

Governance and Sustainability of Entrepreneurship During the Covid-19 Era in South Africa

G Musasa and FS Modiba
Nelson Mandela University, South Africa

Abstract: Globally governments have been putting efforts to sustain economies heavily affected by the Covid-19 pandemic, particularly entrepreneurial-based activities. The purpose of this paper is to critically examine how governance in South Africa affected creative industries during the Covid-19 era. This article argues that a country can only sustain and benefit from the growth potential of creative industries when there is good governance and a clear model of development assistance during the Covid-19 era. A systematic literature review was conducted to source qualitative data using grey literature of media sources. The review was guided by the following questions: what governance issues affected creative industries during the Covid-19 era? And to what extent did the latter affect this sector during the Covid-19 lockdowns? Results show that poor governance coupled with corruption and the lack of a clear development assistance model affected the creative industries' activities and livelihoods, and further impacted their sustainability. A conceptual policy model is proposed to assist and sustain creative industries during and post-Covid-19 era to increase entrepreneurial activities and rebuild the economy.

Keywords: Creative industries, Covid-19, Entrepreneurship, Governance, Sustainability

1. Introduction

Globally, governments have been putting efforts to sustain economies heavily affected by the Covid-19 pandemic, particularly entrepreneurial-based activities. In South Africa, the sudden economy-wide lockdown paused most economic activities and delivered a large aggregate supply and demand shock to the economy (Arndt et al., 2020). The consequences have been unprecedented in scale and intensity, resulting in severe devastation of livelihoods. Due to the pandemic, various business sectors suffered economic shocks, leading to earnings loss (KaNcube, 2020). The Cultural and Creative Industries (CCI) is one of the sectors deeply affected by Covid-19. The CCIs are known to have the potential to bring about economic growth, employment creation and social cohesion (Hruby & Annan, 2020). The benefits of a solid cultural and creative economy are that it creates employment in favour of youths and women, promotes social development through women empowerment and community dialogues (Runde, Seminario & Thompson, 2020). Cunningham (2002) states that the CCI has contributed to closing the gap of enterprise dynamics/classifications wherein sectors like the arts, media, and cultural industries could not be used to identify other economic activities. CCI in Europe is characterised by activities involving creativity, skills, and

talent to generate income (Cunningham, 2002; Flew, 2011). This includes architecture, audio visual, literature and publishing, music, radio, performing arts, electronic games, software, fashion and advertising, heritage, and antiques (Cunningham, 2002, Lhermitte, 2021; van Graan, 2021). There is ambiguity on how South Africa defines CCIs, but many researchers adopt the UNESCO Framework for Cultural statistics as a working definition (Snowball, 2020).

Investment into the CCI sector differs by country. For instance, countries like Europe have supported this sector since the 90s, and it continues to grow though there have been challenges since the emergence of the Covid-19 pandemic (Cunningham, 2002; Lhermitte, 2021). The sector has contributed to this country's GDP for many years. According to Lhermitte (2021), the annual turnover of the CCI contributed a total of 4.4 per cent to the EU's GDP in 2019. This accounted for over 640 billion euros of turnover and 253 billion euros in value-added services. According to Brookes, Tapscott, Moyo, and Shelver (2020), countries like America, Brazil, Russia, China, and South Korea have recorded CCI GDP contribution at 4%, 10%, 6%, 4% and 9%, respectively. They further posit that CCI related sectors contribute 2.5% to South Africa's GDP and 4.7% for Ethiopia. Other figures for South Africa indicate that the

CCI contributes 1.7% to the GDP, which translates to R74.4 billion (SACO, 2020). It should, however, be noted that there is concern on limited data on this sector for Africa (UNESCO 2009). Brookes et al. (2020) emphasise the importance of investing in this sector that has a great potential in creating the needed jobs in Africa, which are inclusive and sustainable. The needed support for the CCI sector is limited in some countries, especially South Africa. For example, the South African government does not provide adequate support for the CCIs due to a lack of policies that address the sector, governance issues related to corruption, and maladministration of funds (Burnett, 2021; van Dyk, 2021). The public sector has been inundated with issues of poor service delivery, which in some cases was linked to the issue of corruption (Ntoyanto-Tyatyantsi & Ceki, 2019). According to Rispel, de Jager and Fonn (2016), corruption can affect policies and programmes that support entrepreneurial activities. Since the dawn of the Covid-19 pandemic, corruption cases related to the misuse of funds meant to relieve the business sector were reported (Maseko, 2020), illustrating the severity of corruption in the country. Yeboah-Assiamah et al. (2018) relate such tendencies to the fact that African societies mostly have a culture of accepting authority without questioning what the leaders are saying or doing. They further point out that this subservient culture can enable corrupt leaders to perpetuate corruption in countries.

