.2 INTEGRATED DEVELOPMENT PLANS

Local municipalities use Integrated Development Plans as a platform to meet communities to decide their future. It is in this platform where local government representatives and communities meet to discuss what can be done to improve the lives of communities (SALGA 2004). In these robust engagements, communities are given opportunities to raise their challenges and propose what they want municipalities to roll out as developments in their respective areas. The reason why local government goes to their communities is to afford them an opportunity to raise areas of concern and desired projects that bridge the social and economic bondages.

Local government officials together with communities map the way forward together to afford ordinary citizens opportunity to participate in the decision making process of their local governments. However the final decisions to implement and not to implement identified projects

that communities want recline within municipal councils. Councils analyze different proposals in relations to their feasibility, time frames and budgets allocated to the municipalities in each financial year.

Communities' wishes are too complex and not all wishes need finance e.g. feedback meetings. Political will is essential which requires political leaders to give feedback to the communities regarding previous promises made by state officials. Human nature is selfish and it is in this aspect that each and every community views its wishes as genuine and practical within their time frameworks (Champman 2014). However communities' structures do not have status accords that allow them to participate in the budget allocations and final decisions taken by the councils. When their wishes are not met, it creates a volatile environment where they may resort to other avenues for their wishes to be granted.

3.3 COMMUNITIES' STRUCTURES AND ORDINARY CITIZENS

Communities' structures that represent various constituencies within communities have big role to play to represent their constituencies' interests in local governments. They have a sensitive role to play as a bridge and facilitator between local governments and communities. On the other hand, local governments employ ward councillors who are elected directly by communities to represent the interests of the same communities in their local governments. The trick is that local governments have to work with both councillors and representatives from communities to improve the lives of those communities.

If the relationship between ward councillors and communities representatives falls apart their tensions threaten stability of infrastructures that belongs to government. Depending on the integrity and credibility of communities' structures their leaders sometimes create hostility environment for ward councillors to work. Communities listen to their leaders from various structures whom they vest much trust to lead them. If such kind of situation find a room within the communities citizens may find themselves cornered where the fragmentations that exist in their wards affect service delivery provisions.

3.4 COMMUNICATION AND NEGOTIATIONS BREAKDOWN

Communication is one of the sciences that are conducive to address any problems in the world whether socio-economic and political. There are no institutions in the world that can be led by people without experiencing its own problems. Every institution in the world has its own dynamics and challenges that test capabilities of executives in handling them. It needs

accountability from both local governments and community perspectives to own up their actions where they go wrong. After realizing that there are challenges the proper action to solve them are through engagements.

Local government's executives and communities structures willingness to cooperate in solving identified challenges is the proper way of stabilizing or arresting them. Their willingness to cooperate should be followed by meetings to communicate on how best they can resolve the challenges in an efficiency ways. Local Government Act 32 of 2000 implies that communities have the mandate to partake in public consultation and decision making processes in the local governments. Whether be in the IDP forums, ward committees, budget consultations and ward meetings communities voice is essential in advancing their interests.

Negotiations are essential in preventing service delivery protests but it needs a lot of compromises from both community members and local government's leadership. In business there is this common saying that implies that "Clients are always right" whilst in political discourse they say "People shall govern". When communities' demand things that indicators loom that they may lead to protests, communication skills from political leadership in government and community structures is critical. Both groups should be open to discussions and peace resolutions. Both groups have responsibilities to convince each other that protests should be a final arbiter if all avenues explored fail. Government leaders should communicate with disgruntled communities about the factors that hamper certain services to be rendered within the time frames agreed upon. Courageous leaders take short time to apologise and correct their mistakes to prevent riots as a result of egomaniacs.

Negotiation is a win-lose situation where the parties involved may get a better deal or the opposite. Therefore it is essential for leaders representing their constituencies to be sober when dealing with negotiation. If their desired outputs could not be met in the negotiation they should communicate the true reflection of what happened to their constituencies without inclination motives. Giving feedbacks to the concerned groups and people with interests on the pertaining matter shows strong leadership. One of the crucial keys in leadership is to communicate effectively and be persuasive to the people that protests must be a last resort.

The use of media by disgruntled protesters and government officials to respond on allegations that emanate when there are mass actions signal that some of the protests are as results of miscommunications. When different groups involved in misunderstanding dilemmas communicate indirectly in distance whilst they should communicate from the same space it

signals relationship breakdown. “Media propaganda serves to rally people behind a cause, but often at the cost of exaggerating, misrepresenting, or even lying about the issues in order to gain the support” (Shah 2005). Walter Lippmann argue that “We must remember that in time of war what is said on the enemy’s side of the front is always propaganda, and what is said on our side of the front is truth and righteous, the cause of humanity and a crusade for peace”.

SAMWU and residents linked Musina Municipality with serious corruption cases that involved top managers which received mass attention of media. SAMWU has accused the former manager of Musina Municipality Mr Abraham Luruli as centre of corruption allegedly happened in his watch. The major protests that happened in 2012 in the Musina-Nancefield Township labelled both former Mayor Carol Phiri and the Chiefwhip Samson Madamalala as corrupt and uses nepotism practice amongst other things (SABC). Consequently all the allegations of corruption in the municipality the trade union even wrote letter of complaints to the premier office (Mathe 2012). The Public Protector intervened by launching its investigation against the municipality and found no evidence that substantiate the allegations. As argued in this chapter that sustaining mistrust is too complex, when people are suspicious of certain things they usually regard their suspicion as verdict. The trend of the protests in Musina Municipality revealed that the relationship between political leaders of the municipality and the community representatives were constrained. The service delivery protests that residents staged were influenced by allegations of corruption against certain leaders within the municipality not mainly about delivery of services.

3.5 MISPERCEPTIONS AS SOURCE OF UNCERTAINTY

There is a perception that government listens to people only when there are volatile situations that are happening. It is in this aspect that community members use violence in their protests to be heard faster by municipalities’ executives. Most of those who participated in the service delivery protests before argue that peaceful protests are not effective instruments. They argue that when there are riots government leaders feel the heat because their careers too remain in stake. Usually observers who blame violent service delivery protests question the capabilities of local governments in rendering services to the communities and executive in providing leadership.

The growing trend gathered momentum since 2007 where protestors vandalise certain services and goods in order to get other services or goods. Protesters destroy a clinic or public school in order to get a tar road; when they get the tar road they demand a clinic and public school they

have destroyed. Most people do not even realize that vandalizing infrastructure built by government amounts to destroying their future and that of the coming generations. The government invests money in infrastructure to improve lives of the citizens who use anger to destroy their benefits.

Some conclusions that are made by society in general are the results of misperception to believe that being part of decision making of local governments doesn't improve service delivery. Some view their participation in the process as a waste of time because they assume government conducts Imbizo and Integrated Development Plans and other platforms just for formality sake. The perception is that when government conducts its visit to communities to listen to their issues decision have been made already that suits the elite class of people.

3.5.1 SUSTAINING THE MISTRUST COMPLEXITY

Sustaining mistrust in all spheres of life is a complex issue that goes hand in hand with the issues of credibility and honesty. Unfulfilled promises by leadership in government have caused tensions between government and its people several times before. There is an idiom "Once beaten twice shy" which means that when a person has hurt you once, you tend to avoid that person. In this regard when the government has double-crossed the communities before, restoring the confidence is not an easy task which builds mistrust momentum.

There are foreseen and unforeseen circumstances such as bad weathers and strikes in any projects that may hinder developments. Certain circumstances unfolding in government have negative impacts that delay projects that government identified to implement in communities. Political employees should desist from running away to explain themselves to the communities regarding the challenges that are delaying certain projects completion in their jurisdiction. When leaders hide or avoid meeting communities' structures the perception that resources were mismanaged develops. As a result affected communities make their own assumptions and conclusions that fuel frustrations and anger.

In rural areas in particular where poverty, unemployment and inequality are serious problem any allegation levelled against local government employees in relation to corruption and maladministration has a potential of causing serious riots. Lack of service delivery is attributed to corruption and maladministration which to poor communities is an insult that their living conditions are a result of system milking. Once a perception is created that government officials

are serving their interests to balloon or widen their sources of income whilst the beneficiaries of services delivery perish in poverty mistrust is created.

Regaining lost confidence from the people takes time and mistrust must always be sustained diplomatically between government and the public. When there is mistrust between communities' structures and government people with ulterior motives to settle scores capture such opportunity to destabilize the smooth interaction.

Where there is misunderstanding it becomes difficult to communicate effectively. Paralysis in communities lead to formations of unrecognized structures that champions the interest of themselves under the false pretence that they are mandated. Buzan (2007) in his book "States and Fear" argues that competing interests and acting secretly causes mistrust amongst groups of people. If there is no openness and transparency on how government took their questionable decisions and impose them as the will of the people, this leads to mistrust. This often results in contestation of ideas and power that affects stability of the relationship between government leaders and communities. Mending a broken relationship between state organs and the people they represent is a long process that demands efforts and energy.

Galtung (1964) in his "A structural Theory of aggression" argues that the extreme forms of aggression are crimes, including homicide, between individuals; revolutions, including elimination, between groups; and wars, including genocide, between nations". However the theory on its own provides justification for behaving aggressively when people are frustrated. Dollard et al (1939) posited "that the occurrence of aggressive behaviour always presupposes the existence of frustration and, contrariwise, that the existence of frustration always leads to some form of aggression. Johan and Deneded (1939) argues that the term 'frustration' is used to refer not only to the process of blocking a person's attainment of reinforce but also to the reaction to such blocking. They furthermore argued that consequently, 'being frustrated' means both that one's access to reinforcers is being prevented by another party. The allegations of corruption in the Musina municipality were so serious hence the Public Protector office had to intervene and carried out the investigation. The sustainability of relationship between the municipality and its people was in stake since as a result of cloud hanging over the head of officials within the municipality.

3.6 ACCOUNTABILITY CHALLENGES

Fukuyama (2015) argues in his book *Political Order and Political Decay* that “When governments cease being accountable, they invite passive noncompliance, protest, violence and, in extreme cases, revolution”. In a proportional representative democratic system like South Africa it is difficult for electorates to hold political leaders in to account. Political leaders account to their political parties that deploy them in various levels including in local government councils. There is a factor of manipulation in the process of allocating services to the people by governments. Corrupt government officials prioritize projects that can benefit them and their patronage networks. The community may request water as a basic service and be given tar road to benefits corporate that capture certain individuals who are in strategic positions in government.

Some government leader’s notably political deployees do business with the state. Failure to disclose business interests in the registry book is a conflict of interests that cause serious controversies in all spheres of government. Minister of Public Services and Administration Advocate Ngoako Ramathlodi warned on Thursday, 22 September 2016 that public servants who continue to do business with the state will be dismissed and gave them until January 2017 to disclose their business interests. He further revealed that total of 3,570 officials had been found guilty of misconduct related to corrupt activities reported to the National Anti-Corruption Hotline (Business Day 2016).

The budgets of local governments are debated through councils where various political representatives raise their issues. Votes usually determine which projects go where and those who are in majority win. Communities’ structures do not make decisions in the councils and there is no guarantee that their proposals presented in the IDP’s meetings are given attentions they deserve.

Communities’ rights to give directives in political parties on who should represent their interests in government have its own shortcomings. Whilst it is common to elect Ward Councillors directly some positions within the municipalities councils rest on the councillors themselves not the community. The political positions such as mayoral committee members and speakers of the council are not for the community to elect direct. It is the prerogative decision that reclines on political parties depending on their constitution and policies to govern. The danger of a prerogative style of governance is that popular candidates preferred by their parties may be deployed to lead strategic positions where as they are not equals to the task given to them. The

government responsibility to take appropriate remedial action against weak performers is sometimes time consuming.

Cadre deployment robs communities of opportunities to screen candidates of political parties who end up occupying strategic positions that need intellectual capacity than requirements set out by their parties. Electoral system known as 'Proportional representation' of South Africa allows parties to contest elections whilst the voters don't even know who is going to be their leaders in various portfolios. Candidates in local governments are not forced to disclose who funds their campaigns for the public to apply their minds in screening the relationship between funders and the funded. Consequently, communities end up in a trap of electing leaders to represent them who might be pursuing the interests of their funders not the public.

3.7 RECRUITMENT POLICIES WITHIN LOCAL GOVERNMENT

Tight recruitment policies and guidelines in the local governments are the pillars of having stable and sustainable local governments that deliver services to the people. Skilled personnel and strong leadership in local governments to give oversight in the issues of service delivery is important. Having a stable government relates to morale that senior personnel's are enforcing on their subordinates. Shortages of strong leadership and skills vacuum have serious implications in service delivery to the people.

Morally compromised government leaders compromise and capture human resources portfolio and ensure that their will reign. Corruption and nepotism by those in senior positions who abuse their power affect the ordinary rate payers who need services. In 2012 the office of the Auditor General disclosed that majority of municipalities across the country failed audits (Auditor General Report 2012). The report cited skills shortages particularly in financial and administration as some amongst other factors that compromise service delivery in South Africa. Such a predicament release had put local government's internal settings particularly in the recruitment processes at stake where Musina Municipality's integrity too was affected.

"The confluence of rapid technical change, globalization and economic liberalization in recent years has prompted governments in developing countries alike to prioritize skills development as a key strategy for economic competitiveness and growth" (Taylor 2012). The world is changing rapidly because of technological advancement and human capital development must always be adjusted to cope with such changes. The world is not constant but moving and the needs of the society too are not constant so local governments' employees are not immune

from world changes and they should adapt. Policy makers should acknowledge the significance and implications of human resources in productivity and development.

Machiavelli (1532) argues in his philosophy “The Prince” that assessing a true leader is to look at the people who surround him. It is common that leaders who lack self esteem prefer to employ people who won’t challenge their authorities or seems knowing better than them. They make the regrettable blunder of thinking that it is about their prestige and forget that public offices are about serving the people. Skilled people whose skills are not utilized in the productivity of our economy look for opportunities elsewhere outside the country and add value where they are acknowledged.

Lack of expertise in local government staffs compromise service delivery and result in service backlogs. McKinney (2011) has noted that administrative chaos inherited at the local level, combined with the massive lack of both human and fiscal resources to actually carry out designated ‘delivery’ functions was problematic. Most of the local municipalities have a record of returning unutilized money from their budget back to national treasury during end of financial year of the municipalities. They do not do that because they are necessarily more funded but because they lack technical supports and managerial skills to use finance appropriately. Essential skills to carry out project management logically remain a serious problem in local governments (Jacobs et al.2009:20). Failure to do proper budget and financial analysis results in service backlogs and returning unused money unnecessary.

Communities get angry when they hear that their local municipalities return money back to treasury where as they are underserved. This sends a wrong precedent that national treasury is allocating more money to local governments where as the issue is about lack of expertise to handle funds. The trends of entering into new contracts with service providers irregularly by political leaders when their terms are closer to end to secure kickbacks affect service delivery efficiency.

3.8 NON-COMPLIANCE TO REGULATIONS

The Auditor General of South Africa in his report “Compliance with laws and regulations in government will fulfil the aspirations of citizens” noted that public confidence in government is critical and it can only be braced if leaders and officials in public sector carry out their obligations legally, effectively, efficiently and economically. He furthermore noted that laws such as the Public and Municipal Finance Management Acts (Acts No.1 of 1999) are significant in

ensuring proper management, transparency, accountability and good governance (Auditor General South Africa 2011). The culture of wasteful expenditure and impunity by government workers compromise service delivery provisions. The local government is the most relevant component of government that its primary role is to make provisions of basic, social and economic needs to the communities. It is critical for employees of local governments to know, understand and adhere to “Batho Pele” principles which literally mean “People First”. Those principles were crafted by government to serve as a torchbearer for all employees who are in government particularly at local sphere because they deal with communities directly (The white paper on Local Government 9 March:1998).

The government is tarnished by the non-compliance acts of its employees particularly those in financial and political strategic positions to use state resources to fund their lavish lifestyles. The large chunk of state budget end up being used for high flying mayoral vehicles, foods, hotels and flawed tenders than what the money is intended to which is to improve lives of the people. Procurement and supply chain management are the most targets of corrupt activities to milk the system by those who occupy senior positions in local governments. Political positions like Mayoral, Speakers and Chief whips are five-years contracts attached to elections which are also linked. These powerful positions are usually abused by their bearers who intensify accumulation to pave a lavish lifestyle beyond their terms lapses.

The professionalism will to adhere to ethics is the pillar of strength to have sustainable municipalities that uphold their mandates to serve the people. Monitoring, evaluation and financial audits that are followed by strong actions against perpetrators who use state resources for personal and undue benefits send a good message to the public. Strict adherence by municipalities to pay contractors within 30 days as stipulated by the national treasury in Public Financial Management Act 1 of 1999 is important in advancing services delivery. If contractors are not paid in time they sit on programmes which affect the public at the end.

The issue of compliance is not a responsibility of municipalities’ only but societal responsibility too. Communities need to be conscious about the significance of paying municipal rates to boost the economic viability. Communities need to understand that for the local governments to render efficient services they need financial stability for development and that the collection of rates boosts such stability. Those who avoid paying their rates need strong persuasion from authorities to do their responsibilities of ensuring the municipality gets money to run their operations.

Strict policies to deal with contractors who fail to complete their assigned jobs should be applied efficiently in order for government to recoup the public funds incurred. Municipalities should ensure that retention fees are withheld until satisfactory evaluation is done against any contractor given work to do on behalf of state.

Performance bonuses of senior managers should be in line with the *Municipal Financial Management Act 56 of 2003* to ensure that they are paid within the means that municipalities have. Poor performing local municipalities need a closer eye of district and provincial administration to give oversight. Paying big bonuses to senior managers of the municipalities that are underperforming sends a wrong precedent that government finances are not properly administered. When there are financial irregularities in the municipalities it become easier for communities to boycott paying rates as a means of voicing their anger and this has implication in the economic viabilities.

The Musina Municipality failed to conduct Individual Performance Reviews (MSA Section 57) between the period of 2009/10 and 2010/11 financial years. Again in the same period the municipality has failed to submit Oversight Committee Reports to the Department of Cooperative Governance, Human Settlements and Traditional Affairs (Coghsta). In the financial year of 2010/11 the municipality failed to submit the Mid Year Report of (Municipal Financial Management Act Section 72) to the Coghsta (2010/11 Limpopo Annual State of Municipalities MEC Section 47 Report 2012). When the municipality failed to adhere to such critical compliance requirements it raise a contestable view in the community that they had something to hide or undermines the authority

3.9 BASIC SERVICES EXCLUSION

The South African government is confronted by poverty, unemployment and inequality which affect the Musina Municipality mostly as a rural municipality. These challenges mostly affect people on the rural more especially villages that are poverty stricken. Water provision remains a serious challenge in most areas but in rural areas such as Malale and Tshikhudini the provision of sanitation and RDP houses tops the challenges (Musina Local Municipality IDP 2011/2012).

The crisis of basic services notably water has been a problem facing not Musina municipality alone but the whole Vhembe District. Vhembe District is water authority whilst Musina municipality is a water consumer. Therefore the failure on the district level affects the operation of local municipality because the relationship between the two in relation to water and is

intertwined. Nandoni Dam was constructed by Vhembe District at the cost of R600 million but most communities are still without water. Former Member of National Council of Provinces, Mr Tlhalefi Andries Mashamaite tabled a motion in parliament without notice where he cited that “Unacceptable state of affairs is attributed to poor workmanship by the contractor and inferior pipes that were used for water reticulation, which lead to a court battle with the result that water could not be provided to communities” (NCOP Debate 2011).