Considering the above issues, this paper investigates governance issues that may have affected creative industries during the Covid-19 era. To address the latter, the following research question is posed: to what extent did the governance issues affect the CCI's entrepreneurial activities during the Covid-19 lockdowns? This paper will contribute to knowledge generation in the CCI discourse, which is currently limited in answering the above question. In addition, it builds into scholarly research on creative industries and their relationship with governance in the Covid-19 era, and this study is one of the first to assess that relationship.

UNESCO (2021) argues that CCIs were the first to close or collapse during the emergence of the Covid-19 pandemic and were likely to be the last to open post-Covid-19 era. The greater part of the CCIs sector depends on crowd gatherings particularly, theatre, live music festivals, cinemas, and museums, but the Covid-19 regulations of lockdowns and social distancing impede their operation and affect

the livelihoods of those employed or dependent on the sector (UNESCO, 2021). Such an impact is experienced in major urban centres and megacities where CCIs are concentrated. There is consensus in the literature showing that unemployment and revenues rapidly and significantly dropped in the CCIs in 2020 globally, and the sector could not sustain culturally and socially valuable outcomes (UNESCO, 2021). The UNESCO (2021) report argues that the fortunes of CCIs are linked to localised nation governance efforts of dealing with the pandemic. The CCI continue to encounter issues of sustaining the sector, which affects livelihoods although it contributes to employment creation. The challenges stem from defining, supporting, and regulating the CCI sector. There is no general agreement on what and where it fits in enterprise classifications of the country's business sector (Snowball, 2020). According to Mail and Guardian (2020a, 2021), the sector had challenges with the government before the Covid-19 era. There was a lack of understanding on how the sector is structured and to provide appropriate support. A lack of understanding of the sector means that the policy environment will not cater to the sector's needs. The challenge for South Africa in addressing the issue of sustaining the creative industry during the Covid-19 pandemic is the lack of a model to assist in the distribution of funds, notably the Presidential Employment Stimulus Package (PESP), in a fair manner. This is further exacerbated by overbudgeting, which opens avenues for corruption (Rispel et al., 2016). The noted challenges affirm the necessity to understand the underlying issues related to governance experienced by entrepreneurs. In doing so, propose a model to be used by the government to support actors in this sector during and post Covid-19 era.

2. Methodological Approach

This paper's review concentrated on governance issues that affected CCIs during Covid-19 and failures of sustenance. Thirteen studies that addressed the issue of Covid-19 impacts on CCIs were reviewed, examining the issues of governance in South Africa. Using a systematic review approach (SRA), studies and reports not relevant to the research questions and scope were filtered guided by the search strategy, scope, and selection process (Thomé et al., 2016). Academic databases such as google scholar, science direct and Wiley databases were searched to obtain academic sources that would inform the main literature of the study. Grey literature was also

used, particularly newspapers, government, and non-governmental organisation (NGOs) reports. It was observed that there are limited peer-reviewed academic publications that have been produced regarding the phenomenon in question during the time of the review, hence the reliance on grey literature.

3. Literature Review

This section reviews international and local literature on the definition of the CCI, its contribution to socio-economic development and explores the challenges encountered in this sector and governance issues. The emergence of Covid-19 brought challenges that this sector barred the most, and these will be analysed.

3.1 Defining the CCI

According to Cunningham (2002), activities involving creativity and creating wealth can fall under creative industries. These activities include crafts, clothing and accessories of indigenous people, media, information and communication technologies (ICT) services. So, this may be anything that falls in the arts, culture, knowledge sectors, and related value-added services (for example, software and social media). The author further argues that *"cultural industries notions and arguments have been developed for nation states and around the cultures of nation states. The term has developed into the application of neoclassical economics to the arts paralleled by a 'rebadging' of large, usually commercial industries such as TV, music and film, as 'cultural'"* (Cunningham, 2002:5). Hadisi and Snowball (2020:2), using a United Nations Economic (UNESCO) framework, define the CCI as *"those sectors of organised activity that have as their main objective the production or reproduction, the promotion, distribution or commercialisation of goods, services and activities of content derived from cultural, artistic or heritage origins"*. Therefore, it was easier for such states to develop policies to regulate and fund these industries. On the contrary, some countries still lack policy directives for the CCIs as such issues of regulation and funding become a challenge. Statistics South Africa, an organisation that records labour and economic activities, does not have a single classification of this sector. Therefore, the sector's activities are accounted for under broad sectors such as community, personal, and social services (SACO, 2021). This verifies the lack of a national definition for this

sector and specific sectors that should account for it. However, the Department of Arts, Sports and Culture (DASC) is responsible for the CCI and as argued by van Graan (2008). DASC's definition of this sector is focused on film, music, publishing, and craft, which is relatively narrow.

3.2 Contribution to Socio-Economic Development

Countries like Britain have used the CCI to facilitate urban renewal strategies using applied arts/design (Cunningham, 2002). To this end, UNESCO (2021) termed cities that include creative and cultural activities (the CCIs) as creative cities in their socio-economic development efforts. The commercial CCI, be it formal or informal, contributes immensely to countries GDPs and employment. According to UNESCO, this sector contributed 2,4% to Korea's GDP and 8,9% to Vietnam. Moreover, in China, this sector has recorded a 30% growth in employment compared to 2013.

Similarly increased job growths were noted in the United Kingdom (UK), where the sector had 9% growth compared to other sectors. In the United States (US), the CCI generated \$30 million in gross revenues. These are some examples of how the CCI contributes to countries' economies. In South Africa, Hadisi and Snowball (2017) estimated that in 2015 the cultural and creative industries employed roughly 6.72% of the country's labour force, while Statistics South Africa (StatsSA) (RSA, 2014/5) had reported a labour absorption by the CCI at 2.83% in 2014. A recent report by StatsSA (RSA, 2021) shows that the sector increased 170 000 in employment for 2020's quarters 3 and 4 amid the Covid-19 related challenges. SACO (2021) reports that the CCI has been one of the sectors that consistently grew between 2016 and 2018, with a steady 2.4% rate. Hadisi and Snowball (2017) further highlight that the CCI (including the informal ones) accounts for 1.16 million jobs in the country. The sector is reported to have an employment multiplier of 4.9, which means that for every R1 m invested in the industry, approximately five new jobs are created (SACO, 2021). This multiplier follows Agriculture and Community, Social and Personal Services sectors compared to the 2015 TIPS Estimation of Employment Multipliers (SACO, 2021). The economic impact of the CCI indicates the sector's contribution to the socio-economic development of South Africa by affording various communities to secure livelihoods. This further

illustrates the potential of the sector if supported and well-governed. However, South African CCIs are more project-based, making them vulnerable during the pandemic (Snowball, 2020).

3.3 Challenges of the CCI

The CCI in Africa lacks a proper classification where there is no definite sector where they are premised without being paired with other sectors. The challenge with such bundling is that when policies are formulated, they will focus more on the dominant sector than those merged with. According to Brookes et al. (2020), this sector is only gaining recognition in recent years, and the policy environment has not focused on it widely. This sector is not well structured in some countries. For example, Brookes et al. (2020) argue that activities related to this sector are only recorded in countries such as Cape Verde, Ethiopia, Kenya, Nigeria, and South Africa.

For South Africa, the sector is not demarcated like in the UK and Europe (Cunningham, 2002). Data for CCI is extracted through the broad category of community, social and personal services (see Table 1) where the public sector activities belong. However, public administrative services have policies that regulate them. Such cannot be used for services in the creative and cultural sector like news agencies. This sector's lack of independence and tailored regulations opens opportunities for sorts of challenges, including poor governance.

3.4 Global Context of Covid-19's Impacts on Creative Industries

Covid-19 impacted the CCIs in its entire value chain from creation, production, distribution, and access (UNESCO, 2021). Countries like the USA, France and Columbia are regarded as leaders of CCIs in their respective continents in relation to promoting and

Table 1: Community, Social and Personal Services Sector

Division	Major Group	Title of Category
		MAJOR DIVISION 9: COMMUNITY, SOCIAL AND PERSONAL SERVICES
91		Public administration and defence activities
	911	Central government activities
	912	Regional services council activities
	913	Local authority activities
92		Education
	920	Educational services
93		Health and social work
	931	Human health activities
	932	Veterinary activities
	933	Social work activities
94		Other community, social and personal service activities
	940	Sewage and refuse disposal, sanitation and similar activities
95		Activities of membership organisations n.e.c
	951	Activities of business, employers' and professional organisations
	952	Activities of trade unions
	959	Activities of other membership organisations
96		Recreational, cultural and sporting activities
	961	Motion picture, radio, television and other entertainment activities
	962	News agency activities
	963	Library, archives, museums and other cultural activities
	964	Sporting and other recreational activities
99	990	Other service activities