The World Summit for Social Development held in 1995 recommended the ‘Social Integration’ concept to create an inclusive society as the key goal for social development. The Copenhagen Declaration and Programme of Action which was the key outcome of the summit assured that there should be a totally eradication of poverty and social integration to the members state amongst other agreements (UN Desa 2009:4) Each and every community has got its own dynamics that need local government’s intervention to cease the tension. Traditional affairs, politics, tribal and ethnic conflicts sometimes lead to the exclusions of certain groups to benefit in the socio-economic activities. Leadership from local governments has got a biggest role to unite communities to have stable government because if their conflicts are not given attention they threaten peace. When certain groups within their communities feel excluded in the social and economic affairs because of their political affiliations, language, gender and other related aspects they destabilize the smooth running of service delivery to voice their anger.

Openness and transparency of allocating services to the beneficiaries remain a critical concern for residents who accuse their leaders of tempering with the list. Those who are politically connected were alleged to be given first priorities even if they didn’t qualify to get free basic services and compromise the needy families. Dishonest leaders were fingered that they were benefiting unlawfully by renting houses intended for the poor to foreign nationals who didn’t qualify.

3.10 VIOLENT CULTURE INHERITANCE

The culture of violent service delivery protests in South Africa is historical. There are mixed feelings in the manner in which black communities particularly in rural and their counterparts conduct themselves during protests. Most people share the sentiment that black protesters mainly use violence when protesting because is the culture they inherited during oppression period where they use violence to be heard by government. President Jacob Zuma once argued that South Africans have a history of violence when addressing journalists in Sefako Makgatho

Presidential Guest House in Pretoria following the xenophobic outbreaks in 2015 (Du Plessis 2015).

Sometimes human nature does not fight because there are genuine reasons to fight but because someone or a party is not willing to wait or compromise for one another. South Africa is still a young democracy still faced with challenges created by previous apartheid administration. Generation that witnessed the cruelty of former government and how poor blacks used force to resist evil system still believe in force approach as a legitimate plea to raise issues.

Political intolerance and ideological differences spill over to civil society at large. When communities are fighting for their democratic rights to get adequate services they deal with issues as a collective. Because issues of service delivery do not have a boundary but affects all the citizens' politics dominate the engagements where genuine issues sometimes end up being sensationalized by strong lobbying groups. Even if issues raised might be economic or social mostly political paradigms are used to solve other aspects.

Most people share the assertion that the world is like a battle of the giants where strong wins and weaker lose. It is in this aspect that when communities demand services from their municipalities they choose to use diplomatic channels or protest. Depending on which distributive justification theories most leaders from communities use the liberal theory that favours progress, reform and believes that government should be active in supporting social and political change. Though this theory does not condone anarchy and violence it is of the view that government should play a meaningful role in transformation of social and political change to favour progress.

3.11 ECONOMIC POLICY TRANSFORMATION

Public policies must be realistic and subject to transformation if they are not playing meaningful role in the environment. International politics changes impact in the local settings of countries and South Africa is part of the international community. Plerson (2000) noted that public policies are and formal institutions are usually designed to be difficult to change and argue that past decisions encourage policy continuity. With the issues of global changes and economic fragility dominate the world they test flexibility of state player's transformation. Policy makers and beneficiaries of policy status quo usually fight against changes and transformation that put their interests at stake.

Economic policies need radical transformation. Historically blacks were excluded in the economy of South Africa by apartheid regime. The commitment by the democratic government in redressing the damage caused by apartheid is still a challenge that affects most municipalities dominated by blacks such as Musina. This relates to empowerment to previously disadvantaged black communities mostly in rural areas where majority of people still lives in abject poverty.

Radical policies that empower blacks and transfer wealth from minority to majority remain a big problem that too most people regard it as a matter of life and death. The issue of ownership because of forceful removal of blacks by whites during colonialism has made blacks feel excluded in agricultural activities linked to economy. Even though South Africa's government has passed the Restitution of Land Rights Act 22 of 1994 to redistribute stolen land from blacks the process has not been moving faster. The issue of land has remained a burning issue to rural communities that cause frustrations to blacks. In Musina Municipality where majority of communities dwells in deep rural the issue of land is sensitive to them. Unemployed people blame government policies failure to fast track the process of land expropriations. President Jacob Zuma admitted that government's willing seller, willing-buyer policy failed to yield fruits (PLAAS 2012).

There was a strong view particularly from trade unions that South African economic policies are pro capitalism and neo-liberal which makes the rich to remain rich at the expense of the poor majority. Policy makers usually view elite class of people more important than poor who constitutes population majority. Policy honesty in addressing the reality of the living conditions of the rural people remains a challenge in improving standard of the lives of the people. The tricks of making successful policy that address inequality and poverty eradication is that policy makers assume that their decisions are best for the intended groups. Revisionism as a theory shares the belief that gradual changes within institutions can surely change society's fundamental economic and political structures (Jaures 1962).

The lack of small businesses and entrepreneurs support to grow their initiatives affect economic booming in most rural municipalities. This also affects local government's potential of maximizing revenues if small businesses owners are not making ends meet out of their initiatives. Channelling more resources to cooperatives and local businesses has been long overdue to eradicate poverty across South Africa as a whole. The Broad Based Black Economic Empowerments is a good step initiated by the government to help previously disadvantaged

people who dominate local municipalities. The complaints around this policy in relation to political interference to benefit political connected individuals need strong monitoring and evaluation mechanisms. The local government's procurement policies should promote local producers that reside within before they procure goods and services from outside corporate.

3.12 LACK OF FORMAL EDUCATION AND AWARENESS CAMPAIGNS

Communities have various groups that reside from within and have common interests to live an improved life. Educated people from within communities and local municipalities have a meaningful role to play in raising awareness on how instability threatens socio-economic aspects. Government projects are built by tax payer's money. Vandalizing government structures such as clinics, schools, water taps and other services is tantamount to self-destruction. Service delivery protests that turn violent weakens the interests of investors whose concerns are mainly on their profits and infrastructures safety (Anderson 2010). Property developers whose interests are in malls construction and industrial projects feel vulnerable to take risk where there is no stronger leadership to calm violence.

Recorded violence statistics carry the potential to deter investors to take big risk where possibility of disruptions and tensions are higher as compared to other areas where there are no records of violent protests. The desire to teach the public about their rights to protests over service delivery and the responsibilities expected from them is important. There is no need to wait for anarchy to unfold and condemn it after; however raising awareness even where there are no protests is crucial to instil the culture of vigilance.

Individual's failure to respect the rights of others who might not want to be associated with the cause of actions of others remains a challenge in most of the communities across South Africa. Once a right of a person infringes the right of another person it undermines the rule of law. Most of the angry protesters fail to control their anger and cannot distinguish criminality elements from genuine protests. People who hold different views with those in majority end up being prey of the majority. Democracy is one of the good governance models where the views of the majority supersede the minority but the right to dignity and freedom for all must always be observed.

Government agencies commitments to enforce laws that prohibit violent protests and compliance to peaceful demonstrations if not tightened create loopholes for perpetrators who commit crime during protest to take advantage. Collaborations between local governments and

intelligence agencies to monitor communities' members move where there is service delivery grievances is important in addressing crime committed during protests.

3.13 CORRUPTION ALLEGATIONS

The government spends money on paying external service providers for services that could be done by community members. Some of the services that are outsourced are usually associated with corruption allegations where community members easily conclude that the processes of hiring contractors were flawed. Sometimes local governments due to skills vacuum end up paying twice for the same services that should be rendered by their internal staffs. Due to corruption networks unnecessary tenders are advertised for the services that are capable to be done internally to benefits certain individuals. Not all tenders that are advertised are intended to improve the lives of the citizens but some are wasteful expenditures. Some are not in line with procurement and supply chain management acts of the municipalities. Musina Municipality has been in the controversies of corruption several times in relation to tender awarding levelled against senior managers. The South African Municipal Workers Union embarked in protests with the municipality accusing its manager Mr Abraham Luruli of being involved in corruption. The manager was accused for his dragging feet to procured safety equipment for municipal employees, failure to fill vacant positions that were advertised in December 2008 and failure to repairs cars and tractors. The Municipal manager was also embroiled in fraudulent tender allegedly awarded to his friend, a former council member six months prior its date of advertisement. The seasonal protest of 2009 halted the service delivery completely in the municipality to such extent that the municipality as part of its temporary measure had to employ local residents to render services to enabled the community to buy water and electricity (Maponya 2009).

There were serious allegations of corruption again levelled against former Municipal Manager Johnson Matshivha who took reign from Mr Abraham Luruli. The former MEC of Coghsta in Limpopo, Ishmael Kgetjepe, as a result of endless allegations of corruption in the Musina Municipality levelled against officials has deployed his rapid response task team to investigate allegations of corruption believed to be hindering service delivery (Mandiwana 2014). The task team term of references included investigations of eleven appointments made that were inconsistent with the municipality's budget. Communities are sometimes mindful of questionable projects that were not planned to uplift the lives of them but for dodgy activities. Musina Municipality has been accused of spending fruitless expenditures in hiring equipment time and

again instead of procuring its goods to save money. Advertisements and communications on tendering are expensive to local governments that dish out more resources that can improve lives of the people. President Jacob Zuma finally announced on his State of The Nation Address held on 11 February 2016 that the government would no longer advertise tenders in newspapers but would be channelled to state website.

3.14 SOLUTIONS TO CAUSES OF SERVICE DELIVERY PROTESTS

The local government, as the custodian of service delivery should be vigilant against factors that sour its relationship with the clients or the people. As soon as municipality leadership detects that it has lost touch with the people on the ground they should mend the broken relationship so fast. Both national and provincial government should strictly oversee the performance of local governments and instill the culture of compliance on financial management to avoid wasteful expenditure. Those who temper with public purse and sabotage service delivery through impunity actions should be held accountable.

Where municipalities experience difficulties that cause service delivery backlogs leaders should explain the circumstances to the people in time before they resort to mass actions. The government should work closely with stakeholders in ensuring prosperity in the society and guard all opportunistic elements that are masqueraded as genuine concerns to undermine the authorities.

3.15 CONCLUSION

Communication breakdown between municipalities and communities, accountability crisis and misperceptions are identified in this chapter as one of the factors that lead to service delivery protests. Trust is one of the essential things that build a strong relationship amongst all the groups that have interest in the municipalities to provide effective services to the people. Political leadership has an important role to maintain the relationship between the Musina Municipality and stakeholders at all times.

Corruption and maladministration allegations levelled against certain individuals within the municipality destroy the trust that people have in the government. Once this trust is broken the government needs to explain its position and try to regain the confidence from the people that it still carries its mandate and responsibility to uphold clean governance. The municipality should fill the vacancies on time to fasten the service delivery to the people.

Municipalities should employ capable employees more especially on finance, administration and technical supports because those are the keys to effective services and clean administration. Political parties should not abuse the privilege of cadre deployment and deploy people of integrity in strategic positions who will instill culture of compliance to regulations. The municipality should always comply and submit all the documents required by the Coghsta. The municipality should take the issue of Transparency as one of the Batho Pele principles very seriously.

CHAPTER FOUR

A CRITICAL ASSESSMENT OF POVERTY AND UNEMPLOYMENT AND HOW THEY AFFECT MUNICIPAL FINANCIAL AFFAIRS

4.1 INTRODUCTION

The living conditions of rate payers have implications on the financial affairs of the municipality. Municipalities don't rely only on the national treasury for grants to run their operational plans but on service rates as well. Unemployment rate and inequality have implications on the financial backbone of different municipalities across the whole country.

Municipality viability is one of the critical components to run sustainable municipality that is able to deliver services to its people. This chapter examines how unemployment and inequality cause political, social unrest and transformation that result in conflict between government and the people. On the revenue collection assessment between the period of 2009-2012 the municipality has generated the amount of between R 95, 201 and R 140, 801 million through property rates, service charges-electricity, refuse removal, rental of facilities and equipment-external investments interest earned-outstanding debtors, fines, licensing and permits, revenue for agency services, government grants and subsidies-operating, government grants and subsidies capital and other revenue from the residents. The government allocated the municipality a grants of around R 29 330 067 million (IDP 2011-2012).

4.2 DEMOCRATIZATION OF THE ECONOMY

Most of the locals do not control the means of productions and sources of wealth in the area. Farms that are in abundance around Musina area are dominated by settlers who are blamed for employing foreign nationals as cheap labourers. Foreign nationals are offered cheap wages compared to locals and this compels farm employers to consider cheap labourers. Cheap labourers are preferred because they are less interested in joining labour federations and politics which make it easier for employers to exploit them. Department of Labour reported that in a joint operation involving Department of Labour inspectors, Home Affairs, the Human Rights Commission and the police, scores of illegal workers were arrested in several farms in Mopane area of Musina. Inspectors also found out that they were paid as little as R107 per month (Department of Labour 2008).

The economy of Musina still reflects colonial patterns where business owners maximize their profits through exploitations of workers. Local people of Musina are not the drivers of their sources of wealth due to historical injustices created by past racial practices. Musina is not the only area where historical injustice still determines present situations but this is a national crisis. Previously disadvantaged blacks who suffered during colonialism are still subject of poverty even under the democratic government. The Director of Centre for Politics and Research Prince Mashele speaking during Sowetan Dialogue in Soweto argued that since whites settled in our shores they have been working as a group to address their economic conditions. Furthermore he argues that whites used two strategies of embarking on Mining and Industrialization to banish poverty from them as a group (Mashele 2015).

The national government's failures to strictly implement policies that compel big businesses to employ locals remain a challenge that needs an improvement from the government. The challenge of implementing a minimum wage to protect workers from exploitation affected workers to receive decent wages and salaries.

Municipalities do not only rely on the rates paid by businesses but worker's contributions which is crucial for the sustainability of their operations. Workers who are earning fewer wages increase the number of indigents which disadvantages the municipality's economic backbone. Having big businesses around Musina townships and its surrounding areas is a blessing for the economy however if the circulation of big capital within the areas is less it becomes problematic. The big capital that belongs to businesses end up going outside the territory of Musina area without improving the lives of the locals in a meaningful way.

4.3 INTERGOVERNMENTAL LOGISTICAL ARRANGEMENTS

Intergovernmental logistical arrangements remain one of the greatest problems in South African government which affects municipalities' performance. Government is one no matter how many organs it may have which operate within their respective mandates. The National Treasury argue that Chapter 3 of the Constitution describes the three spheres of government as being 'distinctive, interdependent and interrelated and enjoys them to 'cooperate with one another in mutual trust and good faith' (SARPN 2011).

The issue of service delivery, job creation and fighting inequality must be the key concern of all state organs and its state-owned entities. The relationship between municipalities and other government organs identified as one of the greatest challenge that hamper development.

Section 154 of the Constitution state that integral part of the intergovernmental system is placed on the national and provincial government to support and strengthen the capacity of municipalities to manage their own affairs (SARPN 2011). Most people who work in various sectors, including the government, view local government as the relevant sphere for service delivery and nothing more.

Such a perception puts local municipalities in a vulnerable position within the society. Local municipalities are the closest components of government to the people therefore frustrations of the people are directed and blamed to them as if they are the only component responsible in the welfare of the people.

The government should be consistency in displaying unity and cohesion in the public eye. Municipalities' success needs a strong interaction between other state components and commitment to support them because they are vulnerable for public frustrations. All the economic and development clusters should prioritize development in local municipalities more especially in rural areas to prevent urban overcrowdings and migration.

Local government is one of the most critical components of the state because it deals with the basic, economic and material needs of the people as stipulated in the White paper on Local Government of March 1998 directly. National and Provincial departments are not primarily implementers of basic service delivery to the people directly. Rather, their mandate is to give oversight following the chain of reporting and more resources if channelled to local governments they can improve the quality of life.

4.4 REFORMING THE GOVERNMENT TENDER SYSTEM

State tendering system is the biggest contributor of corruption in the government (SAPA 2012). The government has failed dismally to coordinate tender allocations and protect workers from exploitations. Most politicians and government leaders favour tendering system as progressive model to empower blacks who were oppressed during colonialism. However, most people have noted that the system is used to enrich few elites, families and friends of those in power. Some political parties are believed to be the beneficiaries of this corrupt system when intended benefactors donate resources to parties back.

As already mentioned in the beginning of this chapter that unemployment and inequality have an implication on the municipality potential to generate more money through rates and deliver its social contract if more people are not working. The South African Human Research Council

noted in its research 'Income inequality and limitations of the gini index: the case study of South Africa' that disparity of inequality transcend income to negatively impact access to employment opportunities, education, quality healthcare and basic necessities such as electricity, water and sanitation (SAHRC 2014). The two common problems in South Africa as a whole play part in inciting violence and looting during service delivery protests. Controlling hungry people to capitalize during any uncertainty is not an easy task which put both government and private sectors properties in stake. Some people have noted that inequality and unemployment cause radicalism within societies which usually lead to protests.

The allegations of tender corruption levelled against the former municipal manager Mr Johnson Matshivha in 2014 revealed that the trade unions and community of Musina Municipality took the issue in a serious light. Such serious allegations were not the first to be levelled against top officials in the municipality as already mentioned the former municipal manager, mayor and chiefwhip experienced similar circumstances. The allegations of tenders and nepotism against top officials in the municipality have been the grievous issues marring the municipality between the period of 2007 and 2014. In the political discourse allegations can be used to frame the targeted people for power grasp however the persistence of corruption allegations in the municipality spell the political problems that need serious attention. Social scientist Frances Fox Piven in her book 'The Functions of Social Welfare' co-authored with Richard Cloward (1971) argues that "The poor have few resources for regular political influence, their ability to create social change depends on the disruptive power of militancy, they gain real leverage only by causing commotion among bureaucrats, excitement in the media, dismay among influential segments of the community, and strain for political leaders". Her theory is critical because it broaden the understanding of how political influence is contested in the society. Any opportunity that the community grabs to challenge the political leadership and senior officials they use it to their fullest.

4.5 MONOPOLY DOMINATION OF ECONOMY

As mentioned earlier in this chapter the current economic outlook reflects the pattern of past injustices and the apartheid agenda. The Institute for Security Studies (ISS) noted that South Africa like Brazil has an average income stagnated three decades largely because of the economic impact of its apartheid policies (ISS 2015). One of the apartheid agendas were to make black population depended on whites economically (South African History Online 2016).

White owned companies still dominate all sectors as a result of the government's slow coordination of empowerment and restitution policies to help blacks.

Rooting out inequality and unemployment crisis in South Africa remains one of the biggest challenges that need both government and private sectors watch. Capitalism in the market still dominates where powerful corporates determine what should be done in the market. The views of capitalists outweigh the view of the majority who need change such as minimum wage, equity and sharing of wealth. Private sectors threaten government policy implementations by citing job losses if minimum wage policy is implemented. With private sector arguments that minimum wage threaten corporate profits and blame such radical policies as unsustainable put government in a corner where it find itself between the hard place and the rock. Choosing to be pro people and be against capital has its own implications in job losses that state should protect on other hand.

The current economic outlook reflects oligarchy system where minority rules the majority due to their influence on the market. Dealing with state capturing remains a challenge that prevents state from exercising its policies that empower the locals freely without being dictated by the corporate who run the economy. The conditions of the corporate companies to invest in rural areas dictate and undermine the transformation where local's beneficiation in the economic system is marginalized. The mentality of corporate entities is to maximize profits not to develop where they do businesses. The less desire of big businesses to plough back to the community in a meaningful role and deride the elements of greed to develop rural areas remains a big problem that needs municipality intervention. The unlawful strike by employees, ex-employees and community members set alight bus owned by a company contracted by Venetia Mine demanding the mine to pay out funds from an independent employee share scheme (Mabuza 2016). The collusion of members of the community and workers to protest against the mine operating in the Musina Municipality clearly displayed the frustration of the community against capitalism system.

4.6 SMALL BUSINESSES SUPPORT

As mentioned earlier in this chapter big corporates control the economy of the country and therefore government leaders bow to their mounting pressure. Elite classes are sensitive to their interests when engaging the state in terms of policies formulations and direction of the government. Small-Medium Enterprises get small attention from the government which puts their interests down the line. Small and medium enterprises have potential of creating more jobs

in rural townships that can boost municipalities' economic backbone. Without proper government support small and medium enterprises remain dwarf without reaching other heights. The motives of most of the small businesses in Semi-Urban townships like Musina are to make ends meet for the owners whilst creating jobs for others remains a secondary issue. The motives behind small businesses are mainly about putting food on table where growth considerations to bigger perspectives could not be realized without enough funds.

The In-depth Analysis of the Musina Municipality in its Integrated Development Plan 2012/13-2017 under the subheading 'Provision of Business Sites' has noted that in Ward 3 "residents were operating businesses in their backyards and they require the municipality to acquire land for business operations". The municipality furthermore noted that in its 'Business Development and Support' the upcoming entrepreneurs require the municipality assistance to facilitate awareness campaigns and workshops on tendering process, business registration and acquiring funding. It has also noted that the emerging farmers were operating in small farms which were not adequate for future prospects of productions which require the municipality to identify the sites to support them (Musina Local Municipality IDP 2012/13-2017). Small and Medium Enterprises alleviate unemployment and contribute significant chunk in the economy of the country. They are also part of the active participants of the economy fighting against inequality and poverty. Their capital investment contributes to the development of government infrastructures and social welfare.

4.7 FAILURE TO GROW THE ECONOMY

The failure by government to address the economic challenges of the country has a close link to unemployment and inequality that plague the nation. South Africa is the member of BRICS with the smallest population in all of its multilateral economic state members however with the highest unemployment rate. South Africa is also ranked the fourth most unequal society in the world. This was revealed by the research that has shown that Gini Index placed South Africa in fourth position in the data available for only 130 countries in 2009 (HSRC 2009).

The forging mutual relationship between private sector and government which is not one sided is the greatest challenge that has been haunting South African government since the dawn of democracy. The National Development Plan (NDP), a South African's strategy for reducing unemployment, inequality and poverty by 2030, provides a strong room for collaboration amongst government, business, labour and civil society (Stats SA 2014).

The South African government and political leaders on several occasions consistently blame businesses commitment and loyalty to contribute to developments of the country. They consistently blame white capital monopoly and supremacy in the patterns of the economic outlook of the country.

Growing South Africa's economy needs the consolidation of direct foreign investment. South African political unrest and violent protests between the periods of 2007-2014 where this study focused have played a role in preventing the economy of the country to boom as expected. The government's ambitions to grow the economy of the country by between 3-5 percentages in almost each and every year shattered as a result of many factors that are linked to political volatility and other factors. Usually the economy of South Africa systematically growth is recorded at slow down of one to two percentages which manifested a trend between the periods of this study.

The Opposition Democratic Alliance leader Mmusi Maimane argue that the root cause of xenophobic attacks recline on the inability of government to bring about economic growth and decrease the inequality that plagues the nation. Mr Maimane further argues that "It is the hopelessness that results from unemployment that drives drug use and criminality in the communities" (AFP 2015). Frustrated people who feel the inequality gap is widening misdirect their hopelessness by targeting wrong people to voice their anger.

4.8 ALIGNMENT OF THE IDP AND SDBIP

Alignment of Integrated Development Plans and Service Delivery and Budget Implementation Plan was a problem that faced Musina Municipality. Between the period 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 the report compiled by the Limpopo provincial department of Co-Operative Governance, Human Settlements and Traditional Affairs disclosed that there was no alignment between IDP and SDBIP (COGHSTA 2012). The municipality has failed to comply with the standard requirement set out by the Coghsta to align the IDP and SDBIP. This persistent tendency has been noted on the same report when the municipality failed to submit the reports of Individual Performance Reviews in the financial years of 2008/09, 2009/10 and 2010/11.

There was a trend of non-compliance where municipalities create projects on the IDP without giving considerations to SDBIP. Creating projects without considering budget implementation has negative implications in the sustainability of the budget. Fiscal discipline and compliance

are two essential steps that stabilize financial affairs of government which Musina Municipality had experience a setback.

The number of jobs created through local economic development in Musina Municipality area was lowest as compared to other municipalities in Vhembe District following Mutale (COGHSTA 2012). Musina Municipality's performance in creating jobs through the Expanded Public Works Programme was in the lowest state. With the problem of overcrowding due to border crossing associated with temporary stay for immigrants looking for greener pastures elsewhere, Musina Municipality should have done more if it was not for its problem of landfill site shortage (COGHSTA 2012).

The underutilization of the Municipal Infrastructure Grant on its intended projects was one of the problems that hinder the progress and jobs creation in Musina Municipality. The municipality in the financial year for 2009/10 and 2010/2011 failed to spend its entire allocated Municipal Infrastructure Grant (COGHSTA 2012). Underutilization by Municipal Infrastructure Grants sends a wrong precedent that the municipality receives more funds from treasury which affect the decision of treasury allocation of funds, sending a wrong precedent through action that municipality was incapable of accounting for the funds received before have financial implications.

Former MEC of COGHSTA Nkoane Mashabane recommended that the key element of IDP planning approach reclines on the achievement of the commitment through five strategic goals that are:

- Sustainable livelihoods
Economic growth that enhances job growth and greater equity in income and access to wealth and decent livelihoods was identified as critical issues that municipalities should prioritize.
- Affordable and reliable service provision
Service provision and maintenance of services such as water, electricity, roads, and sewage was a challenge that Musina as a municipality should improve. Improving in such critical services create jobs for many and alleviate unemployment and inequality that plague the nation.
- Adequate care for those in need
Municipality relations with other sectors to provide wage for the needy families are critical important to bridge inequality that fuels protests.

- Accountable, effective and transparent government
Accountability and transparency compromises are some of the driving causes that divide community members and government
- Quality, life-enhancing and sustainable living spaces
Human settlements development that promotes dignity of the settlers and movement pattern unfriendly to criminal activities remain the problem that most of community members blame for crime (Department of Local Government and Housing Limpopo 2007, 2008).

4.9 ACTIVISM AND ACTIVE CITIZENRY

The notion of entitlement politics which imply that people believe they have inherent right over something fuels service delivery protests on its own. The democracy of South Africa has matured since 1994 which makes it easier for the people to use protests as a 'tool' to promote accountability. The government Social Contract to provide basic human needs such as free housing, water and electricity amongst others promote the entitlement politics where people feel they should automatically have their basic needs. In democratic societies such as South Africa where transparent is promoted by government any allegations levelled against officials are easily concluded as facts. Investigations processes are disrupted or either met with protests even where there is no evidence backup. The Public Protector office clears the Musina Municipality over allegations of corruption that prompted the residents to embark on service delivery protests in 2012 (Musina Local Municipality Media Release 2014). The residents of Musina Community activism and consciousness programmes were lacking because many people view politics as the only tool to address their social, basic and material needs. The famous prominent leader of the Indian Independence Movement, Mahatma Gandhi once made a well profound statement that "Be the change that you wish to see in the world" (Lewis 2011). Community members should always be the driver of their destination and be vigilant from agenda of external forces that don't have the interests authored by community members themselves.

Julius Nyerere in his *Ujama and African Socialism* philosophy argues that development should be spearheaded from within the community by members not the outsiders (Boddy-Evans 2014). There is a notion that the hand that feeds controls the receiver. Activists and conscious movements should play a significant role in authoring the destination of their communities with

communities' members. When communities spearhead their development, it becomes easier for them to select partners in development who share similar core values with theirs.

The mindset that everything should be coming from outside and government remain a challenge that should be rooted out from the community members of Musina. Musina is very strategic due to its location as mentioned earlier therefore communities should use that for their own advantages. The spirit of self-determination and courage is a societal issue that needs conscious movements to play a significant role to close the void. Community members should decide what they want to see happening in their areas in a progressive manner. Self-determination is a crucial tool that fights external aggression and accumulation by greed if people are united with common purpose to determine their future.

The notion that politicians and government leaders should end unemployment and inequality alone create a problem within the society. Entrepreneurial and innovation ways to create new things that are marketable remain a problem that relates to the education system that instils culture of interdependency. With Musina having big mining and other sectors investing community activists should forge working relationship with them to provide training relevant to work environments. The municipality should play a role in formulating policies through its Local Economic Development Department and create platforms for engagements of stakeholders to meet regularly. The desire for development and environment appealing for investment it's a dream that can be fulfilled by the interaction of progressive stakeholders. Exploitation fuels anger to the marginalized groups of people who may misdirect their anger and use service delivery protests as their opportunity to express their frustrations in a violent manner.

4.10 IMPACT OF UNEMPLOYMENT AND INEQUALITY ON THE ECONOMY

Unemployment and inequality potentially discourage people to further participate in the economic affairs in their areas if they feel neglected (ISS 2015). Young energetic people who gave up on job hunting affect the income generating of government at large. Without paying their municipal bills and income taxes this affect government mobilization of revenues targets.

Some skills that are unutilized are critical in the growth of the economy such as technical and financial amongst others scarce skills. Economic growths rely on many factors such as population growth but factors like unemployment rate and inequality affects market. If the market is reluctant to produce more products and services because of the risk analysis of potential purchasers the economy suffer the setback.

The municipality has noted in its 'Employment and Income Indicators' on the IDP Plan 2012/13-2017 that its main contributors to the economy were: Agriculture, Forestry and Fishing (35%), Mining (30%), Transport and communication (15%), Manufacturing (11%), Finance and business services (9%), wholesale & retail trade, catering and accommodation (6%), community, social, personal services (6%), government services (5%), construction (5%). The unemployment rate stands at 25% with the highest percentage amongst the youth aged between 15 to 19 years and declining with age. Its residents who were not economically active stood at 12, 9 %. The percentage of those earning R800, 00 and below was on the top at 69% whilst those earning R3, 200 and above constituted only 10.8 of the population. Musina Municipality suffered the setback of national unemployment crisis and inequality (Musina Local Municipality IDP 2012/13-2017). The research conducted by Stats SA in 2007 revealed that Agriculture sector was the greatest contributor of employment in the municipality by 54% (Stats SA 2007. This figure contributes to the largest number of people who fall in the income category of people earning R800, 00 and less a month. Those indicators revealed a municipality that rely on government grants to survive due to the number of majority of people who were indigents. Unemployment rate has an implication on the financial affair of municipalities which was the case in Musina Municipality too. Municipality had to rely on government grants and businesses particularly Agriculture, Mining, Accommodations and others to provide service delivery. The more the municipality receives less money from rates payers as a result of huge number of indigents the more its financial backbone to provide services is constrained.

When there is a national job unemployment crisis the people in rural municipalities such as Musina are affected too. The scarce opportunities in big cities discourage them to remain in their areas. As mentioned earlier on chapter three that Johan Galtung's frustration and aggression theory" imply that when people feel they are denied certain things they becomes aggressive. The statistics of unemployment released by Statistics South Africa was between 22 and 25 percentages during the period of 2008 and 2014 which revealed a worrying figure that proved that unemployment is no longer a challenge but a catastrophe (Stats SA 2015).

Musina Municipality had to use its Local Economic Development department and other supporting departments to turn around the table to boost its economy that create more jobs around its areas. This needs strong political leadership to give oversight in its units particularly the LED and ensure they all doubles their efforts in addressing unemployment and inequality that plague its people. When there is commitment in jobs creation it's a good investment because employed people pay back municipal rates and investing in the local economy in

various way because the more their money is spent locally such circulation benefits the entire territory.

4.11 GENERATIONAL MIX ENFORCEMENT IN THE WORK FORCE

Generational mix in the strategic positions of government remains a challenge in the government of South Africa. Youth experienced higher unemployment compared to their adult counterpart where the age between 15 and 24 was standing at 45 percentages in 2008 and increased in 2014 to 51, 3 percentage (Stats SA 2015). Most of the strategic positions are still dominated by old people who were in the retiring cycle.

Building a second layer of leadership in the government remains a challenge that political leadership just buzzes on it without committing to its realizations. The energy of youth in the work force is critical to economic growth. The Centre for Strategic and International Studies argued that “Jobless young people experience vulnerability to future or long-term unemployment, wage scarring and foregone earnings, wasted capacity, skills stagnation, and short and long-term detriment to physical or emotional health” (GSIS 2014). Consequently, unemployment, exclusions and wasted capacity fuels political unrest and radicalism for change in economic patterns and leadership.

Investing in youth skills is critical because they can master them and still play a significant role for more years than people who are in the cycle where considering early retirement remain imminent. The Department of Public Enterprises effort to coordinate the efforts of State Owned Companies in maximizing their inputs towards youth economic empowerment need to be strengthened where youth participation in Musina areas should benefit. Government should be consistent in its vision of having more youths in the working environment where they are afforded opportunity to head strategic portfolios.

The Lula Da Silva’s moment in Brazil yielded positive results and there is a good lesson that South Africa can learn out of such model. Former Brazilian president Ignacio Lula da Silva introduced Brazil’s pro-poor income redistribution policies between the period 2007 and 2010 in his country (Paton 2014). This was a step he took after realizing his country was plagued by inequality which could have led to turmoil. Raising income of the poor minimize political unrest and radicalism caused by growing inequality. If South Africa were to achieve Lula da Silva moment in South Africa it would need organized labour federations and government leaders who are oriented by pro poor and working class policies.

Progressive partnership and seminars between government and people in Musina areas in exchanging knowledge about market outlooks should be strengthened. Career exhibitionists particularly from mines and other sectors are critical in guiding youth about scarce skills and how they can take advantage of mutual partnerships that can benefit locals.

4.12 SOLUTIONS

Inequality and poverty are critical factors that plague most nations particularly in the developing and under developing countries. The political will to serve the people by senior managers in government and private sectors to promote prosperous society should be accompanied by actions not narrations.

Poverty should be a national key area of government where all the sectors are influenced to take it seriously. Skills evolution should be identified as a strategic goal to boost the economy that creates jobs and alleviate poverty that causes social and political unrest in the society.

Government policies should be investors-friendly; however, big corporate should not be allowed to control and coordinate the policy destination of the country alone. Economic transformation should be the essential goal to redress the damage created by colonialism against previously disadvantaged majority who dominate in rural areas.

4.13 CONCLUSION

The government's lack of commitment in managing big businesses conduct, particularly imposing their will in policies formulation is identified as a problem that prevent state to be pro poor and small-medium enterprises. Big businesses reluctance in empowering small businesses and communities where they trade in a meaningful role is identified as a challenge that needs government intervention.

Dishonest government officials who work in authorities that fight against illegal border crossing and black markets contribute a lot in promoting crime in trade. Communities' activists and conscious movements were identified as critical players who should work tirelessly with their communities in addressing economic challenges.

Communities' reliance on the government to create jobs is identified as one of the problem that needs serious attention. Communities' commitment to create their own jobs to bridge inequality and unemployment rates identified as a good step towards economic growth conducive to prosperity.

CHAPTER FIVE

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE MUNICIPALITY AND ITS COMMUNITIES

5.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter analyzed the relationship between Musina Municipality and its communities. The relationship between the government and communities is a critical step towards peaceful co-existence of the two. Accountability of ward councillors, community development workers, council members and ward committee members to the communities they were entitled to serve were critically analyzed in this chapter with the aim of understanding how this affected the relationship. Furthermore the patience of communities in waiting for developments and government communication in developments that affect communities will be critically examined. Compromised relationship between government and communities usually lead to mistrust and hostile environment conducive to anarchy as alluded already in chapter 2 of this study.

5.2 CITIZENS PARTICIPATION

Citizens' participation in decision making processes is very much crucial in all matters that involve development because members of the communities are clients of the municipalities. Government programmes are intended to benefit the citizens therefore they are the most relevant stakeholders to experience the failures or successes of such programmes. The Former Minister of Cogta Pravin Gordhan argued that "An understanding of public sentiment is powerful to determine trends in service failures and successes... Citizens can help in the early identification of issues and service failures". He also made a powerful statement where he was quoted saying "We will pilot with selected municipalities, inviting the public to submit complaints, compliments and photos of service failures and successes whilst making a departmental budget vote speech of 2015/2016 (Gordhan 2016).

The relationship between the government and the citizens determine the stability outlooks if honestly maintained. Most of the service delivery protests were staged by the citizens who felt their lives were not improved by government (Swart 2013). Swart, a researcher at the Research Institute for Theology and Religion at Unisa quoted other researchers arguing that in contemporary South Africa, social commentators were drawing people's attention to the way in which the anger of South Africa's desperately poor black communities is once again boiling over as it did before during apartheid time (Davids 2012a, 2012b; Patel 2012; Saunderson-Meyer 2012). Most disgruntled citizens' boycotts paying municipal rates where their grievances were

not amicably resolved. The power is in the hands of the people and they have potential to use it to drive their leaders to listen to them.

5.3 ACCOUNTABILITY OF ELECTED AND NON-ELECTED REPRESENTATIVES

Accountability of ward councillors, community development workers, council members and ward committee members to the communities they are entitled to serve is critical in the stability of governance. Both elected municipal representatives and non-elective representatives from communities who represent people are critical in maintaining stability within communities. Municipal council, community development workers, and ward committee members accountability in their responsibilities remain a critical step to stability, unity and cohesion in communities. They carry different mandates but they are all bound to be accountable to the same people whose interest is to receive better services. Ward committees members are not employees of the municipality where as their code of conduct are developed by SALGA but they are accountable to communities that elected them. The committees act as an agent for ensuring there is a constructive and harmonious interaction between the municipality and community. Failures by the ward committees to communicate decisions of the provision of municipal services, service payment campaigns and other functions as assigned by the Municipal Council cause confusion within communities (SALGA 2011).

Municipal councils are comprised of members of political parties who account to their parties directly not to the electorates because of South African Electoral System (Proportional Representation Act No.18 2002) which entails that parties that secure seats in councils and legislatures should be represented. However they represent the interests of the people regardless of political affiliations. The electoral system poses a challenge on the sensitiveness of where power reclines when it comes to governance. When there are allegations of corruption and maladministration people on the ground bay the heads of political leadership in their municipalities. However, if the parties that deployed them are reluctant to recall them it becomes difficult for the people and leadership in the municipalities to cooperate further. Community members feel taken for granted hence they resort to protests against leadership they feel has lost moral authority to lead. Former ANC Chiefwhip Samson Madamalala and Mayor Carol Phiri in the Musina Municipality faced a public wrath after serious allegations of nepotism and corruption were levelled against them (Limpopo Mirror 2012).

The relationship between the Musina-Nancefield civic and the political leadership of Musina Municipality particularly between the periods of 2012-2013 was hostile. The outbreak of violent

strike in 2012 spelled the communication breakdown between the residents and the political leadership. The protests staged in Musina-Nancefield Township revealed that the relationship between civic and elected representatives mainly the Mayor and Chiefwhip was constrained. The residents demand that the two be recalled which didn't yield the positive results polluted the political atmosphere. There was a strong view from the civic of Musina-Nancefield Town that the mayor abused her power by appointing manager in her whilst she had personal assistant. The electricity and water tariffs tainted the relationship between the municipality and its residents who embarked on the violent protests to voice their frustrations (SABC 2012). The former Mayor Carol Phiri was quoted by SABC saying "We're appealing to the community of Musina at large not to vandalise our own property because at the end we won't provide service delivery. They have already dup up those roads so it's another issue that we're looking at. We don't even have a budget for that because already the budget is retired. If there's any matter let's sit down and address we're their leaders they elected us and there's no way we can't sit down with them" (SABC 2012). The statement on its own proved that the political leadership of the municipality and the protesters were not communicating effectively on the issues that fuelled the protests. As already mentioned in chapter three of the study, following serious corruption allegations against the Musina Municipality officials the former MEC of Coghsta Ishmael Kgetjepe discharged his responsibility of promoting accountability by launching the rapid response task team to investigate (Mandiwana 2014).

The responsibility of elected and non-elected representatives to educate people to distinguish the Musina local Municipality role from other institutions was neglected. In the Musina-Nancefield the community made an attempt for Police Station Commander to be removed; and also they wanted the certificate of doctor accused of patient's negligence be revoked. In 2013 the community of Madimbo embarked in the similar protests accusing the police of Tshamutumbu were not eradicating crime around the area. Such thing clearly revealed the trend of protests that some of the protests were not necessarily about service delivery but insinuated by misunderstanding of the responsibilities of the municipality.