Source: RSA (2021)

investing in CCIs (Runde et al., 2020). These three countries were equally affected by the effects of the Covid-19 pandemic, such as the shutdown of 90% of museums in the USA, for example, with 16% at risk of closing permanently; moreover, reducing recreation and cultural spending, thus reducing revenues in the sector and increased unemployment, particularly for those working informally. Entrepreneurs who participate in the sector using household incomes were severely impacted (Runde et al., 2020). In the UK, over 19 000 musicians lost their jobs overnight when their gigs were cancelled (Trustee's Report, 2020). According to the Trustee's Report (2020), the total cost of supporting these musicians was about \$1,2 mil between 2019 and 2020.

Governments responded differently towards the economic crisis caused by Covid-19 on the CCIs. The magnitude of their responses depended on their perspective of the importance of the CC economy to their country. This argument can be supported by comparing France and the USA recovery response to CCIs. France invested 2 billion euros in creative industries that would be used to protect workers through the extension of unemployment benefits, the compensation fund for cancelled series and shoots and a solidarity fund for the self-employed and micro-businesses (Runde et al., 2020). The USA invested US\$75 million in relief funding to assist cultural establishments such as museums and other at risk, humanities positions, and projects in the sector, not necessarily the people or entrepreneurs in the industry (Runde et al., 2020). The authors argue that the little investment by the USA towards CCIs compared to France is because, in the USA, CCIs are seen as recreational, therefore, regarded as a luxury. Thus, a paradigm shift on the importance of CCIs to the overall economy is needed in the USA.

Creative Industries, particularly those in performing arts and visual are being forced to go digital or die, which has become feasible for many developed countries but challenging in developing countries due to infrastructural and institutional challenges (Hinson, Madichie & Asiedu, 2021). However, digitisation of performing arts in Ghana, for example, has not translated to desired income but as a sustainable measure to keep the people's interest in the consumption of the arts post Covid-19 as it cannot substitute live performances (Hinson et al., 2021). There is a significant under-investment in the CCIs in Africa in general compared to developed countries like France (Gachara, 2020).

UNESCO (2021a) created a platform with records of diverse practices by government, non-governmental organisations, and the private sector towards CCIs in respective countries. The report showed three categories of support directed to the sector accompanied by the nature of support per category in respective countries. Table 2 on the next page shows various strategies at a local scale in South Africa implemented to sustain and promote CCIs. Table 2 illustrates relief strategies employed by South Africa to assist the CCIs during the Covid-19 pandemic.

4. Conceptual Framework

The governance issues in the CCI stem from the challenges of classification of this industry which feeds into a lack of policies to support the sector. In a review of Howkin and Cave, Cunningham (2002) asks whether the broad and narrow definitions in different settings explain the complexities of who should support the CCI. The definitions provided in section 3 shows the extensiveness of the CCI sector. This paper uses the UNESCO conceptual framework for CCIs recovery, development, and growth during and post Covid-19 (UNESCO, 2021a). The framework assumes the possibilities of a sustainable CCI through 3 pillars, namely, direct support for the artist and cultural professionals, support for sectors of the cultural and creative industries, and strengthening the competitiveness of the cultural and creative industries (UNESCO, 2021a). The first pillar is a welfarist approach, and many countries globally have used the various strategies under this pillar as an immediate intervention during Covid-19. The South African government, through its stimulus package directed to the CCIs, was visible in supporting CCIs under the elements of the first pillar, but the traces of the third pillar, which advocates for strengthening the competitiveness of the CCIs, were limited (UNESCO, 2021a). The adopted framework will be used to analyse findings to illustrate how the different pillars have been influenced by governance and highlight areas that need to be strengthened for a sustainable CCI sector in South Africa. This approach is followed as interventions in the second or third pillar are likely to promote sustainability of the CCIs during and post Covid-19 eras. This is evident in developed countries because they have been leading in promoting CCIs by investing in the elements of the third pillar. In contrast, developing countries are poorly represented in their investment in the same (UNESCO, 2021).