Non-elective members of the communities who have interests in the municipality council's decisions are not less important in governance. As mentioned earlier in this chapter that traditional authorities are important in rural areas and their influence in governance can't be underestimated. Every institution whether they are recognized in the municipal councils or not they play significant roles in mobilizing against the government or calming the atmosphere. By virtue of being representatives of the people they should be accountable and provide strong

leadership to close vacuums. There was strong view from the community leaders that the major protest that took place in Musina-Nancefield in 2012 should have been avoided if political leadership in the municipality council attended to the civic grievances on time.

5.4 TOO DEFENSIVE TO ACCEPT RESPONSIBILITY

Batho Pele principles are the Service Delivery Charter that municipalities and government in general use as footprint to assess the service delivery impacts. One of the Batho Pele principles 'Consultation' imply that government leaders should regularly make consultations with the relevant stakeholders when there is intention to do anything. The Musina Municipality was complying with the principle by using rotating approach in visiting various wards to conduct its Community Imbizo, Annual Report Consultative Meetings, and IDP/Budget with the residents. The second principle 'Service Standards' imply that the government leaders should inform the people about the type of services they should expect from the government. The municipality was complying with the principle because through its consultation meetings with stakeholders the issues of services are discussed (Musina Local Municipality IDP 2009/10-2013). The third principle 'Access' imply that the people should have access to government services. There was evidence contained in the municipality Annual Performance Report as well as from the community representative's interview that the municipality was providing essential services such as Housing, Electricity and roads amongst others. However the municipality on its IDP that covered the period of 2009/10, 2010/11, 2011/12 and 2012/13 has noted that it had budget challenges to maintain road and had shortages of licence examiners amongst others (Musina Local Municipality IDP 2009/10-2013). The fourth principle "Courtesy", guide government to be polite and be apologetic where things went wrong. When there are allegations levelled against government leader's government should not be spin-doctors to defend its individuals. The fifth principle 'Information' implies the government to provide more and relevant information and advice about services to enable the customers (people) to make informed decisions. As mentioned already on the first principle the municipality was complying by engaging its stakeholders to exchange views using various platforms such as Mayoral Imbizo and IDP/Budget. The sixth principle 'Redress' implies that the government should address its failures and mistakes as ways to resolve the problems. The government should institute disciplinary hearings against its employees if there are grounds and desist from making statements that have potential to harden attitudes of the people. The seventh principle 'Value of Money' implies the government to render services to the satisfaction of customers bearing in mind the cost effectiveness of such services. The eight principles 'Value of money' imply that

public services should be provided economically and efficiently. The municipality has improved its financial spending as disclosed by the Auditor General report 2013/14 however there were challenges of undisclosed wasteful and irregular expenditures occurrence. However the findings of the Auditor General report questioned the reliability of information submitted by the municipality because there were no supporting documents furnished. It also noted that the internal audit was not assessed by the council (Musina Local Municipality Annual Performance Report 2013-2014).

The reluctance to do frank introspection by both government and communities' leaders remain a challenge that needs improvement. The courage to admit that things should have been done differently where problems were experienced is a difficult task to do by many. The national government has been marred by the Nkandla controversy that lasted for about three years between the periods of 2013-2016. National government has dodged the debacle that lasted for many years because no one wanted to be held liable in the excess spending of the president's private homestead. Such scandal should have been handled differently before it plagued the nation.

Most people tend to find ways of shielding themselves from accountability and deal with the symptoms of the problem not the problem itself. Researcher Fombad noted in his research 'Accountability challenges in public-private partnerships from a South African perspective' that accountability remains a challenge in public private partnerships (Fombad 2014). When people demand answers from government where they feel there are rooms for clarification over certain issues their leaders avoid them. Sometimes government leaders abuse the trust that people bestowed on them to lead. Some leaders ought to believe that the love and trust given to them by people are silver platter where there are no conditions attached to serve them. Most controversies that destroyed the trust between the municipality and community members were centred on the former municipal manager whom the protesters argued he was shielded from accountability for too long.

5.5 POLICY COHERENCE

When the government envisaged the type of public services it want in South Africa it didn't end up there but there were questions around the complexity of them. Government had a big responsibility of ensuring that its policies are understood by all members. The African philosophy of humanness that was coined in the concept of *Ubuntu* (Humanity) which according to Nkomo Kamwangamalu explains that "Is a value system which governs societies across the

African continent was viewed as important”. The values that underpin *Ubuntu* are sharing, humanness, respect and compassion which can’t be treated as adopted principles for formality sake but for implementations (Service Delivery Review 2012).

Envisaging a society where government employees put people first guided South African government to establish ‘Batho Pele’ principles to serve as a torchbearer on what core principles were expected from employees of government. The government emphasized that citizens should be treated as clients where public services as commodities (The white paper on Local Government 9 March:1998). Once that logic is lost the trust between government and the people is compromised.

“Ubuntu provides an appropriate philosophical context to ‘Charterise’ the South African public service and administration and could provide instructive wisdom in its strategic orientation” (Service Delivery Review 2012). Government policies are crucial in the governance of its own organs where little understanding to them result in a mixed up society. Adv. Ruthven Van Rensburg who worked on the Office of the Public Protector argues that Accountability, transparency and responsiveness in public administration was important to safeguard fairness (Service Delivery Review 2012). Transparency is one of the important principles that strengthen relationship in any institutions to uphold stability. Accountability is one of the critical principles that must be upheld always to have a stable society where government and its people should live in harmony. Covering up the wrongs promotes the culture of non-compliance where governments employees do as they wishes and do not take ownership of their actions.

5.6 BRINTON’S THEORY COMMON FACTORS/CONDITIONS OF REVOLUTIONS

Historian Crane Brinton (1965) has studied many different revolutions and established a theory on how revolutions have similar conditions before they occur. The Briton theory is a critical one in analyzing the context of Musina protests. There was resistance from people of Musina to pay rates that communities alleged were high and reluctant to be led by people levelled with corruption and nepotism scandals.

He argues that the following issues usually lead to revolution:

- The government is unable to get enough support from any group to save itself. The government survives through the support of its own people. Where there is resistance from the people over certain issues that government leaders address them in unsatisfactory manner government plans are disrupted. Lobbying group’s potential to

stage defiance programmes to undermine the authority of government affect government negatively. The leadership of former Musina Municipality Mayor Carol Phiri and her team experienced hostile protests from the people over allegations of nepotism and corruption (SABC 2012) as already mentioned in chapter 4. The Brinton theory is critical in this study as it try to broaden the understanding on how the support of the people on the grassroots is important in the stability of government. The local residents who embarked on the protests against their leaders were showing their disapproval of the leadership whom they accused of discontent with their living conditions.

- The government cannot organize its finances correctly and is either going bankrupt and/ or trying to tax heavily and unjustly.

As alluded in chapter four of this study that municipalities do not rely only on grants from government but rates collection from payers. If finances of municipalities are not in order service delivery programmes are affected which result in protests. Fiscal discipline in the municipalities remains a serious problem that divides government and the people. Musina residents violently protested against the municipality demanding that it reduced electricity and water tariffs (SABC 2012). The municipality has noted one its challenges on 'Governance and Administration' cluster captured on the in-depth analysis that there was an outcry on municipal statements of accounts specifically to those who have inherited their deceased households. It also noted that is residents from all 6 wards wanted the municipality to regain the 'Water authority' status by reviewing powers and functions of water status with the relevant authorities. The residents were adamant that the municipality was using estimation method instead of meter reading which the municipality recorded as one of its challenges (Musina Local Municipality IDP 2012/13-2017). Spending money recklessly or returning the unused money to the National treasury whilst the people need basic services cause discontent between government and the people.

Former France leader Louis XVI faced a resistance from people who accused him of imposing unreasonable taxes and living extravagant lifestyle on the expenses of the people. Consequently he lost moral authority that led to French revolution. Moral compromised leaders in government face rebellion from the people. When leaders lost moral authority to lead a stable society there is a trick that every problem can be masqueraded as genuine service delivery protests whilst the motives are to get rid of them. Musina Municipality has been marred by controversies because of its municipal manager Abraham Luruli accused of corruption and

awarding of tenders to friends whilst municipal financial affairs were in disarray. South African Municipal Workers Union (SAMWU) accused the manager of failing to fill the vacancies advertised as early as December 2008 and service delivery shortages (Maponya 2009). Musina Municipality council suspended its municipal manager Mr Abraham Luruli for abstaining from work for about four months without valid reason. The manager has made a stir in Musina where residents fingered him for corruption and finally he faced charges of corruption and maladministration during his term investigated by SIU (Maponya 2011). However community members were not happy about the decision taken by the municipality council to place him on suspension with full pay. They wanted him to be treated as a criminal even though he was not yet found guilty by courts of law or by the internal disciplinary actions of the municipality.

5.7 THE INTERGOVERNMENTAL PROBLEMS

The delayed filling vacancies of positions in Limpopo municipalities and provincial government in 2012 have made people speculating on motives behind such delays. Some people cited the Provincial administration of Cassel Mathale collapse as the driving factor of uncertainties in most of municipalities and provincial departments. There were also allegations that some posts were reserved for those who helped former premier Mr Mathale to ascend to power (De Waal 2012). As already alluded to earlier that not all people understand the mandate of local municipalities from other government departments most of government failures in an overall are overlooked into municipalities. The Limpopo administration which relied much on outsourcing of services was responsible in backlogs such as housing, hospitals, social work services problems and others (Nicolson 2012). However the frustrations of communities in an overall performance of provincial government were associated with local municipality particularly the RDP houses allocation.

The Office of the Public Protector investigated Musina Municipality on allegations of corruption, nepotism and inflation of Strategic Planning Session Prices levelled in 2013 and cleared it from wrong doings (Musina Local Municipality Media Release 2014). The allegations of corruption and nepotism in Musina have tainted the relationship between the municipality and the people. After each unfortunate case and event there should be lesson to be learned on how to prevent them to cause future fractions.

5.8 THE INFLUENCE OF LOCAL LABOUR MOVEMENTS

Local labour movements are being led by the people who reside in the local communities with ordinary people. Their sphere of influence cannot be underestimated because they are well informed about latest developments unfolding within local municipalities they reside. Local branches of labour movements have people with ambitions that can drive them to sow division between people and local government.

SAMWU has been vocal in almost all the protests that happened in Musina Municipality. They have accused municipality for corruption several times which have made provincial administration to form investigations team to investigate such allegations. SAMWU has been instrumental in the corruption accusation campaign against former municipal manager Mr Abraham Luruli who was finally suspended by the municipality council. In its Annual Performance Report 2012/13, the municipality has noted with concern the failure by councillors to submit their declarations (Musina Local Municipality Annual Performance Report 20. It also noted that fruitless and wasteful expenditures were not reported to the MEC of Coghsta, Mayor and the Auditor General. Such kind of behaviour is problematic because it deprives the community information on how the municipality spent its money. The trade unions capitalise where there is leadership vacuum to challenge the culture of non-compliance to Municipal Finance Management Act.

Cooperative Governance, Human Settlements and Traditional Affairs (COGHSTA) MEC, Ishmael Kgetjepe launched a task team to investigate the municipality in 2014 for allegedly massive corruption believed to be behind service delivery failures. This was subsequently the news that municipal manager Mr Johnson Matshivha allegedly rejected quotation for services amounting to R148 250 in favour of the one amounting to R360 000. There were also damning allegations that appointees within the municipality were friends to municipal officials. Such allegations potentially affect the trust that community leaders and ordinary local people have towards the municipality (Mandiwana 2014).

Dealing with the influence that labour movements have in the society at large is not easy hence they are part of the society. The issues of corruption and service delivery issues affect them as members of the society and as the leaders of labour movements. Most of the information leaked or circulated by labour movements is relatively accepted as the truth because it comes from people regarded as well informed on the issues pertaining in government.

5.9 ECONOMIC AND POLITICAL CHALLENGES

As this study argues in chapter three that inequality and unemployment plague the nation unlocking economic resources to benefit the people is a challenge that lead to violent protests. Poverty remains a ticking bomb in most of developing and underdeveloped countries that cause civil protests against the authorities. Community leaders are leading angry people in developing countries who want radical economic transformations. Every opportunity they grab to raise their concerns whether is it about service delivery or other issues they use them to their fullest.

Municipalities' lack of setting up committees that oversee the effectiveness of service delivery show that they have not learned or they easily forget previous violent protests when there is stability. Even political parties branches were not giving attention to communities' grievances that escalated to anarchy. Good governance survey reports of 2007 and 2011 suggested that there was agreement in social activists and development practitioner that protests were not only necessarily centred on the provisions of basic services but also in the local governments failures to includes communities in the political processes (Atkinson (2007)).

The municipality performance in an overall of basic services that people cannot cope without them was impressing according to the figure disclosed by service delivery report performance was sounding. Musina Municipality has done electricity service connections of 95.4 percentages in 2009/2010 financial year, 95 percentages in 2010/2011, 88.7 percentages in 2011/2012, 89.9 percentages in 2012/2013, and 91 percentages in 2013/2014 (Musina Local Municipality IDP 2012/13-2017). Water availability within 200 meters from dwelling was at 98.8 percentages in 2009/2010 financial year, 100.00 percentages in 2010/2011, 100.00 percentages in 2011/2012, 100.00 percentages in 2012/2013 and 86 percentages in 2013/2014. Sanitation-Households with at least VIP service was standing at 98.8 percentages in financial year of 2009/2010, 98.8 percentages in 2010/2011, 98.8 percentages in 2011/2012, 100.00 percentages in 2012/2013 and 86 percentages in 2013/2014 (Musina municipality, Chapter 3-Service Delivery Performance Report 2013).

As this chapter argues earlier that not everyone understand how local municipalities operate and their mandates. Musina as a municipality only facilitate and provides housing beneficiary list to Coghsta. Where there are challenges in the provincial department in relation to logistical arrangements most people blame local government over everything. Like what they say in soccer fraternity that "If you miss the ball kick the nearest object", municipality was vulnerable to people's frustrations. Musina Municipality had the electricity license between the periods this

study investigated in urban areas where as in rural areas Eskom was the responsible partner. Such arrangements need leadership to educate people to understand how things work to avoid unnecessary tension as a result of little knowledge (Musina municipality, Chapter 3-Service Delivery Performance Report 2013).

5.10 CONCLUSION

This study has identified that there were some influences of labour movements and political dynamics that soured the relationship between Musina Municipality and communities. Service delivery protests experienced were not necessarily about services but allegations levelled against some individuals within the municipality.

This study has identified discontentment as one of the problem that compromise the relationship between the government and the people. The study has also identified resources allocations as problem that compromises the smooth relationship between government and the people.

This study identified that municipality tariffs to struggling people and allegations of corruption and nepotism within the municipality were some of the factors that caused uproars.

CHAPTER SIX

DATA ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION OF THE RESULTS

6.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter presents the results of the data collected through interviews and other means. Qualitative data is analyzed as a summary. Welman and Kruger (2001:208) argue that the analysis of data obtained during research has to be done through grouping the data and present it in the form of graphs and tables.

The focus of this subtopic will be on the analysis of data and the interpretation of the results of the study on service delivery protests.

6.2.1 DESCRIPTION OF QUALITATIVE DATA COLLECTED

6.2.1.1 Musina-Nancefield, Madimbo and Tshipise data

The Townships of Musina-Nancefield, Madimbo village and Tshipise area provided the study with sources as a result of interviews between researcher and community representatives. Representatives included traditional leaders, ward councillors and civic organizations. The researcher also interviewed the municipality representative and selected political analysts to help the study achieving its objectives articulated in Chapter One.

Bibliographical data of Traditional leaders

The bibliographical data of the representatives of traditional leaders of Madimbo was ranging between the age categories of 41-50. The respondent's educational backgrounds were ranging between grades 10 and 12 plus tertiary qualifications. The group Interview was conducted on the 19 of November 2016 at Madimbo Royal Kraal. The two interviewees are therefore referred in this study as Respondent (A) and (B).

All the respondents speak Tshivenda as their first language which made it easier to communicate with the researcher who was a Venda speaking person.

Understanding on service delivery

The respondents representing traditional council displayed their understanding of service delivery and partially the mandate of Musina Municipality as a local government. The Respondent (A) expressed that the municipality was providing basic services such as water

taps, sanitation, RDP houses with major worry around water shortages. He said his worry was the fact that there was no secondary school around the area and argues that the government should have done something about the challenge.

The Respondent (A) also expressed his understanding on the implications caused by violent protests on the economic stability. He argues that it became a norm for government leaders to listen to the people when the situation is volatile. However he expressed his pity feelings when the municipality infrastructures were vandalized during protests. He furthermore expressed his view that the service delivery protests that happened under Musina Municipality didn't have huge impact on them as they merely happened in the townships. However he said "I think the local municipality should strengthen its capacity to raise people's problems to other departments because there are certain services it doesn't provide... we need police station and school closer to us".

The respondent (B) shared similar view with Respondent (A) where he said the biggest problem in Madimbo village was water shortage. He indicated that the municipality has done much better in its provision of RDP houses but failed them in relation to water. He said "Though I am happy that the municipality has provided households with water taps the shortage of water was a crisis that needs a serious attention. The tar road constructed in our area is a symbol that the ward councillor and the municipality were taking our interests to another level". The two respondents were in agreement that the water shortage was the core challenge around their area. The two respondents were also in agreement that the local municipality was on track in providing some other services except water.

Their understanding on compliance

Traditional representatives understanding on the responsibilities of protesters to be peaceful and to respect properties were satisfactory. The Respondent (A) displayed basic knowledge on what government needs people to conduct themselves during protests. He said "No matter how people differ in their views vandalising government properties to express dissatisfaction was unacceptable". He further more said "Honestly speaking, even though major protests happened in town it affect us also because it was not safe to go to Musina town during protests and our people couldn't do shopping there. Violent protests are not good because they vandalise government properties but sometimes make government leaders listen". He indicated that in his view where there are riots government leaders respond faster which makes community

members to stage protests to be heard. He argues that people should find peaceful solutions to their differences without bloodshed and properties vandalism.

Respondent (B) argues that violent protests affect the municipality and government budget in general because they spend money on repairing instead of new development. He also said “I personally advise people to be careful of perpetrators who hijack mass mobilization to commit crime in the name of service delivery”. He shared similar view with Respondent (A) where he said anarchy during protests was not a good way to express dissatisfaction. He also advised that community leaders should be vigilant against perpetrators who detour from mass mobilization to commit crimes in the name of service delivery protests. He also emphasized that his perception was “government listen faster where there is fire”.

Both respondents shared their consensus view that non-compliance during protests was not good because it affects government properties. Respondent (A) was of the view that violent protests make government to be more responsive. Similarly the respondent (B) had a perception that government does listen faster where there is fire.

Their understanding on government social contract

Traditional leaders expressed their clear understanding on the responsibilities of local government to render basic services to the people. Respondent (A) expressed his understanding of the municipality responsibilities to provide basic services to the people. He also expressed his view on what the Batho Pele principles guide the municipality on how its officials should conduct themselves to the people. He said the ward committee members and ward councillor were regularly updating the community on developments within the ward. He said the relationship between the municipality and traditional leadership was good because the municipality built the Multi-Purpose Centre for the community to enhance service delivery. He was happy about the Indigent Policy where he said “I commend the municipality on its indigent policy because it looks after those who are poor... at least it shows commitment to deliver services to all class of the people”. He said majority of the people in the area were indigents who rely on government grants to survive and emphasized that without government assistance life would have been a nightmare to them.