Table 2: South Africa Relief Strategies for CCIs in COVID-19 era

Category	Nature of Support	Strategy
Direct support for artists and cultural professionals	Social Benefits	Food Assistance Fund for South African artists
		Artist Relief Grants in South Africa
	Commissioning and Purchase of works	South Africa's National Arts Council calling for digital art projects
		Hear My Voice poetry relief fund
	Compensation of loss of income	3rd phase of the Covid-19 Relief Fund
	Fundraising to provide assistance	Hear My Voice poetry relief fund
		Food Assistance Fund for South African artists
Artist Relief Grants in South Africa		
Psychosocial support	SILAPHA Wellness Intervention program	
Support for sectors of the cultural and creative industries	Compensation of business interruption losses	Relief fund for South African artists, athletes, and technical personnel
	Stimulating demand	South Africa's National Arts Council calling for digital art projects
Strengthening the competitiveness of the cultural and creative industries	Adapting business models	South Africa's virtual National Arts Festival
		Relief fund for South African artists, athletes, and technical personnel

Source: Authors' compilation from UNESCO database

Table 3: Conceptual Framework Pillars and Their Elements

Direct support for artists and cultural professionals	Support for sectors of the cultural and creative industries	Strengthening the competitiveness of the cultural and creative industries
Social Benefits	Compensation of business interruption losses	Long term investments
Commissioning and Purchase of works	Relief from taxes and social charges	Promoting national content
Compensation of loss of income	Temporary relief from obligations	Insurance coverage and risk mitigation
Skills development	Stimulating demand	Participatory need assessment and feasibility study
Fundraising to provide assistance	Accelerated payment of aid and subsidies	Tax incentive for foreign investment
Psychosocial support	Preferential loans	Adapting business models
	Strengthen infrastructure and facilities	

Source: Authors' compilation from UNESCO database

Table 3 above shows the conceptual framework pillars and their elements.

5. Results and Discussions

Findings of this study suggest that the plight of the entertainment industry and its performers because of Covid-19 was to a certain extent exacerbated by

issues related to governance leading to challenges that failed to sustain and likely to hinder the recovery of the CCIs in general post-Covid-19 (Conradie, 2021). This section will discuss the results focusing on themes that emanated from the findings, namely, business inactivity and closures, governance, financial support, understanding CCIs, mental health and digitisation.

5.1 Business Inactivity and Closures

The findings confirm that the Covid-19 pandemic deeply affected the CCI sector, whereby several businesses closed, and others had limited activities (Conradie, 2021). For instance, the following sentiments were shared from the primary studies who were interviewed in Conradie's film:

"I used to have about 12 shows per month, and I have been doing this for ten years" – Musician

"We used to travel a lot including internationally... we could not do much due to lockdowns" – Music Disc Jockey (DJ)

"Clients started postponing events, then finally cancelled. Overnight we lost countless amounts of jobs and millions of rands" – Sound and lighting company owner.

With limited and no business, people's livelihoods were affected. This affected the CCIs and the supporting industries like transportation, catering services, and real estate. As such, entrepreneurs in the CCIs blamed the government for their loss of business activities. In an interview recorded on the state of the arts in South Africa, one musician commented the following:

"It wasn't Covid, it was your government" – musician.

The above sentiment is based on the government not communicating clearly how it would support the industry. Additionally, the hard lockdowns were viewed as a cause of their business disruptions (Conradie, 2021). Lockdown conditions immediately halted projects and programme deliveries in the creative industries (Ka Ncube, 2020), thereby affecting businesses. For example, the creative Academy Youth Development programme designed in 2018 to improve youth access to community, networks, infrastructure, and business ecosystems was forced to close (Ka Ncube, 2020).

Business closures affect the income streams in the sector. The loss of income brings with it additional personal losses. The results further indicated that entrepreneurs lost properties such as cars, houses, gear, or performance equipment (Conradie, 2021). The loss of income further limits the artists' purchasing power, thereby creating more burdens for the country's economy.

5.2 Governance

Poor governance in the CCIs resulted from the government lacking a framework for supporting this sector (Burnett, 2021; van Dyk, 2021). Such limitations led to misappropriation of funds of the PESP, misappropriation of the law, corruption, and transparency.

5.2.1 Misappropriation of Funds

It was revealed that some of the Covid-19 relief funds were not allocated to the deserving groups. The governance of the PESP was clouded with several issues from the CCIs. It is said that the PESP was associated with payment delays that led to artist protests and court cases (Mafolo, 2021). The NAC was accused of not paying beneficiaries enough funds for budgeted projects from the stimulus fund. They prioritised expanding the coverage of PESP to as many beneficiaries as possible. Thus, the NEC jeopardised meaningful support to projects and programmes that could significantly transform the sector (Mafolo, 2021). Related issues were on funds used to pay for irrelevant activities. Van Dyk (2021) reported that over half of the government relief fund had been used for consultancy and other fruitless expenditure by the NAC without meaningful use to support programmes in the sector that can sustain and transform the industry in the Covid-19 era. Similarly, Non-payment and overdue payments by NAC were reported for the entrepreneurs qualifying for a Presidential Employment Stimulus Package (PESP) granted in October 2020 in the arts and culture industry (van Dyk, 2021). In efforts to counter such illicit acts, Kubeka (2021) assert that audit reports and print media indicated an intention by the government to recoup the stimulus fund awarded to undeserving CCI beneficiaries.

5.2.2 Misappropriation of Law

The findings revealed misappropriation of funds and the law by the NAC. In some instances, the Black Economic Empowerment (BEE) law was used for eligibility to benefit from the stimulus, yet the funds were derived from the Disaster Management Act (White, 2021). Policies such as BEE were used to exclude other racial groups from benefiting from the disaster fund. However, such acts were challenged in the court of law.

5.2.3 Corruption and Transparency

Council members of the National Arts Council (NAC) were supposed to be solemnly responsible for the

oversight of the stimulus, but they illegally became adjudicators of the funding and thus paid for playing that role (Kubeka, 2021). There were other reports that approximately 12 per cent of the 300 million stimulus package was allocated in one-year (Persens, 2021), yet Mafolo (2021) reports on limited funds from the PESP to pay artists. Also, most artists claimed they did not receive any funds since the allocation of the sector's stimulus (Persens, 2021).

In addition to corruption, the provisioning of relief funds was not conducted transparently (Persens, 2021). The self-appointment of NAC in the awarding of funds reflects a corrupt conduct supporting literature findings on the rampant corruption in the public sector (Ntoyanto-Tyatyantsi & Ceki, 2019; Rispel, de Jager & Fonn, 2016; Maseko, 2020).

5.3 Financial Support

The findings reveal that relief funds are essential for the recovery of entrepreneurial businesses in the creative sector (Mail & Guardian, 2020, 2021). However, concerns emanating from this sector, especially during the Covid-19 era, are related to the funding of the CCI projects. Although the PESP allocated relief funds for this sector, maladministration of these funds meant that not everyone could be assisted financially (Rispel, de Jager & Fonn, 2016). The PESP is also designed for formalised artists, which means those in the informal sector could not get financial assistance at all. However, only a portion of the 300 mil PESP was paid to entrepreneurs (van Dyk, 2021). This is different in other countries, as noted in the literature, where artists were compensated for not working during the pandemic (Runde et al., 2020; UNESCO, 2021).

5.4 Understanding CCIs

Artists accused the government of being impractical and misunderstanding the industry by giving funds without addressing institutional policies. The funding instruments are not talking to participants in the sector. According to Modise (2020), eligibility of relief funds should not be based on the age criterion as this creates exclusions. Additionally, increasing the stimulus from R300 million to R600 million was suggested as the budget sufficient for the sector (Modise, 2020).

In South Africa during the Covid-19 era, informal CCIs were often directed to formalised institutions

when applying for the stimulus fund (Mafolo, 2021). These informal CCIs do not have the required documents and are thereby excluded from such benefits (Mafolo, 2021). The lack of understanding of the CCIs that leaves the artist contemplating changing career based on the various challenges alluded to shows the lack of meaningful consideration of the sector by the government. One artist interviewed by Conradie (2021) said the following:

"I asked myself if I had chosen the right industry for a career. There was no communication from international and local authorities... It is stressful as you now have to depend on others. My family are helping with paying for the house. I had to sell my car and some gear." DJ/Booking agent

Misunderstanding of the industry is experienced in South Africa as a developing country and in America, where the industry is viewed as a luxury. In that regard, there is a lack of funding in the industry in America, and during Covid-19, only 75 million was invested towards CCIs whilst France invested 2 billion Euros (Runde et al., 2020). Thus, there is significant under-investment in the CCI sector globally (Gachara, 2020). There is a need for government officials to have a practical understanding of the industry for any intervention to be meaningful and sustainable (Mail & Guardian, 2020, 2021).