The Respondent (B) expressed his similar view with Respondent (A) where he conquered that the municipality was discharging its responsibilities to provide basic services. He also expressed his understanding on what local municipality, district and other spheres of government cater to

the public in a satisfactory way. He distinguished the fact that Musina Local Municipality was a water supplier whilst the Vhembe District Municipality was a water authority. He furthermore emphasized the need for the Musina Local Municipality to work hard in its collaboration with the Vhembe District Municipality to address the water challenge where he said “Though Vhembe District Municipality is a water authority whereas Musina Local Municipality is water supplier, the cordial relationship between the two would solve our crisis”. He however challenged that “The people participation when there were Mayoral Imbizo and government meetings should be intensified”. He argued that information was critical for the people to keep updated in all government developments.

All the respondents were in agreement that Musina Municipality should have addressed the water crisis differently by making effort to Vhembe District municipality to discharge its social responsibility.

Their Understanding on government communication

Traditional leaders displayed their understanding regarding local government responsibility to communicate with stakeholders and people in general. The Respondent (A) expressed his understanding that the municipality was using communication models such as Mayoral Imbizo, SMS line and other platforms to communicate with the people. He said the municipality was not leaving its stakeholders outside as far as communication was concerned. He commended the ward councillor and ward committee members for the role they were playing to mobilise the community. He also said “I commend the municipality for discharging its responsibility of giving feedbacks and updating people on any development that affects them”.

The respondent (B) said the municipality communication was effective because its officials acknowledged traditional leaders role. He said “We haven’t had any situation where the municipality and its agencies bypassed us when doing developments in our area without our knowledge”. He commended the municipality for its effort to use the Community Centre built in the area to conduct community meetings to give reports. He conquered with respondent (A) that ward committee members and ward councillors were playing significant role of mobilising the community.

Both respondents shared similar views that the municipality was keeping its stakeholders on the loop as far as development was concerned. They were in consensus that ward councillor and ward committee members were playing their pivotal role in mobilising the community.

Bibliographical data of Ward Councillors

The ward councillors of Musina-Nancefield, Madimbo and Tshipise were all males with the age brackets of 26-30, 41-50 and 51-60 respectively. Their educational backgrounds ranged from grades 10 and 12 plus tertiary qualifications. All ward councillors were Venda speaking people and deployees of the African National Congress to the local municipality. The interview with ward councillor of Madimbo village referred in this study as Respondent (C) was conducted on the 18 of November 2016 at Musina Extension 4. The interview with ward councillor of Tshipise village referred in this study as Respondent (D) was conducted at Thohoyandou Venda Plaza on the 09 of December 2016. The telephone interview with ward councillor of Musina-Nancefield town referred in this study as Respondent (E) was conducted on the 20 of November 2016.

Understanding on service delivery

All ward councillors displayed understanding of the local municipalities' responsibilities to render effective basic and social needs to the people. They expressed their understanding of the core mandates of local municipalities to serve the people socially and economically.

The Respondent (C) expressed his view that Musina Municipality was committed to serve the people effectively. He emphasized that during his term service delivery of basic needs such as water, RDP houses and sanitation were satisfactory hence he never experienced any protest in his ward. He said "The relationship between myself, the municipality and stakeholders helped me to serve my people with dedication. The municipality has built the Thusong Community Centre, RDP Houses to needy people and constructed the tar road that connects Madimbo area with Musina town amongst many other things". He admitted that the only biggest challenge was water shortage which he said he regularly communicated with the community about the district plans to solve it. He furthermore admitted that he experienced some challenges more especially the community anger in relation to water shortage which he said never escalated to protests.

The Respondent (D) expressed that the municipality was committed to discharge its own responsibility of serving its communities. He said the water taps were provided according to the IDP standards which dictate that after each 500 metres there should be water taps. He said basic needs such as sanitation and RDP houses were provided. He said his responsibility as ward councillor was to facilitate the beneficiary list of RDP houses for the municipality to submit it to the Coghsta which he did effectively. He said the major challenge in his ward was unemployment and argues that most people don't regard it as part of service delivery but in his

view it is. He said “Jobs are part of service delivery because government has the responsibility to be the custodian of social welfare which needs money derived from tax of workers and businesses”.

The Respondent (E) expressed his view that the municipality was providing good services to the people in his ward. He said the municipality was able to provide basic needs such as water, sanitation and maintenance of roads and streets amongst others. In his view service delivery protests that took place were not really stemmed by poor services. He emphasized that the 2012 protests in Musina-Nancefield was not mainly about service delivery but workers problems in Venetia mine.

All respondents (C), (D) and (E) were in agreement that the municipality has performed well in its mandate to serve the people diligently. Both respondent (C) and (D) were in agreement that they have never experienced service delivery protests in the wards. Respondent (E) was of the view that protests that happened in his area was not necessarily about service delivery but mining issues perpetuated as service delivery.

Their understanding on compliance

Respondent (C) shared his view that violence was not progressive and urged people to use diplomatic channels to seek solutions. He reiterated his position that during his term he never experienced any protests but argues that people should exercise their democratic right of protest with caution to protect government properties. He said “I personally denounced the act of vandalism of properties because government properties benefit the same people who vandalise them”. Respondent (D) shared similar view with Respondent (C) where he argues that government policy that regulates protests was fine because it protect democracy which allows people to exercise their democratic right to protest but with accountability. He denounced the act of those who took advantage of genuine protests to advance their criminal elements. He urged protesters everywhere to respect the rule of law and protect valuable infrastructure from vandalism because they are the investment of government to benefit them.

Both respondents (C) and (D) were of the view that the government policy framework that governs protests was fine. However the respondent (E) argued that the gathering act was too soft to anarchy because protesters easily detoured from their genuine issues and use violence. He said the act “should be tight to hold accountable those who use violence to destroy property during protests”.

Their understanding on government Social Contract

All ward councillors displayed their advanced knowledge on the understanding of social contract or responsibilities of government to serve the people and spearhead prosperous society. They all disputed the notion that Musina Municipality was letting down its people in providing basic services to the people.

The Respondent (C) said the municipality was committed to Batho Pele principles because in an overall it was able to consult and plan with its people. He said the track record of the municipality was clear that it was committed to improve the quality of lives to its people. The Respondent (D) expressed his view that the municipality was complying with the principles of Batho Pele. He said there were backlogs of basic services that existed in his ward caused by extension of new residential areas. He denounced those who were rigid to him and said this to the researcher, "I would like you to note that some community members took advantage that they are the ones who elected us as councillors just to make life difficult for us unnecessary". He argued that those in new extensions should understand that the municipality use budget to deliver services to avoid irregular expenditures. He furthermore emphasized the importance of people to be patient and wait for their financial year's budget allocations and blamed impatience from community as serious challenge that faced him. The Respondent (E) was adamant that the municipality was committed to its responsibilities to provide services to the people. He said the municipality was committed to its promises to the people. He said "Where there were foreseen and unforeseen circumstances the municipality through its ward councillors and ward committee members amongst others people were updated about any developments that could affect them".

All the ward councillors were in agreement that the municipality was committed to serve the people with dedication and within its ability.

Their understanding on government communication

The respondent's reflections on the communication guidelines of local municipality were very satisfactory. They all supported the existence of Imbizo as an effective government instrument for communication. They all supported platforms such as budget, IDP meetings as effective for local government and communities to reflect on the issues affecting the people.

The Respondent (C) view was that the municipality was communicating with the people effectively and gives feedbacks as required by government. He said the communication policy

carried by the municipality that dictates that ward councillors should report to the people quarterly and at least once a month to the community was effective. He said he acknowledge the importance of all stakeholders in his wards such as traditional leaders, civics, ward committees and others. He said his working relationship with stakeholders was good and never gets disrupted due to the mutual trust existing amongst them. He furthermore said “It was my obligation to report progress to community on monthly and quarterly basis which I honoured during my term as a ward councillor. In the event of emergency various stakeholders regularly invited me or vice versa to address issues such as crime and development that needs special attention”.

The respondent (D) shared similar view with Respondent (C) that the municipality was communicating with the people effectively and provide feedbacks as required by government. He said the SMS line system introduced by the municipality was useful when mobilising the community for meetings. He said there were no communication breakdown between him and the community because all the differences he had with them were resolved through dialogues. He said his reporting programme includes meeting the community monthly and do fortnight reporting to the traditional leaders, and quarterly using rotation method. He said he was able to link his stakeholders to relevant parties if needed assistance and interventions that were beyond his mandate.

The Respondent (E) shared the similar view with Respondents (C) and (D) where he argued that the municipality communication framework was effective. He said the participation of the people in his ward was satisfactory which shows the apathy of residents to participate in the municipality processes. He said the Mayoral Imbizo and other meetings was a good sign that the municipality was for the people. He further emphasised the importance of the residents to participate in the decision making processes because it afford them opportunity to be heard.

They were all in agreement that the municipality communication platforms were effective. They were all in agreement that it was through participation where people can engage their leaders to pursue them to take well informed decisions that respond to the real issues that affect their lives.

Bibliographical data of Civics

The Civic members of Musina-Nancefield, Madimbo and Tshipise who participated in the interview were all males with the age brackets of 26-30 and 31-40 respectively. Their

educational backgrounds were ranging from grade 11 and 12 plus tertiary qualifications. All Civic members were Venda speaking. The interview with Musina-Nancefield civic representative referred in this study as Respondent (F) was conducted on the 19 of November 2016 at Musina Extension 08. The interview with Tshipise village representative referred as Respondent (G) was conducted on the 19 of November 2016 at Musina Extension 08. The interview with Madimbo civic representative referred as Respondent (H) was conducted on the 19 of November 2016 at Madimbo Royal Kraal.

Understanding of service delivery

All Civic members displayed clear understanding of the local municipalities' responsibilities to render effective basic and social needs to the people. They expressed their understanding of the core mandate of local municipalities to serve the people with social and economic needs.

The Respondent (F) disapproved the level of services delivered by the municipality. He said that "The failure by the ANC to recall its mayor Ms Carol Phiri and Chiefwhip Mr Madamalala frustrated the community because the two were at the centre of service delivery problems" who were left with no choice but to protests. His response on the level of service delivery in his area was that more houses have been occupied by foreigners and those who don't qualify to have RDP houses in their area. He indicated that beneficiary list was tempered with by the municipality or ward councillor to accommodate those who don't qualify. He added that the traffic station at some stage closed down in 2012 and people had to go to Louis Trichardt to get services. He also said "The residents were suspicious about possible corruption in relation to the incomplete road that cost taxpayers R17.5 million of taxpayers in Musina. Some senior positions were vacant without being filled which compromise service delivery. The Municipal Mayor has appointed manager in her office where as she had personal assistant without council resolutions".

The Respondent (G) said the services delivered by the municipality were not up to standard. He said the processes of RDP construction was corrupt and lamented the quality of them as substandard. He furthermore emphasized that there was challenge of water provision in the area where he argued that there was a different between having water taps and having running water. He also said "In my view the municipality was not adhering to its "Batho Pele" principles particularly on the 'Redress' issue. If the municipality was responsive and polite in handling all the problems submitted to them the unrest experienced in Musina area would have not

occurred. I think there were some elements of corruption in relation to RDP houses allocation and the quality thereof was not up to standard. In my ward for an example, water taps are there but there is no water". The Respondent (H) said the provision of services such as electricity and RDP houses were satisfactory. However he was worried about the lack of water provision challenge where he argues that the government processes to address people's needs take long to yield fruits. He also said "I think the municipality was adhering to the Batho Principles because its working relationship with stakeholders was good. If the municipality could address the water shortage problem as a matter of urgency our municipality would be the best municipality in the district".

The respondent (F) was adamant that the municipality was not providing effective service delivery. He was of the view that possible corruption was at the play behind lack of services. The respondent (G) was of the view that the process of RDP houses allocation was corrupt which is similarly to the view of respondent (F). The respondent (H) was happy about the municipality overall performance except on the shortage of water.

Their understanding on compliance

All civic representatives shared similar sentiments that violence was not progressive rather people should use all legal means to seek solutions. The Respondent (F) condemned act of violence during protests where he said that politicians whom the protesters wanted to be removed from the municipality council for allegations of corruption and maladministration planted their agents to tarnish peaceful marches as violent to divert attention. He said the protesters who participated in the major protest that took place in 2012 in Musina-Nancefield were not violent but charged there were elements of intimidation by police to the protesters. He shared with the researcher the avenues his civic tried prior and after the protest to engage relevant parties. He said "We handed our memorandum of grievance to the mayor on the 07 of March 2017 which never yielded positive results. We handed memorandum on the 07 May 2012 to the ANC sub region in Musina about poor service delivery in the municipality under its governance but they ignored us. Subsequently to that we embarked on major service delivery protest in Musina-Nancefield townships. From there we submitted the memorandum to the municipality on the 21 August 2012 raising same issues of poor service delivery because there was no improvement".

In his view there was no political will by the municipality to listen to the people. He challenged the government policy that governs protests because it suppresses the gathering of people without formal application. He challenged that “the act must be reviewed because it just guides people how they should conduct themselves which is a good thing but it suppress people to gather without application. The act gives police more power to intimidate protesters. He said “For an example in the major protest that turn violent the intimidation by police to peaceful protesters fuelled violence”, the respondent (F) concludes.

The Respondent (G) said “The act on its current format insinuates fear to prevent people to exercise their democratic right to protest. In my view protests strengthen the ability of government to render effective service delivery but anarchy is anarchy and it must be treated as such. Police have a tendency to instill fear to the protesters as a way of protecting the interests of politicians rather than respecting the right of those protesting to exercise their democratic right”. The Respondent (H) argued that the government policy on protests insinuate fear to prevent people to exercise their democratic right to protest. He said protest strengthen the ability of government to render effective services however he denounced the act of anarchy. He also urged every participant in the protests to exercise their democratic rights with caution and protect government infrastructures from vandalism. He also mentioned that the short-lived service delivery protest his community staged in 2013 against the Tshamutumbu police satellite was not mainly directed against the municipality but the satellite itself which in his view was not fighting crime properly.

Representatives from all civics shared similar views that protesters should respect the rule of law and protect valuable infrastructure from vandalism because they are the investment of government to benefit the people. They all understood the gathering act 205 of 1993 that dictates that protesters should be peaceful and take full responsibility of their actions. Both respondents (F) and (G) were in consensus that the gathering act insinuates fear to the protesters to exercise their democratic right without being subjected to fear. Respondent (H) was of the view that the application process was lengthy.

Their understanding on government Social Contract

Representatives from all civics displayed their clear understanding on the responsibilities of the municipality to discharge Bathopele Principles to the people. The Respondent (F) charged that the municipality was not strictly adhering to the Bathopele Principles. He said the municipality

political leadership was unresponsive and not accountable to the people. He said his civic engaged the municipality several times to address the issue of incomplete road, water provision and traffic station problems without political will from the municipality to listen. He said there were more RDP houses occupied by foreign nationals unlawfully and argued that there was a persistent tendency within the municipality to allow ward councillors to temper with beneficiary lists. He charged that ward councillor in ward 03 who was appointed as Chiefwhip in the municipality was unresponsive to the demands of the people. He furthermore charged that he was arrogant hence the protesters vandalised his house.

The Respondent (G) said the municipality was not adhering to the Batho Pele principles particularly on the 'Redress'. He said if the municipality was responsive and polite in handling all the grievances submitted to them by concerned groups the unrest experienced by Musina Municipality would have been prevented. He advised that going forward the municipality should treat allegations levelled against its officials very seriously because they constrain its relationship with the residents. The Respondent (H) said the municipality was adhering to the Batho Pele principles because its working relationship with stakeholders was good. He however expressed his dissatisfaction with the constrained relationship his civic had with the ward councillor which he described as 'bad'. He said the fact that his civic relationship with the councillor was bad didn't amount to suggest he was unresponsive to the need of the community at large.

The Respondent (F) and (H) were in agreement that the municipality was not adhering to Batho Pele principles because it was unresponsive to the people's concerns. The Respondent (H) hold a contrary view, in his view the municipality was adhering to Batho Pele principles except that it was unable to resolve water problem.

Their understanding on government communication

Respondent's reflection on the communication guidelines of local municipality were very satisfactory. They all supported the existence of Imbizo as an effective government instrument for communication. They all supported platforms such as budget, IDP meetings as effective for local government and communities to reflect on the issues affecting the people but with cautions.

The Respondent (F) was of the view that the municipality communication models such as Mayoral Imbizo and quarterly meetings were good but not effective and unresponsive to urgent

issues. He however said they were important because they afford the residents opportunity to be part of discussions with their political leadership. He however argued that such platforms were used for compliance not to reflect on the issues communities have. In his view, political leaders do not use views expressed by communities' members but impose their wishes when rolling out implementations programmes.

The Respondent (G) shared his view that the municipality communication models such as Mayoral Imbizo and IDP/Budget reviews were conducted for compliance sake not to listen to the wishes of the residents. He challenged the notion that community needs should have to wait for Mayoral Imbizo rotation and Quarterly meetings whilst they have challenges. He also said "The size of community participation is not growing because of broken promises".

The Respondent (H) was adamant that the communication policy of the municipality was good. He said the Mayoral Imbizo and IDP/Budget reviews were important because they afford the community to raise their concerns and make proposal that inform the municipality actions. He also commended the municipality decision to build the Madimbo Community Centre which they use for meetings and access of government services. He however said the less participation by residents in the municipality and government meetings revealed that the apathy needs to be stimulated as a matter of urgency.

Both Respondents (F) and (G) hold the same view that Mayoral Imbizo, IDP/Budget reviews and quarterly meetings were good but not responsive to the urgent needs of the people. They also share similar view that community views were not taken into account when the municipality implement its programmes. Both Respondent (F) and (G) hold similar view that the public participation in government meetings was not satisfactory while Respondent (H) had a contrary view.

6.2.1.2 Political Analysts

The two political analysts understanding on service delivery protests and their implications on the economy provided insight to the researcher.

Bibliographical data of Political Analysts

They were all males in the age brackets of 31-40 and 41-50. Their qualifications were matric and tertiary qualifications. All the respondents speak Tshivenda as their first language which made it easier to communicate with the researcher who is a Venda speaking person. The

telephone interview with first political analyst referred in this study as Respondent (I) was conducted on the 21 of November 2016. The second telephone interview with another political analyst referred in this section as Respondent (J) was conducted on the 08 of December 2016.

Understanding on service delivery

The Respondent (I) said “The government components were regarded by politicians as platform for self accumulation”. He said massive service delivery protests that happened in South Africa were symbol that the discontent between government and the people was growing. He furthermore challenged that the primary responsibility of local municipalities was to deliver services on the grassroots. He furthermore emphasized that “The unresponsive political leadership frustrated the people who elected them to use protests as their last avenue to display their frustrations”.

The Respondent (J) argued that rural municipalities across the country were not getting enough budget which affect service delivery. He said the National Budget allocated for municipalities get hijacked before it reaches them which affect the efficiency of services. He was adamant that nationwide there should be a review on strategic positions appointment because cadre deployment was killing the efficiency of most municipalities.

Their understanding on compliance

The Respondents (I) argued that when people are ignored by their leaders they create spaces for themselves to be heard. He said the “Unresponsive government leaders frustrate peaceful protesters who end up pursuing violent as a last resort to raise their dissatisfaction”. He further mentioned that “When petitions are ignored and meetings used for formality sake not to use people’s views the disgruntled use their own spaces to display their frustrations”. He further indicated that protesters in general appeared to have lost confidence in government processes

The Respondent (J) argued that police should get proper education on how to conduct themselves when dealing with crowds. He said there was a persistent tendency by politicians to use police to intimidate protesters which creates hostile environment friendly to anarchy. He argued that protesters generally were not violent but blamed police lack of experience to handle crowds as weakness that need to be addressed seriously.

Both analysts displayed understanding on the responsibilities of protesters to be peaceful and to respect properties were satisfactory. Whilst the Respondent (J) hold a view that police attitude

fuels tension during protest the Respondent (I) holds the view that unresponsive from government frustrate the protesters who use their own spaces to be heard.