European countries use evidence-based, data-driven decision-making frameworks to inform the structure and location of relief in the creative industry ecosystems (KaNcube, 2020). This approach drives policy makers away from politics to impact, respond, and recover CCIs. Therefore, the argument is to lean towards research data to bring sustainable recovery. The OECD countries have revitalised their creative industries through relief funding to assist budget shortfalls at museums, art galleries, theatres, and cultural spaces (KaNcube, 2020).

5.5 Mental Health

The findings revealed that increased stress related to business closures, business inactivity and uncertainties on when artists can resume work led to depression for some (Conradie, 2021). The impact of the pandemic on mental health further reflects how this sector suffered due to Covid-19 (UNESCO, 2021). UNESCO (2021a) reported on the SILAPHA Wellness Intervention program in South Africa designed to support affected artists psychosocially.

5.6 Digitisation

For some artists, remaining in business means looking for other opportunities of reaching audiences. As noted by Hinson et al. (2021), the digital platform is an option but is loaded with other challenges, especially for developing countries. For example, the findings reveal that expensive internet data in SA hurdles CCIs consumption for digitised programmes or activities (van Dyk, 2021). While developed countries, particularly in OECD, have managed to harness the architecture of digitisation as a post-Covid-19 creative industry revival trajectory, its application to the South African context is heavily subdued with structural challenges such as network connectivity, affordability of internet and smart devices, and load shedding (Burnett, 2021; van Dyk, 2021).

In juxtaposing the UNESCO framework with the South African experience, it shows that South Africa is outstanding in social welfare provisions but fall short in supporting sectors of CCIs and strengthening the competitiveness of the CCIs (see Table 2). Therefore, this calls for a collaborative effort from diverse stakeholders to invest and focus efforts in supporting and strengthening the sector's competitiveness. Under the pandemic era, concessions need to be made to help some artists secure livelihoods to support the CCI sector. Modise (2020) proposes promoting local content in any broadcasting platform in the country to at least 70%.

6. Conclusion and Recommendations

The impact of Covid-19 on CCIs in South Africa has been underestimated. Unless there are clear intentions and investments to understand the CCIs in South Africa, poor governance and sustainability will remain a sector challenge, and its transformative potential will be lost. There is a need to harness the growth potential of the CCIs as experienced by the first world countries and protect its value chain systems.

Therefore, it is recommended that policies that tackle issues faced by the CCI be developed in South Africa. Models or frameworks suitable to the developing country contexts should be used in conjunction with policies to ensure that the CCI is appropriately supported so that the sector can be sustainable to create more entrepreneurial opportunities. In cognisance of the limitations linked to systematic literature studies, there is a need for studies that

will develop relevant models/frameworks for the CCI and nationwide studies that should delve deeper into the extent of the impacts of Covid19 in this sector.

References

- Arndt, C., Davies, R., Gabriel, S., Harris, L., Makrelov, K., Modise, B., Robinson, S., Simbanegavi, W., van Seventer, D. & Anderson, L. 2020. Impact of Covid-19 on the South African economy: An initial analysis. SA-TIED Working Paper, 111.
- Brookes, M., Moyo, P., Tapscott, C. & Shelver, A. 2020. The Creative Economy in Africa and the Diaspora. *African Review of Economics and Finance*, 12(2):1-16. ISSN 2042-1478.
- Burnett, C. 2021. DUT webinar tackles opportunities and challenges in the creative industries during Covid-19. DUT News, 7 January. Available at: <https://www.dut.ac.za/>. Accessed 6 September 2021.
- Cunningham, S. 2002. From cultural to creative industries: Theory, industry and policy implications. *Media International Australia*, 102(1):54-65.
- Flew, T. 2011. *The creative industries: Culture and policy*. Sage.
- Gachara, G. 2020. 'Policy makers must Nurture Africa's creative economy', *Africa Business*. 20 November. Available at: <https://african.business/>. Accessed 29 August 2021.
- Hadisi, S. & Snowball, J. 2017. Employment in the cultural and creative industries in South Africa. *African Review of Economics and Finance*, 12(2):84-109. ISSN 2042-1478.
- Hinson, R.E., Madichies, N.O. & Asiedu, B.B. 2021. The impact of Covid-19 on Creative Industries in Ghana. The Centre for Strategic and Defence Studies, Africa (CSDS Africa).
- Hruby, A. & Annan, R. 2020. CORONAVIRUS: Now is the time to invest in Africa's creative industries. *The Africa Report*, 25 June 2020. Available at: <https://www.theafricareport.com/31417/coronavirus-now-is-the-time-to-invest-in-africas-creative-industries/>. Accessed 6 September 2021.
- Joffe, A. 2021. Covid-19 and the African cultural economy: An opportunity to reimagine and reinvigorate? *Cultural Trends*, 30(1). Arts and culture in the viral emergency.
- Lhermitte, M. 2021. Rebuilding Europe: The cultural and creative economy before and after the Covid-19 crisis. EY Consulting. Available at: <https://www.rebuilding-europe.eu/>. Accessed 5 September 2021.
- Munzhedzi, P.H. 2021. Analysing the application of governance principles in the management of Covid-19 in South Africa: Lessons for the future. *Africa's Public Service Delivery and Performance Review*, 9(1):490.
- Nchabeleng, E. 2020. Theatre industry on impact of Covid-19 pandemic on theatre sector. Parliamentary Monitoring Group. NCOP Education and Technology, Sports Arts and Culture.
- Ntoyanto-Tyatyantsi, N. & Ceki, B. 2020. Entrapreneurship practices in local government to improve service delivery. International Conference on Public Administration and