Their understanding on government social contract

The Respondent (I) argues that the commitment of public representatives to comply with government own policies was worrying. He said the frustrations of the protesters were stemmed out of unresponsive to their basic needs.

Respondent (J) emphasized that the government was unresponsive to the social contract it has made with its people to be the catalyst of service delivery and development. He said “The spirit of government officials to be the servants of the people was diminishing because politicians have hijacked the government to be their own tool to advance self interests”. He commended the national government decision to adopt Local Government White Paper of 1998 which in his view serves as the torchbearer for service delivery. However, he was cautious about the infiltration of political deployment which in his view was disrupting the planning around effective service delivery because politicians prioritized projects that benefit them.

Their Understanding on government communication

The Respondent (I) emphasized that communication is an important tool to maintain healthy relationship between government and the people. He emphasized the need for government leaders to display honesty when engaging the people because the scepticism that they use communication models for compliance purpose only is serious.

The Respondent (J) said “Ward committee and ward councillors had an important role to communicate regularly with the communities’ members to keep them on the loop of any developments to avoid unnecessary tensions caused by miscommunications”. He furthermore emphasized the need for ward councillors and ward committee members to maintain their relationships with residents. He also said that the broken relationship between councillors and ward committee members affect the municipalities because they serve as bridge between the residents and municipalities. He further indicated that effective communication is a most pivotal tool that municipalities should use to maintain its relationship with communities members. Both analysts were in agreement that effective communication is important to build a healthy relationship between municipalities and the people.

6.3 MUNICIPALITY REPRESENTATIVES

The municipality delegated its male manager who was at the age brackets of 41-50 with grade 12 and post matric qualifications. The researcher and municipality official referred in this section as Respondent (K) met at Musina Municipality offices (Eric Louw) on the 18 of November 2016.

On the service delivery issues the Respondent (K) said the fact that the municipality obtains clean audits between the periods of 2007-2014 where this study focused on proved public money was used properly to improve the lives of the people. He said “As the municipality we view the issue of regular expenditure and clean audits so seriously because we are committed to use public money properly. You will recall that as the municipality we haven’t experienced a trend of protests which prove that service delivery is reaching the people”. He argues that the municipality respect Batho Pele principles hence they use public resources to improve the lives of the people.

On the Communication efficiency the Respondent (K) argued that effective communication between the municipality and community structures was in good shape between the periods of 2007-2014 where the study focused on. He said “The level of community participation was satisfactory because all our stakeholders were taking community gatherings very serious between the periods you are investigating. Some people politicised the gatherings whereas as the municipality we were dealing with government issues”. He disclosed all of the strategies used by the municipality to communicate with its communities to bring the municipality closer to the people. Mayoral Imbizo, Ward Committee members monthly reporting and Ward Councillors quarterly and monthly reporting to the communities were strategies used in place to update communities about the progress made thereof. He also mentioned that the municipality introduced the SMS line system and social media platforms to maximise its effort to reach as many people as possible. He was adamant that the municipality was responsive to concerned groups where he said “We, as the municipality call meetings with concerned groups to find common ground. Their memorandums were responded to face to face by the municipality political leadership. The municipality political leadership tried its level best to engage with leaders of protests to find amicable solutions. The municipality council has responded to letters of grievances coming from unsatisfied people”.

On the Gathering Act of 1993 the Respondent (K) has denounced the act of vandalism and admitted that it did affect the confidence of the investors which compromise the efforts of the municipality to achieve its goal of being the growth point in the Limpopo Province. He said “I

personally consider it effective because it affords protesters to protest but observing the constitution of the country. It protects the rights of protesters and those who are not part of the protests and condemn violence. It also discourages illegal gatherings that undermine the law of the country". He admitted that violent service delivery protests that occurred in Musina had an effect on the economy. He said "It affected us negatively because around 2012 we have been in the spotlight as a result of violent protest that we experienced as the municipality. Business sector consider stability and safety when doing business in any area. Our municipality has been identified in the province as an economic growth point of which any protests accompanied by violence deter investors in our areas".

6.4 THE MUNICIPALITY DOCUMENTS

The researcher compared respondent's responses with the municipality and governments documents to see their similarities and discrepancies. The Musina media press release of 2014 after the investigation of corruption, price inflation and nepotism against the municipality which was conducted by Public Protector Office vindicated the municipality. Allegations levelled against the municipality by communities' members appeared to be politically influenced to delegitimize some targeted senior managers within the municipality.

The IDP document of 2012-2013-2017 presented the commitment by Musina municipality as the catalyst of development. The document together with annual performance report of 2013-2014 that covered from 2009 to 2014 proved that the municipality was engaging its stakeholders. The participation of stakeholders in stakeholder's forum meetings was quantifiably recorded. The municipality identified the challenges in Agricultural sectors and non-compliance of employers to hire locals in the sector amongst other challenges stipulated in details in Chapter 6 of this study.

The Annual Performance Report of 2013-2014 that cover the financial year 2009/10, 2010/11, 2011/12, 2012/13 and 2013/14 proved that the allegations from communities that Musina municipality was not rendering adequate services were just perceptions not backed by convincing evidence. The service delivery protests that Musina Municipality experienced were not mainly about service delivery provisions but result of political influences. The influence of trade unions in the municipality politics played a role in fuelling the mistrust between the municipality and stakeholders. Though the municipality had its own weaknesses its commitment to provide services to the people was sound.

The Coghsta notice state of the municipalities' report 2010/2011 disclosed that Musina Municipality compliance to the Municipal Financial Management Act was good. It's complied with the supply chain management, revenue enhancement strategy and had audit committee. The report proved that the finances of the municipality were safe hence it obtained a qualified audit as already mentioned in this chapter. However, its jobs creation strategy through local economic department was below par.

6.5 RESEARCH ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

The research topic, processes and its objectives were discussed with the participants before they participated in the project. The researcher displayed the respect of participants to participate voluntarily (Smith 2003). Participants right to dignity, confidentiality and their privacy were explained to them in details. The Researcher acknowledged to the participants that the research would not be used for any other purpose contrary to its intended objectives as stipulated in Chapter one of this study. The researcher respected the dignity of participants and ensured that no injuries and mental harm were sustained during the whole process. The right to confidentiality of the participants and right to withdraw from the research participation were explained in details.

6.6 CONCLUSION

This study analysed and interpreted the data collected using qualitative methods such as interviews and literature sources. The qualitative data gathered from Musina Municipality representative, Musina municipality residents in various capacities, political analysts, municipality and government documents on service delivery were analysed.

CHAPTER SEVEN

GENERAL CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter will interpret the findings of the research project in line with its objectives and draw conclusions. The findings of this reach will draw conclusions and highlight how the objectives of the research were achieved. In addition, recommendations that address the findings of the study problems are made in this chapter.

Findings of all the chapters are coalesced where evidence attained through qualitative methodology is noted to distinguish similarities and scattered information. Making comparison and differences assessment improves the validity of the findings. Therefore qualitative research approach was instrumental to gather in depth understanding and attitude of the respondents on the matter investigated in an observational conduct to avoid inclination. Inclination deprives a research project to secure quality findings if not countered by qualitative approach to gather in depth understanding of the problem and rely only on basic available information.

7.2 FINDINGS

The main aim of the study was to critically examine service delivery protests implications on the economic stability of Musina Municipality.

As stipulated in chapter one the objectives of the research study were:

- To analyse why protesters resort to non compliance mechanisms during protests and the effectiveness of government policy in controlling non-compliance.
- To analyse the municipality commitment to fulfil its social contract to render effective service delivery to the people.
- To analyse the state of communication between the municipality and its community.

7.2.1 Musina Municipality

During the interview a Musina Municipality official raised his concern against service delivery protests that were conducted in a violent manner. He argued that though the government respects the rights of everyone to protest as stipulated in the constitution it should be done peacefully without tempering with infrastructure.

His concerns around vandalizing of government and private sector properties were serious and urged members of the communities to use diplomatic avenues to solve the problems. He argued that vandalizing of properties affected their budget because they end up spending money on repairing damages and spend more time on engaging people than concentrating on development. His worry was also around the reputational crisis the municipality suffers in the eyes of the investors hence the municipality was identified as a growing point of the province due to its economic strategic location.

There was strong opinion from the municipality point of view that protesters should realize that government properties were meant for their benefits not office bearers and politicians whom they may be directing their anger to. Though the official disputed that there was miscommunications between the municipality and the communities he admitted that effective communication was essential to maintain healthy relationships. He favoured the municipality Integrated Development Planning, Budget meetings, Mayoral Imbizo, and monthly meetings conducted by ward committees and councillors as good models for engaging communities. He also disclosed the fact that the municipality created social networks and SMS database lines to communicate with people when there were needs to acknowledge; the municipality took communication as a serious issue to avoid breakdown. As part of the effort to communicate better in a modern way the municipality updated its website on a weekly basis.

7.2.2 IDP MUSINA MUNICIPALITY 2011/2012

7.2.2.1 BASIC SERVICE DELIVERY

The Musina Municipality has committed itself to supply surfaced and underground water to its communities after it has been treated at Water Treatment Works. However, the Musina Local Municipality was a water service provider whilst the District municipality was a water service authority (IDP 2011/2012).

The municipality committed itself to provide basic services to all the households receiving remuneration of less than R2500.00 free of charges. The municipality committed to provide 6000 kiloliters to all the households connected with water. The municipality identified areas of Madimbo, Malale, Domboni, Tanda and Tshikhudini as free beneficiaries. All households that received less than R2500.00 in the mentioned areas were promised to receive 235.7 kilowatts of electricity per month. Water taps connections were to be utilized in Musina and Nancefield

whereas stand pipes were done in Madimbo, Malale, Domboni, Tanda and Tshikhudini respectively (IDP 2011/2012).

7.2.2.2 INDIGENT POLICY

On the indigent policy, the municipality developed a register where indigents apply annually on each financial year. Communities were given notices to apply on municipality offices and its satellites where their financial statuses were to be scrutinized annually to check if they were still qualifying or can be off-loaded from the system. The indigent policy was adopted by the municipality on 2003 and it was reviewed annually to accommodate new developments where the municipality sees the needs to do so (IDP 2011/2012).

7.2.2.3 PRIORITY FOCUS AREA

The municipality Priority focus area for 2011-2012 financial years was as follows:

- Establish Manufacturing Incubator in Musina town.
- Undertake poster campaign to entice business start-ups in projects identified by LED Strategy.
- Investigate potential and promote opportunities for development of retail, industrial, storage & distribution and wholesale enterprises and transport hub.
- Establish local Business Support Centre in Nancefield.
- Create rural community support cooperatives in Madimbo, Malale and Domboni.
- Provide land claims support.
- Undertake expansion of aquaculture production and extension of aquaculture value chain linkages.
- Establish vegetable processing plant in Musina town.
- Develop map and brochures of local tourism facilities and attractions and improve and increase road signage to villages, major attractions and facilities.
- Establish arts and crafts, jewellery and ornament incubator, exhibition and workshop stalls and curio shop linked to tourism information centre in Musina town; and establish database of available land for mining development and encourage commencement of mining activities with existing mineral rights owners.

The municipality identified agricultural sector as critical for economic boom however acknowledged that there were constraints that need to be addressed:

- Lack of access to funding, start-up capital and loans.
- Lack of business management skills.
- Access to market.
- Distance to markets.
- Transport of perishable goods.
- Consistency of supply of raw product.
- Lack of production facilities.
- Lack of marketing.
- Lack of access to producers (emerging farmers).
- Transport costs of bulky product.
- Competition from imports.
- Lack of land for development.
- Transport problems are a constraining factor.

With Musina Municipality closer to the border bridge with Zimbabwe commercializing agricultural products remain a critical challenge because the demand to supply other provinces was not easy with long distances unlike Gauteng which is in the centre to other provinces.

7.2.3 COMMUNITY LEADERS

Community leaders had mixed feelings where those particularly in urban argued that their relationship with the municipality was compromised due to political leaders who were not accountable. They recommended that political leaders deployed in the municipality should be accountable and responsive to the people's demands. Those in rural revealed that their relationship with government was cordial and intended for development. However they recommended that the municipality should take forward the issue of water shortages as a matter of urgency. Those in urban expressed their view that communities fight with government as a result of miscommunications which in their view should be improved. They also argue that service delivery protests lead to progress though they condemned those who use criminal elements to advance their narrow interests as opportunists who should be isolated. There was

strong consensus on community leaders that non-compliance during protests was unfortunate incidents that must be rooted out from the communities.

7.2.4 POLITICAL ANALYSTS

The analysts solicited for the study expressed the view that South Africans were not generally violent but use violent protests to display their anger towards unresponsive government leaders. Both of them admitted that violent service delivery protests were unfortunate because they disrupt productions of the economy. One recommended that the government in general should take a lesson of miscommunications and lack of consultation that caused turmoil in Matatiele, Vuwani, Bekkersdal and Merafong-Khutsong protests. He also recommended that inputs made by the people in government meetings should be considered into plans than meeting them for compliance purpose. The other argued that there should be a nationwide review on strategic positions appointment to promote delivery efficiency.

7.3 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING SERVICE DELIVERY

The findings of this study revealed that there were critical areas that the government should improve to render adequate services to the people. The municipality should guard itself from power abuse and be transparent in its recruitment policies. Administrative positions should be monitored strictly and occupied by competent, talented and committed people. The municipality should tighten its skills development programmes to its employees to improve service delivery and economic growth. The municipality should be responsive on time when community members are frustrated over questionable developments unfolding within the municipality. The municipality should be vigilant against the influence of trade unions.

Political inclusion of the stakeholders by the municipality should be improved because protesters don't stage protests because of service delivery backlogs only but as result of exclusion on the processes that determined certain outcomes. Ward committees participation in helping ward councilors to improve the lives of the people in their respective wards should be monitored and evaluated based on the deliverance plan initiated by the municipality.

7.3.1 DEALING WITH NON-COMPLIANCE IN COMMUNITIES

Providing education to the people to protect government infrastructure is essential hence violence and vandalism threaten democratic means to address challenges. This must be done through engaging stakeholders relevant to disseminate the message to their constituencies. The violent culture adopted by the people to solve problems should be rooted out from the society and condemned as backwardness act that undermines developments. Municipalities should stick on the IDP and promises they have made to the people. Where there are unforeseen circumstances leaders from government should explain developments to the people in time to avoid escalation of tensions caused by backlogs.

Community structures should isolate criminality elements that hijack genuine protests as unprogressive and report them to relevant authorities. Those who commit crimes during protests should be isolated and face the full might of the law on their own without getting warm reception from the people. Failure to deal with non-compliance from community level instills and condones culture of vandalism that blocks economic development.

Community leaders should provide leadership where there are uncertainties instead of pursuing their agenda using the people as stepping ladders. Communities' members should always be vigilant against opportunists who use protests for their gains. Communities' members should consider protests as a last resort after exhausting negotiation avenues.

7.3.2 IMPROVING COMMUNICATION

The municipality should strengthen its strategies to grow participation of the communities' members in its reaching people programmes. Miscommunications phenomenon is a complex matter which cannot be blamed on one party only. Failure by the municipality to communicate with its stakeholders about any developments that affect people has a potential of creating hostility. Equally the communities' structures are not immune from committing blunders hence they should guard themselves from influencing people through deceitful communications. Communities should be the drivers of their destination and view municipality as their partner for development. Communities should participate in government events to get information and make well informed decisions knowing the real challenges that the government is faced with. Participation addresses directly the problems of misperception which often lead to grossly

allegations. Communities' members should not vest everything on their leaders but participate in government events to have more knowledge regarding decision making processes carried out by the municipality. Opportunists take advantage of the ill-informed people and intensify their goals contrary to what the people want. Being closer enables all the stakeholders to seek clarities where they don't understand some of the things.

7.3.3 IMPROVING ADHERENCE TO SOCIAL CONTRACT

The municipality should strengthen its adherence to Batho Pele principles. The municipality should always be courtesy in its affairs with the people and act fast where serious allegations that could cause instability arise. Administrative affairs of the municipality should be transparent to avoid reputational dent that affords political opportunists to capitalize. The value for money principle should always be observed hence irregular and wasteful expenditures give rise to suspicions that public money were not accounted for properly. As mentioned in chapter five of this research the main cause of service delivery protests in Musina was not mainly about poor delivery but other influences that centered on the administrative. The more the people understand their democratic right the more they become vigilant to protect them. The municipality should act fast against its employees who are faced with misconduct and corruption charges to avoid appearing as defensive than acting.

7.3.4 IMPROVING POLITICAL INCLUSION

The municipality political leadership should strengthen its political relationship with its stakeholders. Political inclusions help stakeholders and community leaders to understand the decision processes that guided certain developments within the municipality. Political decisions such as deployment, re-deployment and suspensions are sensitive by nature and must be communicated with interested parties amicably. The prerogative powers assigned to political parties to appoint people in the municipal council must be properly managed because they have the potential to contaminate the relationship that political leaders have with various stakeholders. The relationship between the political parties and the municipality is intertwined but should be distinguished. Political parties make promises to the people during elections campaigns which may not be achievable within the municipality chains of doing things. All the political parties represented in the municipal council should strive towards a peaceful atmosphere by educating their constituencies to use progressive means to resolve their

grievances. Political deployees serving in the council should provide leadership and strengthen their working relationship with all the stakeholders to have a sustainable environment conducive to dialogues.

7.3.5 IMPROVING AWARENESS

The municipality, community leaders and all interested stakeholders should play a significant role in conducting awareness to educate people about infrastructure significance. The trend of misdirecting anger by the protesters destroys the fruits yielded by government to benefit the same protesters. Government money used for damage repairs caused by violent protests delays the implementations of new projects which cause backlogs further. Infrastructure development has been identified by the national government in its National Development Plan as a critical milestone towards economic development. Infrastructure development is the key that unlocks jobs development, skills revolution and economic stability of the country. Musina Municipality has been identified at the province as an economic growth point due to its strategic position and it should take advantage of that. The natural resources such as mining and farming and geographical location of the municipality should be protected for economic reasons.

7.4 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

Errors during the interpretation of the findings of this study were possible. However all the findings of this study based on observations, interview and documents analyzed are accepted as factual.

The semi-structure open-ended, semi-structured individual interviews and data available collected in Musina area and elsewhere helped to validate the study. The findings of the study cannot generalize the solutions of service delivery protests in other regions outside Musina where the study was conducted hence challenges may differ. However most of findings may reflect the problems that ever happened elsewhere in the country.

The sample technique conducted in Musina areas was a reflection of the whole municipality. The data collected from community leaders and political analysts reflect the wider range as well. The assumption is that the findings of the data collected that reflects wider range may be

accepted as valid however the conclusions may be backed by further researches around service delivery protests.

This study might have found more useful information if there was no time constraints from some of the respondents and lack of commitment from all the targeted groups to respond truly. Some of the respondents were biased and defensive to what appeared as dodging accountability of what relate to their actions.

7.5 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY

As this study alluded on its limitations of the study subtopic that it had its own limitations it is recommended that future studies should be conducted to investigate service delivery implications on economic stability as a national study. As the samples used to collect data on this study were not representative of South Africa and the continent it is recommended that more samples that would represent the country and the continent be conducted.

As this study could not validate the possibility of corruption and regime change as other factors behind protests more investigations around the subject is recommended. The exploration to generalize solutions of service delivery protests in Musina to wider range and assess their relevancy to other areas is recommended. It is therefore recommended for further studies test the validity of this study conclusion to other areas where similar problems exist or existed before.

The recommendations to explore the patterns of how other groups like whites, Indians and colored conduct themselves in their service delivery protests would add value on the knowledge system. The manner in which urban settlers stage their protests and voice their grievances should be investigated to see how they relate or differ with of people in rural or semi-urban areas.

7.6 CONCLUSION

Service delivery is a sensitive issue that affects most of the people in South Africa particularly those in rural areas. Most poor people who dominate in rural areas depend on local government and government in general to render basic services that complement their lives. As opposed to

middle-class and bourgeoisie classes that can do some of the things by themselves the poor depend on government for free basic services that are matter of life and death to them.