- Development Alternative (IPADA). The 5th Annual International Conference on Public Administration and Development Alternatives 07-09 October 2020, Virtual Conference.
- Rispel, L.C., De Jager, P. & Fonn, S. 2016. Exploring corruption in the South African health sector. *Health Policy and Planning*, 31(2):239-249.
- RSA. 1996. White Paper on Arts and Culture. Department of Arts and Culture (DAC), South Africa. Available at: <https://www.dac.gov.za/content/white-paper-arts-culture-and-heritage-0>. Accessed 16 September 2021.
- RSA. 2021. Major divisions and major groups. Statistics South Africa. Available at: https://www.statssa.gov.za/additional_services/sic/mdvdmvg9.htm. Accessed 16 September 2021.
- Runde, D.F., Seminario, M.R. & Thompson, M. 2020. Rebuilding a more resilient cultural and creative economy after Covid-19. Centre for Strategic and International Studies. Available at: <https://www.csis.org/analysis/rebuilding-more-resilient-cultural-and-creative-economy-after-Covid-19>. Accessed 7 September 2021.
- Smith, M., Hosking, J., Woodward, A., Witten, K., MacMillan, A., Field, A., Baas, P. & Mackie, H. 2017. Systematic literature review of built environment effects on physical activity and active transport – an update and new findings on health equity, *International Journal of Behavioral Nutrition and Physical Activity*, 14(1):1-27.
- Snowball, J. 2020. Cape Town's creative firms are business innovators – but they're vulnerable. *The Conversation*, 19 May 2020. Available at: <https://theconversation.com/>. Accessed 2 September 2021.
- Thomé, A.M.T., Scavarda, L.F. & Scavarda, A.J. 2016. Conducting systematic literature review in operations management, *Production Planning and Control*, 27(5):408-420.
- Trustees' Report. 2020. Annual report and financial statements: Help musicians. Available at: https://www.helpmusicians.org.uk/assets/publications/files/hmuk_2018_annual_report.pdf. Accessed August 2021.
- UNESCO & The World Bank. 2021. Cities, culture, creativity: Leveraging culture and creativity for sustainable urban development and inclusive growth. Available at: <https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/urbandevelopment/publication/cities-culture-creativity>. Accessed September 2021.
- UNESCO. 2009. Framework for Cultural Statistics. United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural (UNESCO). Available at: <http://www.uis.unesco.org/culture/Pages/framework-cultural-statistics.aspx>. Accessed 16 September 2021.
- van Graan, M. 2021. Cultural Industries, Arts, Culture and Creative Arts First Paper: Towards an understanding of the current nature and scope of the Creative Industries in the Western Cape. Available at: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/other/2005/11/final_first_paper_cultural_industries_printing.pdf. Accessed 7 September 2021.
- Yeboah-Assiamah, E., Asamoah, K., Buabeng, T., Bawole, J.N. & Otchere-Ankrah, B. 2018. Corruption in Public Administration: Stabbing the African State in the Back. *Global Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance*, Springer, New Delhi.