The broken promises by the government frustrate the people who entrusted their leaders in government to improve their lives. A government review on gathering act 205 of 1993 is essential to look on loopholes that make people take advantage during protests. The government should ensure its relationship with the people is intact where the area of communication is given serious attention to avoid tensions caused by miscommunications.

References

AFP. 2015. *Unemployment, Anger over Inequality drives Xenophobic attacks-report*.

Alexander, P. (2010). *Rebellion of the poor: South Africa's service delivery protests-a preliminary analysis*, Johannesburg. Amandla! Publishers.

Alexander P, Runciman C, Ngwane T. (2014). *Growing Civil unrest shows yearning for accountability*, South Africa. Business Day News.

Atkinson, D. (2007). *Taking to the Streets: Has Developmental Local Government failed in South Africa*, South Africa. Sakhela. 16-18.

Aristotle, (350 BCE), *The Politics*, CA, Classics Archive.

Auditor General. (2015). *Auditor-General Reports a noticeable, improving trend in local government audit results*, South Africa. 2-6.

Babbie, Earl R. (2010). *The Practice of Social Research*, Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Cengage 12th edition.

Brinton, C. (1938). *The Anatomy of Revolution*. U.S.A, Vintage Publishers. 55-79.

Boddy-Evans, A. (2014). *Nyerere Social and Economic Policy in Tanzania in the 1960 and 70s. African History*. South African History Online.

Christianson, D. (2011). *Understanding Service Delivery Protests*. South Africa. Politicsweb.

COGHSTA. (2011). *2010/2011 Limpopo Annual State of Municipalities MEC Section 47 Report*, South Africa. 21-50.

Constitution of the Republic of South Africa No.108 of 1996. *Chapter 2 Bill of Rights. Statues of the Republic of South Africa-Constitutional Law*, South Africa. 1249.

Creswell, J.W. (1994). *Research Design: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*, London, Sage publications.

Creswell, J.W. (2012). *Educational Research: Planning, Conducting and Evaluating Qualitative and Quantitative Research*, Boston: Pearson Education Inc 4th edition. 303-304.

Dauids, N. (2012). *Protest rose dramatically in the first eight months of this year*, Report by the Multi-Level Government Initiative, Johannesburg. The Times. 1-2.

Davis, D. (2000). *Business Research for Decision Making*, USA: Duxbury, 5th Edition.

Department of Local Government and Housing Limpopo. (2008). *Overview MEC's IDP Assessment Report 2007/08*, South Africa. 3-4.

Department of Labour. (2008). *Massive Limpopo Crackdown busts illegal recruitment ring*. South Africa, Department of Labour Media Statement, 1.

De Waal, M. (2012). *The Harsh Lesson that is Limpopo*. www.dailymaverick.co.za

DPSA. (2012) *DPSA Volume 9 No 2 of 2012 Service Delivery Review*, South Africa.19-25.

Ditshego, K. (2011). *Poor Service Delivery Leads to Death*. www.sagoodnews.co.za. 20 April.

Encor, L. (2016). *Public Servants Given Headlines for Disclosing their Business Interests activities*, South Africa, Business Day.

Fakir, E. (2014). *Circling the Square of Protests: Democracy, Development, delivery and Discontent in Bekkersdal*. South Africa. Daily Maverick. 20-24.

Fombad, M. (2013). *Accountability Challenges in Public-Private Partnerships from a South African Perspective*, South Africa, African Journal of Business Ethics Vol 7. No 1. 1.

Gordhan, P. (2016). *Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs Department Budget Vote 2015/2016*. www.gov.za. 14 May.

Henrietta H, F. (2014). *The Urgency and Opportunity of Global Youth Workforce Development*. Center for Strategies and International Studies.

HSRC. (2014). *Income and the Limitations of the Gini Index: The Case study of South Africa*. South Africa.

Institute for Security Studies Paper 282. (2015). *South African Futures 2035*, South Africa. 7.

Jaures, J. (1962). *The life of Jean Jaures*. Harvey Goldbery, 590.

Koocher, G. (2014). *Research Ethics and Private Harms*, Journal of Interpersonal Violence. 2367-3276.

Fukuyama, F. (2015). *Political Order and Political Decay*. New York: Farrar. Straus and Groux. 16-20.

Galtung, J. (1964). *A Structural Theory of Aggression*. Peace Research Institute-Oslo.1.

Johnson D, Southall R and Lutchman J (eds). (2012). *State of the Nation South Africa*, Cape Town: Human Science Research Council Press .4.

Karamoko J and Jain H. (2011). *Community Protests in South Africa: Trends. Analysis and Explanation* .Local Government Working Paper Series No.1, South Africa. 1-2.

Kimania, P. (2011). *Community Dissatisfaction: A direct result of non-responsiveness by government*. South Africa, Transformer: April/May/June Edition.

Machiavelli, N. (1532). *The Prince*. Italy. Antonio Bladod'Asola, 8-13.

- Manala, M, J. (2010). *South Africa's Service-Delivery Crisis: From contextual understanding to diaconal response*. Aosis Publishing. 519-525.
- Managa, A. (2011). *Unfulfilled Promises and their Consequences: A reflection on Local Government Performance and the critical issue of Poor Services Delivery in South Africa*, AISA Policy Brief Number 76.1-3.
- Lewis, W. (2011). "Be the change you wish to see in the World", Elephant Journal.
- Mashele, P. (2015). *ANC Added Nothing to White Economy*, South Africa, Sowetan.18.
- Matlou, T. (2014). *The Youth Bulge Theory-assessing its implications for South Africa*. Transconflict Southern Africa.1.
- McKinley D, T. (2011). *A State of Deep Crisis in South Africa's Local Government*, Sacsis.
- Municipal IQ. (2014). *Gordhan top 10 priorities*. Municipal Data and Intelligence Press Release.
- Musina Local Municipality. (2012). *Integrated Development Plan 2012/13-2017*. 6-50.
- Musina Local Municipality. (2014). *Public protector clears Musina Municipality*. Media Release 25 November 2014.
- Musina Municipality. (2014). *Chapter 3-Service Delivery Performance Report: 2013-2014 Annual Performance Report*. 28.
- NCOP. (2011). *Debate on the NCOP Provincial Week Report: Taking Decisive action to address Service Delivery Challenges in our Communities*, www.parliament.gov.za
- Nengovhela, K. (2012). *Musina's Public Violence case postponed*. Limpopo Mirror.
- Ngidi T, L. (2013). *Impact of Batho Pele principles on service delivery: a case study of the Durban regional office of the Department of Home Affairs*. P.1.

Nicolson, G. (2012). *Limpopo's Education Crisis: The Price of Incompetence and Corruption*, www.dailymaverick.co.za

Ngwane, T. (2014). *Protests Nation: What's driving the Demonstrations on the Streets of South Africa*, South Africa Civil Society Information Centre.

Paton, C. (2012). *Western Cape Braces itself for New Wave of Farm Strikes*. SABC Online.

Paulson, R, E. (1999). *Liberty, Equality and Justice: Civil Rights, Women's Rights, and the Regulations of Business*. USA. 1-7.

Piven, F.F, Cloward, R. (1971). *Regulating the Poor: The Functions of Social Welfare*, U.S.A, Pantheon Books. 531-532.

Plotkin, J. (2014). *Humans are Selfish, Study Finds*, United Kingdom, Express.

Quinlan, C. (2011). *Business Research Methods*. UK Andover: Hampshire: South-Western Cengage Learning. 42, 335-336.

Rasmussen, T. (2010). *Discourse as Contestation*. Idunn Publishers. 34-36.

Rousseau, J.J. (2010). *The Social Contract*. Jonathan Bennett. 14-17.

SABC. (2015). *Tlokwe, Ventersdorp Municipalities to be merged despite oppositions*, www.sabc.co.za

SABC. (2012) *Several Arrests following Musina Protests*, www.sabc.co.za

Salga. 2011. *Code of Conduct for Ward Committee members*, South Africa. 1-5.

Salga. 2004. *Councillor Induction Programme: handbook for Municipal Councillors*, South Africa. 44.

- SAPA. (2012). *YCL: Tenders are causing corruption in government*. Mail and Guardian Online.
- SAPA. (2008) *Soldiers Held for Illegal Cigarettes*. www.iol.co.za
- SARPN. (2011). *Intergovernmental Relations and the Local Government Fiscal Framework*. 28-33.
- Serino, K. (2014). *South Africa's Wave of Discontentment*. Aljazeera Media Network Online.
- South African Government, *Regulation of Gatherings Act*, www.gov.za
- South African History Online. (2016). *Apartheid Legislation 1850s-1970s*, www.sahistory.org.za
- Shah, A. (2005). *War, Propaganda and Media*, www.globalissues.org.za
- Sharp, L. (2013). *High Income-Tax Rates drive firms into informal sector*. South Africa, Business Day.
- Smith, B. (2003). *Five Principles of Research Ethics*, American Psychological Association.
- Stats SA. (2014). *Employment, Unemployment, Skills and Economic Growth, South Africa*. 42-46.
- Stats SA. (2015). *Labour Dynamics in South Africa, 2014 Report*, Press Statement.
- Swart, I. (1996). *South Africa's Service Delivery Crisis: from Contextual Understanding to Diaconal Response*, HTS Teologiese Studies.
- Taylor, K. (2012). *Why is human capital important for development?*, www.oecd.org
- The White Paper on Local Government. *The Current State of Local Government 9 March 1998*. South Africa, Cogta. 8-14.

Umezeruke S, A. (2012). *Perceptions of African Immigrants in Pretoria on service delivery in the Department of Home Affairs*, University of Zululand. 33-37.

UN Desa. (2009). *Creating an Inclusive Society: Practical strategies to promote social integration*. 4-5.

Welman, J.C, Kruger, S.J. (2001). *Research Methodology: For the Business and Administrative Sciences*. Oxford University Press 2nd Edition.

www.afesis.org.za. *Local Governance Articles/service delivery protests in South Africa*. 2012, November, 07.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1

INTERVIEW TRANSCRIPTS

1 Musina Municipality Officials

Interviews

These Interviews are part of the research on 'Service Delivery Protest in Musina Municipality' which is currently undertaken by the Masters student. You are invited to voluntarily participate in the research project. Please note that this research is anonymous and all the responses from respondents will be treated with the highest degree of confidentiality. The information shared by the respondents won't be used for any other purpose except its academic purpose.

A. Personal Information

Interviewer : Phaswana Rofhiwa
Interviewee : Respondent K
Date of interview : 18 November 2016
Gender : Male
Age Brackets : 41-50
Organization : Municipality Official
Home Language : Venda
Highest qualification : Grade 12 plus tertiary qualifications
Place of Interview : Musina Municipality (Eric Louw) Offices

B. Service Delivery protest

1. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How was the level of community members' participation in government meetings?

Respondent K: The level was satisfactory because all our stakeholders took community gatherings very serious between the periods you are investigating. Some people politicised the gatherings whereas as the municipality we were dealing with government issues.

2. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How often does the municipality visit communities to report and engage with stakeholders?

Respondent K: We have ward committees that meet with communities monthly. We also meet with various wards quarterly and have Mayoral Imbizo that rotates in various wards.

3. Phaswana Rofhiwa: What do you think can be done to strengthen communication between the municipality and its stakeholders?

Respondent K: We have the bulk SMS line that has been established in 2014 to update our people which have 3000 subscribers. The municipality has created whatsapp group and facebook page to maximise the flow of information as soon as it is available. Our functional website helps us to share information easily because it is updated weekly.

4. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How did the municipality dealt with service delivery backlogs challenges where there were any?

Respondent K: We, as the municipality call meetings with concerned groups to find common ground. Their memorandums were responded to face to face by the municipality political leadership.

5. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How did the municipality intervene in the protests experienced between the periods of 2007-2014?

Respondent K: The municipality political leadership tried its level best to engage with leaders of protests to find amicable solutions. The municipality council has responded to letters of grievances coming from unsatisfied people.

6. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How do you rate the effectiveness of Gathering Act of 1993 in handling protests?

Respondent K: I personally consider it effective because it affords protesters to protest but observing the constitution of the country. It protects the rights of protesters and those who are not part of the protests and condemn violence. It also discourages illegal gatherings that undermine the law of the country.

7. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How does vandalism as a result of violent protest affect the economic stability of the municipality?

Respondent K: It affects our financial budget and spending because we end up using money allocated for other projects to repair the damage.

8. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How did violent protests affect the confidence of business sector within the municipality jurisdiction?

Respondent K: It affected us negatively because around 2012 we have been in the spotlight as a result of violent protest that we experienced as the municipality. Business sector consider stability and safety when doing business in any area. Our municipality has been identified in the province as an economic growth point of which any protests accompanied by violence deter investors in our areas.

9. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How often does the municipality conduct awareness to teach its communities' members about importance of protecting infrastructure?

Respondent K: When we conduct Mayoral Imbizo on quarterly basis and other meetings our political leadership usually address the issue of protecting the government infrastructure. Our municipality usually emphasized the importance of protecting infrastructures development because they are the investment to future generations to come.

10. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How effective did the municipality carried out its social contract obligation to serve its communities between the periods of 2007-2014?

Respondent K: Honestly speaking, this is the period where we were performing well. We managed to receive clean financial audits which prove we were on track in carrying our obligation to serve our people. As the municipality we view the issue of regular expenditure and clean audits so seriously because we are committed to use public money properly. You will recall that as the municipality we haven't experienced a trend of protests which prove that service delivery is reaching the people. We respect Batho Pele Principles hence we use public resources to improve the lives of the people.

11. Phaswana Rofhiwa: Is there anything else that you would like to say or add regarding the 'service delivery protests and their implications on the economic stability?

Respondent K: Yes, in terms of communication our municipality invest on local media. We set budget aside for local media to outreach our people so that they are always updated about any development.

Phaswana Rofhiwa: Thank you for your dedicated time and co-operation. If you wish I will send you my copy of dissertation in electronic form once it has gone through university processes.

2 Ward Councillors

Interviews

These Interviews are part of the research on 'Service Delivery Protest in Musina Municipality' which is currently undertaken by the Masters student. You are invited to voluntarily participate in the research project. Please note that this research is anonymous and all the responses from respondents will be treated with the highest degree of confidentiality. The information shared by the respondents won't be used for any other purpose except its academic purpose

A. Personal Information

Interviewer : Phaswana Rofhiwa
Interviewee : Respondent C
Date of interview : 18 November 2016
Gender : Male
Age Brackets : 41-50
Organization : Ward Councillor (Madimbo)
Home Language : Venda
Highest qualification : Grade 10
Place of Interview : Musina Extension 4

Interviewer : Phaswana Rofhiwa
Interviewee : Respondent D
Date of interview : 09 December 2016
Gender : Male
Age Brackets : 26-30
Organization : Ward Councillor (Tshipise)
Home Language : Venda

Highest qualification : Grade 12 plus tertiary qualifications

Place of Interview : Thohoyandou Venda Plaza

Interviewer : Phaswana Rofhiwa

Interviewee : Respondent E

Date of interview : 20 November 2016

Gender : Male

Age Brackets : 51-60

Organization : Ward Councillor (Musina-Nancefield)

Home Language : Venda

Highest qualification : Grade 12 plus tertiary qualifications

Place of Interview : It was a telephone interview

B. Service Delivery protest

12. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How was the level of community participation in municipality and other government meetings?

Respondent C: My relationship with community in my ward was not hostile which stimulated their interests to participate in meetings where I had to give reports. The community participation in meetings initiated by the municipality and government in general was satisfactory. Community members participated in Mayoral Imbizo, Budget Meetings and other government events to engage with their leaders in different levels.

Respondent D: The level of participation by community in all meetings I ever had with them as well as government meetings in general was good.

Respondent E: From my side I think the community involvement in the meetings conducted both by me and municipality was fine.

13. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How was your relationship with community stakeholders?

Respondent C: I had a healthy working relationship with community and all stakeholders. I was able to consult with all stakeholders whenever there were issues to be discussed. In a situation

where community members were looking for answers beyond my level I linked them with relevant authorities.

Respondent D: The relationship with stakeholders was fine were we never had any breakdown which may have caused protests. All the issues I had with stakeholders were resolved peacefully using dialogues.

Respondent E: My relationship with community was good because I didn't experience direct attacks from members of the community. If they had issues we were able to sit down and iron them diplomatically without frictions.

14. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How often did you meet with community stakeholders to give feedbacks?

Respondent C: It was my obligation to report progress to community on monthly and quarterly basis which I honoured during my term as a ward councillor. In the event of emergency various stakeholders regularly invited me or vice versa to address issues such as crime and development that needed special attention. I acknowledge the importance of all stakeholders in the ward such as traditional leaders, civics, ward committee and others.

Respondent D: I normally meet with stakeholders monthly and fortnight to traditional leaders in rotation. I also had an obligation that I fulfilled to meet monthly with community at large to give reports. SMS line introduced by the municipality was helpful in mobilising the community.

Respondent E: I meet with them monthly and on quarterly basis unless if there were matter of urgency that need to be attended to urgently that's where we could meet unexpectedly. Their participation shows the community interests in meetings conducted by the municipality. The mayoral, IDP, Budget and other meetings show that the municipality was for the people. It is important for the people to participate because it gives them opportunity to be heard.

15. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How did you deal with community frustrations and anger in relation to service delivery if there were any?

Respondent C: I have never experienced any service delivery during my term as a ward councillor because protests were mainly happening in town not around Madimbo area where I served. However I experienced some challenges more especially the community anger in relation to water shortage but it never escalated to protests. Our municipality was always committed to uplift the lives of the people as prescribed by the "Batho Pele" principles. It was

only few people who were disruptive in the meetings but majority of them in my ward were cooperative because they understood that development was a process.

Respondent D: I had a cordial relationship with the community. I ensured that I linked the community members with relevant parties if there were intervention of some kind needed.

Respondent E: I engaged with them so that we could find one another however there were some political influences to disrupt the service delivery from certain people. For an example the 2012 protests in Musina-Nancefield was not mainly about service delivery but workers problems in Venetia mine.

16. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How effective was service delivery in the ward you were serving?

Respondent C: The municipality track record speaks volume that it was committed to serve its people. The relationship between myself, the municipality and stakeholders helped me to serve my people with dedication. The municipality was able to consult and do planning with its people so that “delivery” was driven by the people. The municipality has built the Thusong Community Centre, RDP Houses to needy people and constructed the tar road that connect Madimbo area with Musina town amongst many other things. The only biggest challenge was water shortage which I regularly communicated with the community about the district plans to solve it.

Respondent D: My brother as you know that challenges are part of human nature, the service delivery was effective in my ward. It was unfortunate that government was not providing enough jobs which is a problem but as for basic things honestly our municipality has done a lot. In my ward, water taps were provided according to the IDP standards which insist that after 500 metres there should be water taps. My responsibility as a ward councillor was to facilitate the beneficiary list of RDP houses for the municipality to submit it to the Coghsta.

Respondent E: In my view the municipality was providing good services to the people in my ward. The municipality has achieved its obligation to provide basic needs such as water, sanitation and maintenance of roads and streets. Where there were foreseen and unforeseen circumstances the municipality through its ward councillors and ward committee members amongst others people were updated about any developments that could affect them

17. Phaswana Rofhiwa: How do you rate the effectiveness of Gathering Act of 1993 in handling protests?

Respondent C: In my view the act is fine because it promotes accountability of protesters to exercise their democratic rights to protests peacefully. It's unfortunate that there were some people who took advantage of genuine protests to advance their criminal elements on the expense of others. I personally denounced the act of vandalism of properties because government properties benefit the same people who vandalise them. People should protests peacefully without endangering lives of others and properties.

Respondent D: Gathering Act is fine except that some people just took advantage to commit crime in the name of service delivery protests. The act allows democracy to reign but people should exercise their rights with accountability. People should be vigilant and guard their democracy against perpetrators who don't respect the rule of law.

Respondent E: The act was too soft to anarchy because protesters use genuine issues they have against government to pursue violence. It should be tight to hold accountable those who use violence to destroy property during protests.

18. Is there anything else that you would like to say or add regarding the 'service delivery protests and their implications on the economic stability?

Respondent C: No I don't have anything to add.

Respondent D: Yes my brother, I would like to add that the extensions of residential sites sometimes pose a challenge when community members were impatient to wait for their financial year's budget. I would like you to note that some community members took advantage that they are the ones who elected us as councillors just to make life difficult for us unnecessary. The protests are part of democracy in motion however if not exercised carefully it undermine the achievements made by government because we spend money on repairing infrastructures instead of moving forward. In my ward the major problem was unemployment which most people don't regard it as part of service delivery. In my view jobs are part of service delivery because government is vested with the responsibility to be the custodian of social welfare which needs money derived from workers tax and business.

Respondent E: I don't have anything my brother.

Phaswana Rofhiwa: Thank you for your dedicated time and co-operation. If you wish I will send you my copy of dissertation in electronic form once it has gone through university processes.

3 Traditional Leaders

Interviews

These Interviews are part of the research on 'Service Delivery Protest in Musina Municipality' which is currently undertaken by the Masters student. You are invited to voluntarily participate in the research project. Please note that this research is anonymous and all the responses from respondents will be treated with the highest degree of confidentiality. The information shared by the respondents won't be used for any other purpose except its academic purpose

A. Personal Information

Interviewer : Phaswana Rofhiwa
Interviewee : Respondent A
Date of interview : 19 November 2016
Gender : Male
Age Brackets : 41-50
Organization : Traditional leader (Madimbo Village)
Home Language : Venda
Highest qualification : Grade 10
Place of Interview : Madimbo Royal Kraal

Interviewer : Phaswana Rofhiwa
Interviewee : Respondent B
Date of interview : 19 November 2016
Gender : Male
Age Brackets : 41-50
Organization : Traditional leader (Madimbo Village)
Home Language : Venda
Highest qualification : Grade 12 plus tertiary qualifications
Place of Interview : Madimbo Royal Kraal

B. Service Delivery protest

19. How was the level of engagement between the municipality and traditional leaderships between the periods of 2007-2014?

Respondent A: The level of engagement between the municipality officials and “us” as traditional leaders was cordial with little problems of empty promise particularly in relation to water supply. I commend the municipality on its indigent policy because it looks after those who are poor... at least it shows commitment to deliver services to all class of the people. Majority of the people in the area are indigents who rely on government grants to survive and without government assistance life would have been a nightmare to them. The uses of Mayoral Imbizo, SMS line, ward committee and councillor meetings are helpful because we engage with them about our issues. I commend the municipality for discharging its responsibility of giving feedbacks and updating people on any development that affects them.

Respondent B: The level of engagement was good because the municipality consult with us in any developments. We haven't had any situation where the municipality and its agencies bypassed us when doing developments in our area without our knowledge. The people participation when there were Mayoral Imbizo and government meetings should be intensified. In my understanding information is critical for the people to keep updated in all government developments

20. How was the level of service delivery of basic things such as electricity, sanitation, water and maintenance of the streets?

Respondent A: The municipality has done better but our biggest problem in the area is water shortage. Another problem is school, we don't have secondary school closer to our community. The District Municipality should help us because we are suffering my brother.

Respondent B: The municipality has done much better in its provision of RDP houses but failed us in relation to water. Though I am happy that the municipality has provided households with water taps the shortage of water was a crisis that needs a serious attention. The tar road constructed in our area is a symbol that the ward councillor and the municipality were taking their interests to another level. Though Vhembe District Municipality is a water authority whereas Musina Local Municipality is water supplier the cordial relationship between the two would solve our crisis.

21. How was the level of communication between the Ward Councillor and community in the area?

Respondent A: I wouldn't lie to you; the communication between the ward councillor and us was good. He was a humble man with integrity. The Mayoral Imbizo, SMS line and other platforms provided by the municipality as a way of communication make it easier to get updates about any development. I commend the Mayoral Imbizo because it affords us opportunity to raise our issues with the municipality political leadership eye to eye.

Respondent B: The level of communication has been effective because the municipality acknowledges the role of traditional leadership in our area. The community centre built by the municipality has changed people's lives because community stakeholders use it as their meeting spot to engage on various issues. Ward councillor was playing a significant role to mobilise community to discuss developmental programmes.

22. What were the methods used by Ward Committee to give feedbacks? Elaborate if they were effective.

Respondent A: They regularly meet with different stakeholders in Thusong Community Centre and meet us here in the kraal. Normally we see them accompanying the ward councillor to help him but they sometimes come to us without him to update us about any developments that need our attention.

Respondent B: Ward committee organises people and meet with them in various areas such as tribal council and community centre for development updates.

23. How did the service delivery protests affect you?

Respondent A: Honestly speaking, even though major protests happened in town it affect us also because it was not safe to go to Musina town during protests and our people couldn't do shopping there. Violent protests are not good because they vandalise government properties but sometimes make government leaders listen. In my view where there are riots government leaders respond faster which makes community members to stage protests to be heard. After all, I denounce the act of violence no matter how people differ in views to vandalise government properties to express dissatisfaction is not good. I think people should find peaceful solutions to their differences without bloodshed and properties vandalism. In my opinion I think people should protest peacefully.

Respondent B: I don't think anarchy is the right thing to express dissatisfaction. Violent protests affect the municipality and government budget in general because they spend money on

repairing instead of new development. I personally advise people to be careful of perpetrators who hijack mass mobilization to commit crime in the name of service delivery.

24. How do you view the impact of protests in achieving the goals of the protesters?

Respondent A: Though I personally didn't feel its huge impact in terms of service delivery I think it does affect the economy. When businesses close down because of protests money is lost which is not good.

Respondent B: The perception that government listen faster where there is fire is true. Dialogue is good and commendable but protests in many cases have proven to be a way to make the plea attended to faster as compared to other means.

25. How did vandalism of infrastructure affect the lives of the people in your area?

Respondent A: My brother, I can't really tell because as I have already said that protests were mainly happening in town but when our people couldn't access certain services in town because of protests I feel it deprives them opportunity.

Respondent B: Municipality and government budget is affected because instead of using budget allocated for development money end up being used for damage repair. Though we may not necessarily see how big is the impact but my sense is that service delivery protests if turn violent they affect our economy.

26. Is there anything else that you would like to say or add regarding the 'service delivery protests and their implications on the economic stability?

Respondent A: Yes, I think the local municipality should strengthen its capacity to raise people's problems to other departments because there are certain services it doesn't provide. I am also disappointed by the level of crime happening in our area because police are not fighting against it effectively.

Respondent B: No my brother I think I have said more than enough.

Phaswana Rofhiwa: Thank you for your dedicated time and co-operation. If you wish I will send you my copy of dissertation in electronic form once it has gone through university processes.

4 Civics

Interviews

These Interviews are part of the research on 'Service Delivery Protest in Musina Municipality' which is currently undertaken by the Masters student. You are invited to voluntarily participate in the research project. Please note that this research is anonymous and all the responses from respondents will be treated with the highest degree of confidentiality. The information shared by the respondents won't be used for any other purpose except its academic purpose.

A. Personal Information

Interviewer : Phaswana Rofhiwa
 Interviewee : Respondent F
 Date of interview : 19 November 2016
 Gender : Male
 Age Brackets : 31-40
 Organization : Civic (Musina-Nancefield)
 Home Language : Venda
 Highest qualification : Grade 11
 Place of Interview : Musina Extension 08

Interviewer : Phaswana Rofhiwa
 Interviewee : Respondent G
 Date of interview : 19 December 2016
 Gender : Male
 Age Brackets : 31-40
 Organization : Civic (Tshipise)
 Home Language : Venda
 Highest qualification : Grade 12 plus tertiary qualifications
 Place of Interview : Musina Extension 08

Interviewer : Phaswana Rofhiwa
 Interviewee : Respondent H

Date of interview : 19 December 2016
Gender : Male
Age Brackets : 26-30
Organization : Civic (Madimbo)
Home Language : Venda
Highest qualification : Grade 12 plus tertiary qualifications
Place of Interview : Musina Extension 08

B. Service Delivery protest

27. What were the driving factors that resulted in the service delivery protests in your area?

Respondent F: The poor service delivery has left us with no option than to picket against our own municipality. We had marches several times to demonstrate how we were unsatisfied with the poor services rendered by the municipality but they were not listening to us. The lack of communication by political deployees and community elected representatives of the community fuelled the protests. The failure by the ANC to recall its mayor Ms Carol Phiri and Chiefwhip Mr Madamalala frustrated the community because the two were at the centre of service delivery problems.

Respondent G: In my area we haven't staged a service delivery protest, the protests were in town.

Respondent H: We haven't had service delivery protests in our area except the protests against the Tshamutumbu police satellite in 2013 for its failure to fight crime. Consequently to the protest a police fired a shot and injured community member which fuelled the tension. This has forced the people to intensify the protest against police bail application.

28. How did the service delivery protests turn violent?

Respondent F: There were some politicians from the ANC who recruited people to spoil things so that they could label our protest violent or probably influenced by ulterior motives. We never had any intension when we embarked on the strike to destroy any property. We handed our memorandum of grievance to the mayor on the 07 of March 2017 which never yielded positive

results. We handed memorandum on the 07 May 2012 to the ANC sub region in Musina about poor service delivery in the municipality under its governance but they ignored us. Subsequently to that we embarked on major service delivery protest in Musina-Nancefield townships. From there we submitted the memorandum to the municipality on the 21 August 2012 raising same issues of poor service delivery because there was no improvement.

Respondent G: Like I said up there that the protests were happening in town not in our area.

Respondent H: We were not part of the Musina protests that were happening in town that turned violent.

29. How can the avenues prescribed by government in the (Gathering Act of 1993) be improved to deal with non-compliance?

Respondent F: The act must be reviewed because it just guides people how they should conduct themselves which is a good thing but it suppress people to gather without application. The act gives police more power to intimidate protesters. For an example in the major protest that turn violent the intimidation by police to peaceful protesters fuelled violence.

Respondent G: The act on its current format insinuates fear to prevent people to exercise their democratic right to protest. In my view protests strengthen the ability of government to render effective service delivery but anarchy is anarchy and it must be treated as such. Police have a tendency to instill fear to the protesters as a way of protecting the interests of politicians rather than respecting the right of those protesting to exercise their democratic right.

Respondent H: The act on its format instils fear to the protesters to protest freely and the process of application to be granted right to protest is too lengthy. Protests strengthen government ability to deliver effectively. Protesters should exercise their democratic right to protest with caution.

30. How was the level of community participation in municipality meetings?

Respondent F: The level of community participation was fine but there was always a doubt from community members. Community members have always been sceptical that government use its meetings for formality sake whereas the decisions have been taken already.

Respondent G: The level of community participation was fine though not necessarily reflective of the entire community. The participation number was not increasing because of broken promises from government leaders.

Respondent H: People participates but the size of participants was not good because government process take time without yielding fruits which weaken the interest of people to attend meetings.

31. How was the level of communication between the municipality and civic?

Respondent F: The communication was not right because they always avoided us when we raised our problems to them. The municipality communication models such as Mayoral Imbizo and quarterly meetings were good but not effective and unresponsive to urgent issues. They were important because they afford the residents opportunity to be part of discussions with their political leadership. It's unfortunate that such platforms are used for compliance not to reflect on the issues communities have. Political leaders do not use views expressed by communities' members but impose their wishes when rolling out implementations programmes.

Respondent G: The communication models such as Mayoral Imbizo and quarterly meetings were good but not effective and unresponsive to urgent issues that arise. Community shouldn't have to wait for scheduled meetings such as Imbizo and quarterly meetings where as they have urgent challenges that need special attention. The size of community participation is not growing because of broken promises.

Respondent H: In my view the communication policy of the municipality was good. The Mayoral Imbizo and IDP/Budget reviews were important because they afford the community to raise their concerns and make proposal that inform the municipality actions. I commend the municipality decision to build the Madimbo Thusong Community Centre which we use for meetings and access of government services. The Centre helps us to receive letters from government as well

as having our meeting. My problem is the fact that people don't attend meetings in large number.

32. How was the level of service delivery in your area?

Respondent F: Listen my brother; more houses have been occupied by foreigners and those who don't qualify to have RDP houses in our area. Beneficiary list was tempered with by the municipality or ward councillor to accommodate those who don't qualify. The traffic station was sometimes closed in 2012 and people had to go to Louis Trichardt to get services. The residents were suspicious about possible corruption in relation to the incomplete road that cost taxpayers R17.5 million of taxpayers in Musina. Some senior positions were vacant without being filled which compromise service delivery. The Municipal Mayor has appointed manager in her office where as she had personal assistant without council resolutions.

Respondent G: In my view the municipality was not adhering to its "Batho Pele" principles particularly on the 'Redress' issue. If the municipality was responsive and polite in handling all the problems submitted to them the unrest experienced in Musina area would have not occurred. I think there were some elements of corruption in relation to RDP houses allocation and the quality thereof was not up to standard. In my ward for an example, water taps are there but there is no water. There is a different between having water taps and water.

Respondent H: I think the municipality was adhering to the Batho Principles because its working relationship with stakeholders was good. If the municipality could address the water shortage problem as a matter of urgency our municipality would be the best municipality in the district.

33. How was the level of working relationship between your civic and ward councillor?

Respondent F: In ward 03 in Musina-Nancefield the ward councillor who was appointed as Chiefwhip also was not consulting in decision making processes. He centralised most of the things hence he was a victim of vandalism at his home.

Respondent G: I cannot necessarily say it is bad but it needs to be improved and maintained as always. Our ward councillor was not a bad person because much happened under him however the municipality empty promises particularly in water was problematic.

Respondent H: Our relationship with the ward councillor has been a constrained one. Though he was carrying his obligation to consult and meet stakeholders his relationship with us was not healthy. He had a negative attitude towards our civic as a result of most follow-ups we initiate to track delivery.

34. How effective was the ward committee in giving feedbacks to the community?

Respondent F: Ward committee members were not focused because ward councillor who was the chairperson of the committee had no good relationship with the community.

Respondent G: The ward committee members were visible and shared allegiance to the development of our community.

Respondent H: To be honestly if I say they were not reporting I would be lying however the mandate of the committee was too vague to understand. They were not providing latest information which raises a question if they have to wait for us to send them without exploring new development prospects.

35. How did the political influences play a role in fuelling the tension between municipality and community?

Respondent F: There was a political influence; some senior councillors used their political power in the administration to advance their self interests other than to serve the people.

Respondent G: I personally don't think there was political influence at play in our area that created a tension between the municipality and community. Any disagreements between our civic and the municipality were genuine without political influences at play.

Respondent H: There were no reported incidents of political influence that constrained the working relationship between our municipality and community. However I can't rule out the possibility of political influence between the municipality and other structures.

36. Is there anything else that you would like to say or add regarding the 'service delivery protests and their implications on the economic stability?

Respondent F: Yes I have something to add, we engaged even Cosatu to mediate our problems with the municipality. Our major issue was water and electricity. We wanted electricity to be managed by Eskom not by the municipality because it was expensive. The community also wanted the Police Station Commander to be removed because crime around Musina-Nancefield was rife. They also wanted a doctor to be removed from Musina Hospital and his certificate revoked because under his watch nurses were neglecting patients without forgetting the issue of outdated facilities.

Respondent G: Yes, the responsibility to protect the economy reclines in both government leadership and community. Government should prevent any possible occurrence of protests by listening to the people who are suffering on the ground.

Respondent H: Yes, water remains our biggest problem in the area which is like a sitting bomb waiting to erupt.

Phaswana Rofhiwa: Thank you for your dedicated time and co-operation. If you wish I will send you my copy of dissertation in electronic form once it has gone through university processes.

5 Political Analysts

Interviews

These Interviews are part of the research on 'Service Delivery Protest in Musina Municipality' which is currently undertaken by the Masters student. You are invited to voluntarily participate in the research project. Please note that this research is anonymous and all the responses from respondents will be treated with the highest degree of confidentiality. The information shared by the respondents won't be used for any other purpose except its academic purpose

A. Personal Information

Interviewer : Phaswana Rofhiwa

Interviewee : Respondent I
Date of interview : 21 November 2016
Gender : Male
Age Brackets : 41-50
Organization : Political Analyst
Home Language : Venda
Highest qualification : Grade 12 plus tertiary qualifications
Place of Interview : It was a telephone interview

Interviewer : Phaswana Rofhiwa
Interviewee : Respondent J
Date of interview : 08 December 2016
Gender : Male
Age Brackets : 31-40
Organization : Political Analyst
Home Language : Venda
Highest qualification : Grade 12 plus tertiary qualifications
Place of Interview : It was a telephone interview

B. Service Delivery protest

37. Why is it important for Municipalities to have proper communication with their stakeholders?

Respondent I: Communication is an important tool to maintain healthy relationship between government and the people. There is a need for government leaders to display honesty when engaging the people because the scepticism that they use communication models for compliance purpose only is a serious problem.

Respondent J: The communication is essential because if it is broken it creates frustrations on the environment. Ward councillors and ward committee should always play an important role in maintaining relationship between the municipality and communities.

38. How is the behaviour of protesters in the South African political landscape?

Respondent I: Generally speaking I think protesters are not necessarily violent but the unresponsive government leaders frustrate them to a level where they say enough is enough. When petition are ignored and meetings are used for formality purpose not to use their views to improve things they create their own space.

Respondent J: I think police need a proper education on handling protesters. When concerned community members are ignored by those who have to take forward their memorandums it create hostile environment. Police are used by senior managers in government to intimidate the protesters which fuel violence.

39. How effective are the Batho Pele principles in the improvement of service delivery?

Respondent I: The rural municipalities across the country were not getting enough budgets which affect service delivery. The government components are regarded by politicians as platform for self accumulation. The massive service delivery protests that happened in South Africa were symbol of discontent between government and people on the ground. The primary responsibility of the municipalities across the country is to serve the people. The unresponsive political leadership frustrated the people who elected them to use protests as their last resort to display their frustrations.

Respondent J: Service delivery is not enough due to budget constraints in most case. Budget from national government is hijacked before it reaches the municipalities which affect service delivery efficiency. I think there must be a review on strategic positions appointment because cadre deployment has been at the centre in destroying service delivery efficiency.

40. How do service delivery protests affect the economy of the country?

Respondent I: You should understand that when people are ignored by their leaders they create spaces for themselves to be heard. Unresponsive leaders frustrate peaceful protesters who end up pursuing violent as a last resort to raise their dissatisfaction. The protesters in general appeared to have lost confidence in their government leaders. Service delivery protests have become a norm in South Africa and this create space of doubt to investors who want to do business in our country. Businesses are reluctant to invest where there are no certainties of political stability which have direct impacts on their investment.

Respondent J: I think the protests affect the economy of the country because production seize where ever there are protests. International trade is affected as a result of violent protests because they disrupt the economy stability.

Phaswana Rofhiwa: Thank you for your dedicated time and co-operation. If you wish I will send you my copy of dissertation in electronic form once it has gone through university processes.

APPENDIX 2: List of Respondents

Name	Organization	Area
Respondent A	Madimbo Traditional Council	Madimbo
Respondent B	Madimbo Traditional Council	Madimbo
Respondent C	Ward Councillor	Madimbo
Respondent D	Ward Councillor	Tshipise
Respondent E	Ward Councillor	Musina-Nancefield
Respondent F	Musina-Nancefield Civic	Musina-Nancefield
Respondent G	Tshipise Civic	Tshipise
Respondent H	Madimbo Civic	Madimbo
Respondent I	Political Analyst	South Africa
Respondent J	Political Analyst	South Africa
Respondent K	Municipality Representative	South Africa

Pseudonyms have been used.